

Peter Abelard
Historia Calamitatum
edited for classroom use by William Turpin

This version of Abelard's famous account of his own life makes no claims to scholarly merit, and is intended simply to make Abelard's Latin accessible to students. Words are glossed in the footnotes when they seem likely to be unfamiliar to intermediate students, or when medieval spellings may make them difficult for those more at home in classical Latin.

When a word is glossed without further comment it should be a good Classical Latin word; in practice this means I have found it in the *Oxford Latin Dictionary*, which excludes most authors after about the year 200 CE. If a word is designated as Late Latin (LL), it means I have found it in Lewis and Short's *Latin Dictionary*, which covers Christian Latin authors of the 3rd and 4th centuries. If a word is designated as Medieval (ML), it usually means I have found it in Niermeyer's dictionary of Medieval Latin.

The Latin text below is essentially that of Andrée, itself based on that of Monfrin. I have sometimes altered the punctuation, usually adding more commas to help readers understand Abelard's syntax. The main chapter numbers are those of Andrée, though I have broken up longer paragraphs and added additional numbers for convenience in teaching. For each paragraph I have added the page and line numbers of Monfrin's edition.

Note to students of Classical Latin

For students trained in Classical Latin medieval Latin spelling can at first be a challenge. Some spellings seem awkward but cause little difficulty (*nichil* for *nihil*, *dampnatio* for *damnatio*, *ortulus* for *hortulus*, *habundantia* for *abundantia*, *ociosus* for *otiosus*). The blending of *oe* and *ae* into *e* takes some getting used to: *equitas* for *aequitas*, *ille* for *illae*, and (above all) *cepit* for *coepit*.

I have tried to help students in two ways. I gloss words with difficult medieval spellings by giving the Classical Latin form in the footnotes. And I give additional help in the longer notes, e.g. by adding the missing Classical vowels in parentheses.

The *Historia Calamitatum*, a very very short introduction.

The *Historia Calamitatum* takes the form of letter to an unnamed friend (apparently *not* Heloise), written around 1132 or 1133 CE, when Abelard was about 54. His "calamities" include not only the dramatic conclusion to his marriage to Heloise, but also his condemnation for heresy and the attempts on his life by his own monks. In theory the letter was supposed to console Abelard's friend by demonstrating that Abelard's disasters had been worse. In practice we end up with a tendentious autobiography. It is up to the reader to decide whether the Abelard in these pages is a sympathetic character or not. Fun fact: his name was "almost certainly pentasyllabic" (A-ba-el-ard-us)¹

A good introduction to the *HC* can be found in Andrée's edition; see also Winthrop Wetherbee, "Literary Works," *The Cambridge Companion to Abelard*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2004. 45–64. A good short account of Abelard's life is in the first chapter of John Marenbon, *The Philosophy of Peter Abelard*. Cambridge, 1997, and idem "Life, Milieu, and Intellectual Contexts." *The Cambridge Companion to Abelard*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2004. 13–44.

¹Marenbon 1997, 7n4.

Abbreviations

Andrée	Andrée, Alexander, ed. <i>Peter Abelard: Historia Calamitatum / Consolation to a Friend</i> . Toronto: Centre for Medieval Studies, 2015.
Clanchy	M. T. Clanchy, <i>Abelard: A Medieval Life</i> . Oxford, 1997.
CL	Classical Latin (in practice this means “included in the OLD”)
Levitan	Levitan, William, trans. <i>Abelard and Heloise: The Letters and Other Writings</i> . Indianapolis, 2007.
Luscombe and Radice	Luscombe, D., ed., B. Radice, trans. <i>The Letter Collection of Peter Abelard and Heloise</i> . Oxford Medieval Texts. Oxford, 2013.
LL	Late Latin (in practice this means “included in LS”)
LS	Lewis, Charleton T. and Charles Short. <i>A New Latin Dictionary</i> . New York and Oxford: Harper and the Clarendon Press, 1891. (available online).
ML	Medieval Latin (in practice this usually means included in Niermeyer)
Marenbon	Marenbon, John. <i>The Philosophy of Peter Abelard</i> . Cambridge, 1997.
Monfrin	Monfrin, J., ed. <i>Abélard, Historia Calamitatum: Texte Critique avec une Introduction</i> . Paris, 1962.
Muckle	Muckle, J. T. <i>The Story of Abelard's Adversities: A Translation with Notes of the Historia Calamitatum</i> . Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1954.
Niermeyer	Niermeyer, J. F. <i>Mediae Latinitatis Lexicon Minus</i> . Leiden. (available online)
OLD	Glare, P. G. W., ed. <i>Oxford Latin Dictionary</i> . Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982.

Abaelardi ad amicum suum consolatoria.

1. (63.1) Sepe¹ humanos affectus² aut provocant aut mittigant amplius exempla quam verba. Vnde, post nonnullam sermonis ad presentem habiti consolationem, de ipsis calamitatum mearum experimentis³ consolatoriam ad absentem scribere decrevi, ut, in comparatione mearum, tuas aut nullas aut modicas temptationes⁴ recognoscas, et tolerabilius feras.

sermonis ad presentem habiti = *sermonis habiti ad (te) praesentem*. The recipient of the *Historia calamitatum* is unknown, and “may not have been a real person” (Clanchy 16).

in comparatione mearum = *in comparatione mearum temptationum*.

c. AD 1079

De loco nativitatis eius.

2.1 (63.8) Ego igitur—oppido quodam oriundus,⁵ quod in ingressu minoris Britannie constructum, ab urbe Namnetica versus orientem octo (credo) miliaris⁶ remotum, proprio vocabulo Palatium appellatur—sicut natura terre mee vel generis animo levis,⁷ ita et ingenio extiti,⁸ et ad litteratoriam⁹ disciplinam facilis. Patrem autem habebam litteris aliquantulum¹⁰ imbutum, antequam militari cingulo insigniretur.¹¹ Vnde postmodum tanto litteras amore complexus est, ut quoscumque filios haberet, litteris antequam armis instrui diserneret.¹² Sicque profecto¹³ actum est.

in ingressu: “at the entrance” i.e. “on the border” (coming from the south west, e.g. Poitiers.)

minoris Britannie: Brittany (“Britain” was *Britannia Maior*).

quod ... constructum = *quod (oppidum) ... constructum est*.

ab urbe Namnetica: “from the city of Nantes.”

octo ... miliaris: ablative with *remotum*.

proprio vocabulo: almost superfluous, but presumably something like “if you really want to know the name.”

Palatium: the modern village of Le Pallet, about 12 miles SE of Nantes.

sicut ... levis: “just as I was quick (intellectually) due to the nature of my country or the intellect of my race.” Andrée takes this as a single point, that the Bretons had an aptitude for learning. Muckle and Levitan take *genus* as “family,” leading in to what Abelard then says about his father.

ad litteratoriam disciplinam facilis: “This looks at first sight like an example of his conceit, but he is probably referring to the sixth sense which was needed for reconstituting texts. His ‘genius’ gave him the facility to turn letters back into voices.” (Clanchy 63).

Patrem ... habebam: He was a member of the minor nobility, named Berengar. Abelard’s mother was named Lucia.

antequam militari cingulo insigniretur: i.e. “before he became a knight.” The *cingulum militare* was a symbol of knighthood.

quoscumque filios haberet: three brothers (and as sister) are known.

¹ *saepe*: “often.”

² *affectus, ūs, m.*: “emotion.”

³ *experimentum, ī, n.*: “experience” (OLD 2).

⁴ *temptatiō, ōnis, m.*: here “attack” (OLD 2); “trial” (Levitan).

⁵ *oriundus, a, um*: “originating from” (OLD 2).

⁶ *mīliarium, (i)l, n.* here “mile” (OLD 1c).

⁷ *levis, leve*: “light”; “frivolous.”

⁸ *ex(s)itō, ex(s)itāre, ex(s)itiī*: here “stand out”; often in Abelard “exist” (in a given condition, OLD 4).

⁹ *litteratōrius, a, um*: “literary” (LL).

¹⁰ *aliquantulum*: “to a small extent, a fair amount.”

¹¹ *insigniō, insignire, insignivī or insigniī, insignium*: “mark with a means of identity” (OLD 1).

¹² *dispōnō, dispōnere, dispōuī, dispoitum*: “arrange, ordain” (OLD 6).

¹³ *profecō*: “undoubtedly, without question”

2.2 (63.18) Me itaque, primogenitum¹ suum, quanto cariores habebat, tanto diligentius erudiri curavit. Ego vero,² quanto amplius et facilius in studio litterarum profeci,³ tanto ardentius eis inhesi,⁴ et in tanto earum amore illectus sum⁵ ut, militaris glorie pompam⁶ cum hereditate et prerogativa primogenitorum⁷ meorum fratribus derelinquens,⁸ Martis curie⁹ penitus¹⁰ abdicarem,¹¹ ut Minerve gremio¹² educarer. Et quoniam dialecticarum rationum armaturam¹³ omnibus philosophie documentis pretuli, his armis alia commutavi, et tropheis bellorum conflictus¹⁴ pretuli disputationum. Proinde¹⁵ diversas disputando perambulans provincias, ubicunque¹⁶ huius artis vigere¹⁷ studium audieram, peripateticorum emulator¹⁸ factus sum.

Martis curie: “the court of Mars”; *curie* = (CL) *curiae*, dative (not CL) with *abdicarem*.

Minervae = (CL) *Minervae*.

educarer: Clanchy 48 calls this a pun: “I was educated” and “I was lifted up.”

quoniam ... pretuli: his point seems to be simply that he liked dialectic very much indeed; the fact that he preferred it to philosophy seems less important here.

his armis alia commutavi: “I traded other (weapons) things for these weapons”; i.e. he traded the weapons of war for the weapons of dialectic. **et tropheis ... disputationum** = *et pretuli conflictūs disputationum tropheis bellorum*. He preferred the verbal arguments of dialectic to military victories.

disputando: in CL this would be a gerund in the ablative, “in conducting disputations”; in LL and ML the gerund becomes almost an indeclinable present participle, as in Italian (*stofacendo* means “I am doing it”).

ubicunque ... audieram = *ubicunque audieram studium huius artis vigere*.

peripateticorum emulator: “an imitator of the peripatetics”; “Peripatetic” is a synonym for “Aristotelian” (apparently because Aristotle used to pace in a covered walk while teaching); Andrée notes that Abelard elsewhere equates the Peripatetics with teachers of dialectic. In ML “peripatetic” came to mean simply “wandering,” and that seems to be Abelard’s point here (see Levitan). John of Salisbury called Abelard *peripateticus palatinus*, perhaps because of this passage.

¹ *prīmōgenitus*, a, um: “first-born” (= CL *maior natu*; later classical Latin, in LS not OLD).

² *vērō*: “truly”; but also mildly or strongly adversative “however” (OLD 7).

³ *prōficiō*, *prōficere*, *prōfēci*, *prōfectus*: “make progress, achieve results.”

⁴ *inhaerēō*, *inhaerere*, *inhaesi*, *inhaesum*: “stick to” (+ dative).

⁵ *illiciō*, *illicere*, *illexi*, *illectus*: “entice.”

⁶ *pompā*, ae, f.: here “ostentation, display” (OLD 3).

⁷ *prīmōgenita*, ōrum, n. pl. “the rights of the first-born” (LL).

⁸ *dērelinquō*, *dērelinquere*, *dēreliqui*, *dērelictum*: “abandon, leave behind.”

⁹ *cūria*, ae, f.: “court” (ML).

¹⁰ *penitus*: here “utterly” (OLD 5).

¹¹ *abīcō*, *abdicere*, *abdixi*, *abdictum*: “reject” (CL but rare); here with the dative.

¹² *gremium*, īī, n. “bosom.”

¹³ *armātūra*, ae, f. “armament” (CL, but apparently not used metaphorically).

¹⁴ *conflictus*, ūs, m.: “clash.”

¹⁵ *proinde* (two syllables): here “so, then, accordingly” (OLD 3).

¹⁶ *ubicunque* (*ubicuncuque*): “wherever.”

¹⁷ *vigēō*, *vigēre*, *vigui*: “flourish, thrive.”

¹⁸ *aemulātor*, ōris, m.: “imitator.”

De persecutione magistri sui Guillhelmi in eum.

c. AD 1100

3.1 (64.32) Perveni tandem Parisius,¹ ubi iam maxime disciplina hec florere consueverat, ad Guillhelmum scilicet² Campellensem preceptorem meum in hoc, tunc magisterio re et fama precipuum, cum quo aliquantulum³ moratus, primo ei acceptus,⁴ postmodum gravissimus⁵ extiti,⁶ cum nonnullas scilicet eius sententias⁷ refellere⁸ conarer, et ratiocinari⁹ contra eum sepius¹⁰ aggrederer, et nonnumquam superior in disputando viderer.

Parisius = (CL) *ad Parisias*. “Paris” meant the Île de la Cité, with the Royal Palace and Notre Dame.

hec disciplina = (CL) *haec disciplina*, i.e. dialectic.

ad Guillhelmum ... Campellensem < *Guillhelmus Campellensis*, William of Campeaux (c. 1070-1121). At the time he was archdeacon at Notre Dame and master of the cathedral school.

in hoc: perhaps neuter, = *in hac disciplina*.

re et fama: “in fact and in reputation.”

3.2 (63.38) Quod quidem¹¹ et ipsi, qui inter conscolares¹² nostros precipui habebantur, tanto maiori sustinebant indignatione, quanto posterior habebat etatis¹³ et studii tempore. Hinc calamitatum mearum, que nunc usque perseverant, ceperunt¹⁴ exordia, et quo¹⁵ amplius fama extendebatur nostra, aliena in me succensa est invidia.

nunc usque: down to the time of writing, 1132 or 1133.

quo amplius ... invidia ... succensa est: we might expect *quo ... eo*, i.e. “the more my reputation was growin, *so much the more* was envy kindled. But even in CL the comparative word can be omitted (OLD *quo*² 2b).

¹ *Parisius*: “Paris”; an indeclinable noun (ML).

² *scilicet*: “it is obvious; naturally, of course”; here “a purely epexegetic particle” (OLD 5b), simply introducing William’s surname.

³ *aliquantulum*: “to a small extent, a fair amount.”

⁴ *acceptus, a, um*: “pleasing, esteemed.”

⁵ *gravis, e*: here “obnoxious, troublesome” (OLD 10).

⁶ *ex(s)itō, ex(s)itāre, ex(s)ititī*: here “exist” (in a given condition, OLD 4).

⁷ *sententia, ae, f.*: opinion; in Medieval schools, specifically a pronouncement by the teacher about a passage in the Bible.

⁸ *refellō, refellere, refellī*: “refute, rebut.”

⁹ *ratiōcinor* (1): here “persuade by reasoning” (ML; Niermeyer; CL “calculate”).

¹⁰ *sepius* (ML) = (CL) *saepius*.

¹¹ *quidem*: “in fact” (after a connecting relative, OLD 2b).

¹² *conscolāris* or *conscholāris, is, m.*: “fellow student” (ML).

¹³ *etas* (ML) = (CL) *aetas, aetātis, f.*: “age, time of life.”

¹⁴ *cepi* (ML) = (CL) *coepi*.

¹⁵ *quō*²: “in proportion as”; “to that degree”; in correlative sentences, with comparative).

c. AD 1102-1105

4.1 (64.45) Factum tandem est ut, supra vires etatis de ingenio meo presumens, ad scholarum¹ regimen² adolescentulus³ aspirarem, et locum, in quo id agerem, providerem, insigne videlicet⁴ tunc temporis Meliduni castrum et sedem regiam. Presensit⁵ hoc predictus magister meus, et, quo longius posset scholas nostras a se remove conatus, quibus potuit modis, latenter machinatus est, ut priusquam a suis recederem scholis, nostrarum preparationem scholarum prepediret⁶ et provisum mihi locum auferret. Sed quoniam, de potentibus terre, nonnullos ibidem habebat emulos,⁷ fretus⁸ eorum auxilio voti mei compos extiti, et plurimorum mihi assensum ipsius invidia manifesta conquistavit.⁹

Factum tandem est, etc. The date may have been ca. 1102 (Muckle), so Abelard would have been about 23.

supra vires ... presumens = *presumens de ingenio meo (quod erat) supra vires etatis*. In CL *praesumo* takes an accusative.

Meliduni castrum: i.e. Melun, SE of Paris.

sedem regiam: “royal fief” (Andrée); “residence of the king” (Levitan).

predictus magister meus: i.e. William of Champeaux.

et quo longius ... conatus = *et conatus quo (= ut) posset remove scholas nostras a se*.

nostrarum preparationem scholarum: presumably “the arrangements (I was making) for my students.”

de potentibus terre: i.e. among people who were powerful politically; see Clanchy 70.

voti mei compos extiti: “I was granted my prayer”; *compos voti* is a CL idiom (OLD *compos* 1b).

ipsius invidia manifesta = *suā invidiā manifestā*.

4.2 (64.58) Ab hoc autem scholarum¹⁰ nostrarum tirocinio,¹¹ ita in arte dialetica nomen meum dilatari cepit,¹² ut non solum condiscipulorum meorum, verum etiam ipsius magistri fama, contracta paulatim, extingueretur. Hinc factum est, ut, de me amplius ipse presumens, ad castrum Corbolii, quod Parisiace urbi vicinius est, quamtotius¹³ scholas nostras transferrem, ut inde videlicet¹⁴ crebriores¹⁵ disputationis assultus¹⁶ nostra daret importunitas.¹⁷

ad castrum Corbolii: modern Corbeil, about 17 miles SW of Paris.

quod ... vicinius est < *vīcīnus*, a, um: “neighboring, nearby”; the neuter comparative with *quod* seems to me not CL.

ut inde ... importunitas: i.e. he wanted to be able keep attacking the teachings of William of Champeaux.

¹*schola*, ae, f.: “school”; (ML) “student.”

²*regimen*, inis, n.: “control” (CL); “professorship” (ML).

³*adulescentulus*, a, um: “quite young.”

⁴*videlicet*: “evidently”; (expressing irony or disbelief) “of course, no doubt.”

⁵*praesentiō*, *praesentire*, *praesensī*, *praesensum*: “apprehend beforehand.”

⁶*praepediō*, *praepedire*, *praeped(i)ī*, *praepeditum*: “impede, hinder.”

⁷*aemulus*, ī, m.: “rival, competitor.”

⁸*fretus*, a, um: “relying on, trusting in.”

⁹*conquīrō*, *conquīrere*, *conquīsivī* or *conquīsī*, *conquīsītum*: “search for” (CL); here “acquire” (ML).

¹⁰*schola*, ae, f.: “school”; (ML) “student.”

¹¹*tīronicium*, (i)ī, n. here “apprenticeship” (OLD 2a).

¹²*coepī* (two syllables), *coepisse*, *coeptum*: “begin” (perfect with present meaning).

¹³*quamtotius* or *quamtotius*: “as soon as possible” (ML).

¹⁴*videlicet*: “evidently”; (expressing irony or disbelief) “of course, no doubt.”

¹⁵*crēber*, *crēbra*, *crēbrum*: “copious, abundant” (OLD 3b).

¹⁶*assultus*, ūs, m. “assault” (CL but rare).

¹⁷*importūnitas*, ātis, f. “relentlessness.”

c. AD 1105-1108

5.1 (65.65) Non multo autem interiecto tempore, ex immoderata studii afflictione correptus, infirmitate coactus sum repatriare, et per annos aliquot a Francia remotus, querebar ardentius, ab his quos dialetica sollicitabat¹ doctrina. Elapsis autem paucis annis, cum ex infirmitate iam dudum² convaluissem,³ preceptor meus ille Guillhelmus Parisiacensis archidiaconus, habitu pristino commutato, ad regularium clericorum ordinem se convertit ea (ut referebant⁴) intentione, ut, quo religiosior crederetur, ad maioris prelationis⁵ gradum promoveretur; sicut in proximo contigit, eo Catalaunensi episcopo⁶ facto.

ex immoderata studii afflictione correptus: i.e. he got sick from overwork.

a Francia remotus: "France" was the essentially the Ile-de-France, the area around Paris. Abelard went home to Brittany.

ad regularium clericorum ordinem se convertit: i.e. joined a group of priests living communally under the Augustinian rule. [This seems to be different from becoming an Augustinian monk.]

quo religiosior ... ad maioris: *quō* can introduce a correlative sentence with a comparative: "the more ... he was thought, to the rank of a greater clerical rank ..."

in proximo: "soon afterwards" (I think not a CL idiom, but see OLD *proximus* 6).

Catalaunensi: at Châlons-sur-Marne, recently renamed Châlons en Champagne. It is about 160 km. due east of Paris.

5.2 (65.76) Nec tamen hic sue conversionis habitus⁷ aut ab urbe Parisius aut a consueto philosophie studio eum revocavit, sed in ipso quoque monasterio, ad quod se causa religionis contulerat, statim more solito publicas exercuit scolae.⁸

hic sue conversionis habitus: "this manner of life caused by his conversion" (to monastic practices).

Parisius: indeclinable; here genitive.

causa religionis = religionis causā.

publicas exercuit scolae: i.e. his classes were open to outsiders as well as to students from his religious community.

c. AD 1108

6.1 (66.79) Tum ego ad eum reversus, ut ab ipso rethoricam audirem, inter cetera disputationum nostrarum conamina,⁹ antiquam eius de universalibus sententiam patentissimis argumentorum rationibus ipsum commutare, immo destruere, compuli. Erat autem in ea sententia de communitate universalium, ut eandem essentialiter rem totam simul singulis suis inesse astrueret¹⁰ individuīs, quorum quidem nulla esset in essentia diversitas, sed sola multitudine accidentium varietas. Sic autem istam tunc suam correxit sententiam, ut deinceps rem eandem non essentialiter sed indifferenter diceret.

antiquam eius de universalibus sententiam: William's position was the traditional one, "that, for example, Socrates and Plato are *essentially* the same because *human* is the essence of both." (Levitan)

ipsum ... compuli = compuli ipsum commutare (antiquam eius sententiam), immo destruere. Abelard lays out his attack in his *Logica "Ingredientibus"* (c. 1120).

Erat autem in ea sententia: I take it the subject is William.

de communitate universalibus: "about the commonality of universals"; William's view that two different people share the same universal nature.

ut eandem ... individuīs = ut astrueret eandem rem totam essentialiter inesse singulis suis individuīs. See Marenbon, 113-114.

¹ *sollicitō* (1): "disturb" (CL); "win over" (ML), thus "be of interest to" (+ acc.).

² *iam dudum* or *iamdūdum*: "for a long time" (OLD *dūdum* 2).

³ *convalescō, convalescere, convalui* "recover" (after an illness).

⁴ *referō, referre, rettulī, relātum*: here "report" (see OLD 5a).

⁵ *prelātus* or *praelātus*, *ī, m.* "bishop; cleric subordinate to a bishop" (ML).

⁶ *epīscopus*, *ī, m.*: "bishop" (LL).

⁷ *habitus, ūs, m.* "condition."

⁸ *schola, ae, f.*: "school"; (ML) "student."

⁹ *cōnāmen, inis, n.* "effort."

¹⁰ *astruō, astruere, astruxī, astructum*: "build on, add" (CL); here "argue, demonstrate" (ML).

6.2 (65.91) Et quoniam, de universalibus, in hoc ipso precipua semper est apud dialecticos questio, ac tanta, ut eam Porphyrius quoque in Ysogogis suis, cum de universalibus scriberet, definire non presumeret dicens “Altissimum enim est huiusmodi negotium,” cum hanc ille correxerit—immo coactus dimiserit—sententiam, in tantam lectio¹ eius devoluta est negligentiam, ut iam ad cetera dialectice vix admitteretur, quasi in hac scilicet de universalibus sententia, tota huius artis consisteret summa.

ac tanta ut = ac (questio) tanta (erat) ut.

Porphyrius quoque in Ysogogis suis: Porphyry of Tyre (234-305), the Neoplatonic philosopher; his *Isagōgē* (“Introduction”), in Boethius’ translation from the Greek, was the standard introduction to Aristotelian logic.

ut iam ad cetera dialectice vix admitteretur = ut iam (Guiglielmus) vix admitteretur ad cetera dialecticae.

7.1 (66.101) Hinc tantum roboris et auctoritatis nostra suscepit disciplina, ut hii qui, antea vehementius magistro illi nostro adherebant et maxime nostram infestabant doctrinam, ad nostras convolarent scholas,² et ipse, qui in scholis Parisiace³ sedis magistro successerat nostro, locum mihi suum offerret, ut ibidem, cum ceteris, nostro se traderet magisterio, ubi antea suus ille et noster magister floruerat. Paucis itaque diebus, ibi me dialectice studium regente, quanta invidia tabescere,⁴ quanto dolore estuare ceperit magister noster, non est facile exprimere. Nec concepte miserie estum⁵ diu sustinens, callide aggressus est me tunc etiam remove.

qui in scholis ... successerat nostro: his identity is unknown, though Robert of Melun has been suggested.

quanta invidia ... exprimere = non est facile exprimere quantā invidiā magister noster (c(o)epit) tabescere, quantō dolore c(o)epit (a)estuare. nec concepte ... diu sustinens = nec diu sustinens (a)estum concept(a)e miserie(a)e.

7.2 (66.112) Et quia in me quid aperte ageret non habebat, ei scholas auferre molitus est,⁶ pessimis obiectis criminibus,⁷ qui mihi suum concesserat magisterium, alio quodam emulo⁸ meo ad officium eius substituto. Tunc ego, Melidunum reversus, scholas ibi nostras sicut antea constitui; et quanto manifestius eius me persequabatur invidia, tanto mihi auctoritatis amplius conferebat, iuxta⁹ illud poeticum, “Summa petit livor,¹⁰ perflant altissima venti.”

ei scholas auferre ... magisterium = molitus est auferre scholas ei, qui concesserat mihi suum magisterium suum, pessimis criminibus obiectis.

[I don’t understand the plot. The person who stood aside, so that Abelard could take his place as a teacher, must still have had the power of appointment. Thus when William got rid of him with his false charges, he (William) could (apparently) replace Abelard.

“Summa petit livor, perflant altissima venti.” Ovid, *Remedia Amoris* 1.369.

¹ *lectiō, ōnis*, f. “reading” (CL); here either “interpretation” (Niermeyer 2) or “teaching” (Niermeyer 13).

² *schola, ae*, f.: “school”; (ML) “student.”

³ *Parisiacus, a, um*: “of the Parisii” (CL); of Paris (ML).

⁴ *tābesco, tābescere, tabui* “waste away” (mentally).

⁵ *aestus, ūs*, m.: “heat.”

⁶ *mōlior, mōliri, molitus*: “labor to bring about; strive.”

⁷ *crīmen, inis*, n.: “charge.”

⁸ *aemulus, ī*, m.: “rival.”

⁹ *iuxtā*: here prep. + acc. “in accordance with” (OLD 7).

¹⁰ *ītuor, ōris*, m. “envy, spite, malice.”

8.1 (66.122) Non multo autem post, cum ille intelligeret omnes fere¹ discretos² de religione eius plurimum hesitare, et de conversione ipsius vehementer susurrare,³ quod videlicet⁴ minime a civitate recessisset, transtulit se et conventiculum⁵ fratrum, cum scholis suis,⁶ ad villam quandam ab urbe remotam. Statimque ego Meliduno Parisius redii, pacem ab illo ulterius⁷ sperans. Sed quia, ut diximus, locum nostrum ab emulo⁸ nostro fecerat occupari, extra civitatem in monte Sancte Genovefe scholarum nostrarum castra posui, quasi eum obsessurus, qui locum occupaverat nostrum. Quo audito, magister noster, statim ad urbem impudenter rediens, scholas, quas tunc habere poterat, et conventiculum fratrum ad pristinum reduxit monasterium, quasi militem suum, quem dimiserat, ab obsidione⁹ nostra liberaturus.

de religione eius plurimum hesitare: i.e. they weren't convinced about William's piety.

quod ... recessisset: a causal clause; the subjunctive shows that explanation is that of those "whispering," not Abelard himself.

et conventiculum fratrum: i.e. "along with a small community of fellow priests."

in monte Sancte Genovefe: Montagne Sainte-Geneviève, a hill overlooking the Left Bank, now in the 5th arrondissement, but not part of Paris until 1209.

castra posui ... obsessurus: note the military imagery, which will continue.

ad pristinum ... monasterium: i.e. Saint Victor.

quasi militem ... liberatus = quasi liberatus obsidione nostra militem quem dimiserat. William is imagined as having left behind some students (the "soldier"), whom he now rejoins to protect from the Abelard's competing school (the "seige").

8.2 (67.136) Verum,¹⁰ cum illi prodesse¹¹ intenderet, maxime nocuit. Ille quippe antea aliquos discipulos habebat qualescumque maxime propter lectionem Prisciani, in qua plurimum valere credebatur. Postquam autem magister advenit, omnes penitus¹² amisit; et sic a regimine scholarum cessare compulsus est. Nec post multum tempus, quasi iam ulterius de mundana desperans gloria, ipse quoque ad monasticam¹³ conversus est vitam.

cum illi prodesse intenderet: *illi = sibi*.

propter lectionem Prisciani: the *Institutiones Grammaticae* of Priscian (5th to 6th cent.) was standard textbook of Latin grammar in the Middle Ages.

Postquam ... magister advenit: i.e. after William returned to St. Victor.

¹*ferē*: "approximately; almost, nearly."

²*discrētus, a, um*: "separate" (CL); "wise, prudent" (ML).

³*susurrō, susurrāre*: "whisper."

⁴*videlicet*: "evidently"; (expressing irony or disbelief) "of course, no doubt."

⁵*conventiculum, ī, n.*: "small assembly."

⁶*schola, ae, f.*: "school"; (ML) "student."

⁷*ulterius*: "more than that."

⁸*aemulus, ī, m.*: "rival, competitor."

⁹*obsidiō, ōnis, f.*: "seige."

¹⁰*vērūm*: "but."

¹¹*prōsum, prōdesse, prōfui*: "be of use to, help."

¹²*penitus*: "completely, utterly" (OLD 5).

¹³*monasticus, a, um*: "monastic" (ML).

8.3 (64.144) Post reditum vero¹ magistri nostri ad urbem, quos conflictus² disputationum scolares nostri tam cum ipso quam cum discipulis eius habuerint, et quos fortuna eventus³ in his bellis dederit nostris (immo mihi ipsi in eis) te quoque res ipsa dudum edocuit. Illud vero Aiakis,⁴ ut temperantius loquar, audacter proferam,

Si queritis huius
Fortunam pugne, non sum superatus ab illo.

Quod si ego taceam, res ipsa clamat, et ipsius rei finis indicat.

quos conflictus ... dudum edocuit = *res ipsa dudum docuit te quos conflictūs disputationum sc(h)lares nostri habuerint, tam cum (me) ipso, quam cum discipulis, et quos eventūs in bellis fortuna dederit nostris (immo mihi ipsi in eis).*

Illud ... Aiakis = *illud (verbum) Aiakis.*

ut temperantius loquar: “to put it mildly.”

ipsius rei finis indicat = *finis ipsius rei indicat*. The object of *indicat* is the truth of what Abelard has been saying

Si queritis ... pugne = *Si qu(a)retis Fortunam huius pugnae*. Ovid, *Metamorphoses* 13.89-90. It has been suggested that the quotation is ironic; Clanchy, M. “Abelard—Knight (*Miles*), Courtier (*Palatinus*) and Man of War (*Vir Bellator*).” *Medieval Knighthood*. Ed. S. Church and S. Harvey. Woodbridge, 1995. 101–18, at 102-3.

c. AD 112

9. (67.155) Dum vero hec agerentur, karissima mihi mater mea Lucia repatriare⁵ me compulit; que videlicet post conversionem Berengarii patris mei ad professionem monasticam, idem facere disponebat.⁶ Quo completo reversus sum in Franciam, maxime ut de divinitate⁷ addiscerem,⁸ quando iam sepefatus⁹ magister noster Guillhelmus in episcopatu Catalaunensi pollebat.¹⁰ In hac autem lectione magister eius Anselmus Laudunensis maximam ex antiquitate auctoritatem tunc tenebat.

repatriare me compulit: Abelard was apparently sick, perhaps because of overwork. Clanchy 70; the date was probably 1105. idem facere disponebat: i.e. she was planning to go to a convent.

reversus sum in Franciam: *Francia* meant The Isle de France, the region around Paris. The date was 1108.

in episcopatu Catalaunensi: “as bishop at Châlons.” For Châlons see on 5 above; it seems *not* to be considered part of *Francia*, so in going there Abelard was presumably avoiding William, despite his strength as a teacher of theology.

Anselmus Laudunensis: Anselm of Laon (ca. 1055-1117), a student of Anselm of Canterbury (St. Anselm). Anselm and the cathedral school at Laon were famous for study of the bible.

ex antiquitate: “from time immemorial” (Levitan).

¹ *vērō*: “moreover, indeed” (OLD 6).

² *conflictus, ūs*, m.: “clash.”

³ *eventus, ūs*, m.: “outcome.”

⁴ *Aiāx, Aiācis*, m.: “Ajax.”

⁵ *repatriō, repatriāre*: “return to one’s country” (ML).

⁶ *dispōnō, dispōnere, disposuī, dispositum*: here “arrange” (OLD 6).

⁷ *divinitās, ātis*, f. “divinity”; here the academic discipline we also call “theology.”

⁸ *addiscō, addiscere, addidici*: “learn in addition.”

⁹ *sepefatus* (ML) = *saepefatus, a, um* “often mentioned” (ML but not in Niermeyer).

¹⁰ *polleō, pollēre*: “be important” or “be predominant.”

AD 1113

10.1 (68.164) Accessi igitur ad hunc senem, cui magis longevus usus quam ingenium vel memoria nomen comparaverat.¹ Ad quem si quis de aliqua questione pulsandum² accederet incertus, redibat incertior. Mirabilis quidem³ in oculis erat auscultantium,⁴ sed nullus in conspectu questionantium.⁵ Verborum usum habebat mirabilem, sed sensum contentibilem et ratione vacuum. Cum ignem accenderet, domum suam fumo implebat, non luce illustrabat. Arbor eius tota in foliis, aspicientibus a longe, conspicua videbatur, sed propinquantibus et diligentius intuentibus infructuosa reperiebatur.

nomen comparaverat: “had acquired a reputation.”

si quis ... incertus = *si quis incertus de aliqua qu(a)estione accederet pulsandum*. *pulsandum* is gerund with a verb of motion, “to knock on the door” (metaphorically).

10.2 (68.174) Ad hanc itaque cum accessissem ut fructum inde colligerem, deprehendi illam esse ficulneam,⁶ cui maledixit Dominus, seu illam veterem quercum,⁷ cui Pompeium Lucanus comparat, dicens:

Stat, magni nominis umbra,
Qualis frugifero quercus sublimis in agro,
et cetera.

Ad hanc = *ad hanc (arborem)*.

cui maledixit Dominus: cf. Matthew 21.18-22; Mark 11.13-34.

Lucanus: Lucan’s famous description of Pompey the Great, *Pharsalia* 1.133-136. Anselm is like Pompey, so Abelard (by implication) is like Julius Caesar. The reference may suggest that Abelard, like Caesar “enjoyed making his way by destroying others” (Clanchy 93, though “enjoy” seems an odd word.)

10.3 (68.180) Hoc igitur comperto, non multis diebus in umbra eius ociosus⁸ iacui. Paulatim vero, me iam rarius et rarius ad lectiones eius accedente, quidam tunc inter discipulos eius eminentes graviter id ferebant, quasi tanti magistri contemptor⁹ fierem. Proinde¹⁰ illum quoque adversum me latenter commoventes, pravis¹¹ suggestionibus ei me invidiosum fecerunt.

¹ *comparō* (1): “prepare, acquire.”

² *pulsō* (1): “strike, beat; knock (on a door).”

³ *quidem*: “admittedly, it is true” (OLD 4).

⁴ *auscultō* (1): “listen.”

⁵ *questiōnō* (1): “put to the torture” (rare and LL); here presumably just “ask questions.”

⁶ *ficulneus, a, um*: “of the fig-tree.”

⁷ *quercus, ūs, f.*: “oak.”

⁸ *ōtiōsus, a, um*: “acting in a leisurely fashion; inactive, idle.”

⁹ *contemptor, ōris, m.*: “one who despises; one who scorns.”

¹⁰ *proinde* (two syllables): “accordingly” (OLD 3).

¹¹ *prāvus, a, um*: “crooked; corrupt.”

11.1 (68.186) Accidit autem quadam die, ut, post aliquas sententiarum collationes,¹ nos scholares invicem² iocaremur. Vbi, cum me quidam animo intemptantis interrogasset, quid mihi de divinorum lectione librorum videretur, qui nondum nisi in philosophicis studueram, respondi saluberrimum quidem huius lectionis esse studium, ubi salus anime cognoscitur,³ sed me vehementer mirari quod his, qui litterati sunt, ad expositiones sanctorum intelligendas ipsa eorum scripta vel glose⁴ non sufficiunt, ut alio scilicet non egeant⁵ magisterio.

sententiarum collationes: the *sententiae* were authoritative statements about theology derived from church fathers etc.; a *collatio* was the comparison of differing *sententiae*, “the equivalent of a seminar” (Clanchy 85).

animo intemptantis: “with the mind of the tempter.” An allusion to Satan; Matthew 4.1-10. *intemptans* clearly means “tempter” or “one tempting”, but I can find neither *intemptans* nor *intempto* in OLD or LS; Niermeyer has *intentare*, “pay attention to, accuse.”

ubi salus anime cognoscitur = ubi salus anim(a)e cognoscitur. Abelard switches to the indicative to emphasize that this his opinion now as well as then.

quod his ... non sufficiunt = quod ipsa eorum scripta vel glos(sa)e non sufficiunt his, qui litterati sunt, ad expositiones sanctorum intelligendas. ad expositiones ... intelligendas = ad intellegendum expositiones; AG § 503. *miror* introduce a causal clause with *quod* in CL (OLD 1c).

ut alio scilicet non egeant magisterio: the subject of *egeant* is (*illi*) *qui litterati sunt*. For the debate about whether scripture needed interpreters see Clanchy 87.

11.2 (68.196) Irridentes plurimi qui aderant, an hoc ego possem et aggredi presumerem requisierunt. Respondi me id, si vellent, experiri paratum esse. Tunc inclamantes et amplius irridentes “Certe,” inquit, “et nos assentimus. Queratur⁶ itaque et tradatur vobis expositor alicuius inusitate scripture, et probemus quod vos promittitis.” Et consenserunt omnes in obscurissima Hiezechielis prophetia. Assumpto itaque expositore, statim in crastino eos ad lectionem invitavi. Qui invito mihi consilium dantes, dicebant ad rem tantam non esse properandum, sed diutius⁷ in expositione rimanda⁸ et firmanda mihi hactenus⁹ inexperto vigilandum. Indignatus autem respondi non esse mee consuetudinis per usum proficere,¹⁰ sed per ingenium; atque adieci vel me penitus¹¹ desitutum esse,¹² vel eos pro arbitrio meo ad lectionem accedere non differre.

an hoc ego possem ... requisierunt = requisierunt an ego hoc possem et (an ego) pr(a)esumerem aggredi aggredi.

expositor alicuius inusitate scripture = expositor alicuius inusitat(a)e scriptur(a)e. Although the word suggests an actual person, *expositor* (“explainer”) probably refers to a biblical passage with commentary; Clanchy 89.

in obscurissima Hiezechielis prophetia: the precise passage is unknown. The book of Ezekiel was considered one of the most difficult sections of the Bible; the others were the beginning of Genesis and the *Song of Songs* (Andrée).

in crastino: “on the next day”; CL would be *in crastino die*.

dicebant ... properandum = dicebant non properandum esse ad rem tantam.

sed diutius ... vigilandum = sed (dicebant) mihi hactenus inexperto vigilandum (esse) in expositioine rimanda et firmanda.

mee consuetudinis: the genitive in the predicate can limit an infinitive, AG § 343c.

pro arbitrio meo: “at my behest,” “at my discretion” (see OLD *arbitrium* 4b and c).

¹ *collātiō, ōnis*, f.: “comparison” (OLD 4a).

² *invicem*: “in turn; back and forth.”

³ *cognoscō, cognoscere, cognōuī, cognitum*: “get to know; find to be.”

⁴ *glossa, ae*, f.: (CL) “glossary”; (ML) “marginal annotation.”

⁵ *egeō, egēre, eguī*: “need, require” (+ abl.).

⁶ *queratur* (ML) = (CL) *quaeratur*.

⁷ *diū* (comp. *diūtius*): “for a long time, long.”

⁸ *rīmor* (1): “examine, scrutinize.”

⁹ *hāctenus*: “up to this point.”

¹⁰ *prōficiō, prōficere, prōfēcī, prōfectum*: “make progress.”

¹¹ *penitus*: here “utterly” (OLD 5).

¹² *dēsīnō, dēsīnere, dēs(i)ī or dēsivī, dēsītum*: “leave off, stop.”

12. (69.211) Et prime quidem lectioni nostre pauci tunc interfuere, quod ridiculum omnibus videretur me, adhuc quasi penitus sacre lectionis expertem,¹ id tam propere² aggredi. Omnibus tamen, qui affuerunt, in tantum lectio illa grata extitit, ut eam singulari preconio³ extollerent, et me secundum hunc nostre lectionis tenorem ad glosandum compellerent. Quo quidem audito, hii, qui non interfuerant, ceperunt ad secundam et terciam lectionem certatim concurrere, et omnes pariter de transcribendis glosis, quas prima die inceperam in ipso earum initio, plurimum solliciti esse.

quod ... videretur: the subjunctive shows that this was the opinion of people at the time.

in tantum: “to such an extent.”

et me ... compellerent = *et compellerent me ad glosandum secundum hunc tenorem nostre lectionis*. They insisted that he offer another commentary (a “gloss”) along the same lines as the one they had heard about. *glossare* (ML) means “to add glosses to a text.” See further Clanchy 89.

omnes ... solliciti esse: they wanted copies of his first lecture.

De persecutione eius quoque in eum.

13.1 (69.222) Hinc⁴ itaque predictus senex, vehementi commotus invidia, et quorundam persuasionibus iam adversum me, ut supra memini, tunc stimulatus, non minus in sacra lectione me persequi cepit,⁵ quam antea Guillhelmus noster in philosophia. Erant autem tunc in scholis huius senis duo, qui ceteris preminere videbantur, Albericus scilicet Remensis et Lotulfus Lombardus, qui quanto de se maiora presumebant, amplius adversum me accendebantur.

Albericus ... Lotulfus Lombardus: Alberic of Rheims (d. 1141) was later archbishop of Bourges; Abelard called him “the most arrogant master in France” (Clanchy 337). Lotulf the Lombard was later a canon of the cathedral at Rheims. They were Abelard’s accusers at Soissons (see 38-40 below).

13.2 (70.230) Horum itaque maxime suggestionibus, sicut postmodum⁶ deprehensum est, senex ille perturbatus impudenter mihi interdixit inceptum glosandi opus in loco magisterii sui amplius exercere, hanc videlicet causam pretendens, ne, si forte in illo opere aliquid per errorem ibi scriberem, utpote rudis adhuc in hoc studio, ei deputeretur.⁷ Quod cum ad aures scholarium pervenisset, maxima commoti sunt indignatione super tam manifesta livoris calumpnia,⁸ que nemini umquam ulterius acciderat. Que quanto manifestior, tanto mihi honorabilior extitit, et persequendo gloriosiore effecit.

mihi interdixit ... exercere = *interdixit mihi amplius exercere inceptum opus glosandi in loco magisterii sui*. *interdico* (“prohibit”) can take an accusative and infinitive in CL.

ei deputeretur: the master of a cathedral school was responsible for all its teachings.

ad aures scholarium: the *scholares* are the student body at large, not Albericus and Lotulf.

que nemini umquam ulterius acciderat: In CL *ulterius* “further” or (esp. in negative sentences) “anymore” (CL); in ML it can mean “later” (Niermeyer). Here, given the pluperfect of *acciderat* the sense seems to be “before.”

Que quanto manifestior: the antecedent of *qu(a)e* is apparently *calumpnia*.

et persequendo ... effecit = *et (me) effecit gloriosiore persequendo*.

¹ *expers, expertis*: “having no share in, lacking knowledge.”

² *propere*: “quickly.”

³ *praeconium, (i)i*, n.: “declaration, report.”

⁴ *hinc*: “from this fact, hence.”

⁵ *coepi* (two syllables), *coepisse*, *coeptum*: “begin” (perfect with present meaning).

⁶ *postmodum*: “later.”

⁷ *dēputō* (1): “regard as” (OLD 2).

⁸ *calumpnia, ae*, f. “false accusation.”

c. AD 1114

14. (70.241) Post paucos itaque dies, Parisius reversus, scholas¹ mihi iamdudum destinatas atque oblatas, unde primo fueram expulsus, annis aliquibus quiete possedi, atque ibi, in ipso statim scholarum initio, glosas illas Hiezechielis, quas Lauduni inceperam, consummare² studui. Que quidem adeo³ legentibus acceptabiles fuerunt, ut me non minorem gratiam in sacra lectione adeptum⁴ iam crederent, quam in philosophica viderant. Vnde, utriusque lectionis studio, scole nostre vehementer multiplicata, quanta mihi de pecunia lucra,⁵ quantam gloriam compararent,⁶ ex fama te quoque latere non potuit.

unde primo fueram expulsus: in 1109.

in ipso = *in ipso (loco)*.

Lauduni: "at Laon."

me non minorem crederent = *ut crederent me non minorem gratiam in sacra lectione adeptum (esse)*.

scole nostre ... non potuit = *ex famā non potuit quoque te latere, quanta lucra de pecuniā, quantam gloriam, sc(h)ol(a)e nostr(a)e, vehementer multiplicat(a)e, mihi compararent. scole ... multiplicata* is perhaps an example of the ML "nominative absolute."

15.1 (70.252) Sed quoniam prosperitas stultos semper inflat, et mundana⁷ tranquillitas vigorem enervat animi et per carnales illecebras⁸ facile resolvit, cum iam me solum in mundo superesse philosophum estimarem, nec ullam ulterius inquietationem formidarem, frena⁹ libidini cepi¹⁰ laxare, qui antea vixeram continentissime. Et quo¹¹ amplius in philosophia vel sacra lectione profeceram, amplius a philosophis et divinis immunditia vite recedebam. Constat¹² quippe philosophos nedum¹³ divinos—id est sacre lectionis exhortationibus intentos¹⁴—continentie decore maxime polluisse.¹⁵

prosperitas stultos semper inflat: cp. Proverbs 1.32.

cum ... estimarem nec formidarem: a causal *cum* clause.

frena libidini cepi laxare: *libidini* is dative of reference, "from its harness."

qui ... vixeram: the antecedent of *qui* is "I", the subject of *cepi*.

divinis: "theologians" (Andrée).

immunditia vite = *immunditiā vit(a)e*. Ablative of cause.

id est ... intentos = *id est, (eos) intentos exhortationibus sacr(a)e lectionis*. People who really pay attention to the Bible.

¹ *schola*, ae, f.: "school"; (ML) "student."

² *consummō* (1): "make complete, finish" (OLD 3).

³ *adeō*: "to such an extent, so much."

⁴ *adipiscor*, *adipiscī*, *adeptus*: "acquire, obtain."

⁵ *lucrum*, ī, n. "profit."

⁶ *comparō* (1): "acquire, secure" (OLD 6).

⁷ *mundānus*, a, um: "of the world" (CL but rare).

⁸ *illecebra*, ae, f.: "allurement, enticement."

⁹ *frēnum*, ī, n. "bridle, harness" (of a horse).

¹⁰ *coepī* (two syllables), *coepisse*, *coeptum*: "begin" (perfect with present meaning).

¹¹ *quō*²: "in proportion as" (as in 3 above).

¹² *constat*: "it is apparent; it is well known" (OLD *constō* 9).

¹³ *nedum*: "still less; not to speak of, let alone."

¹⁴ *intentus*, a, um: "closely attentive" (OLD 1b, though there used of the eyes and ears only).

¹⁵ *polleō*, *pollēre*: here "be strong."

15.2 (70.262) Cum igitur totus in superbia atque luxuria¹ laborarem, utriusque² morbi remedium divina mihi gratia licet nolenti contulit—ac primo luxurie, deinde superbie: luxurie quidem, his me privando, quibus hanc exercebam; superbie vero, que mihi ex litterarum maxime scientia nascebatur—iuxta³ illud Apostoli *Scientia inflat*—illius libri, quo maxime gloriabar, combustione me humiliando. Cuius nunc rei utramque historiam, verius ex ipsa re quam ex auditu cognoscere te volo, ordine quidem quo processerunt.

cum ... laborarem: best translated as circumstantial *cum* clause (“when...”); it could also be either a concessive clause or causal one.

utriusque ... contulit = *divina gratia contulit mihi (licet nolenti) remedium utriusque morbi*. *licet* can be used without a verb to mean simply “to be sure, it is true” (see OLD 4c).

luxurie ... exercebam = (*divina gratia remedium contulit mihi*) *luxuri(a)e quidem privando me his quibus hanc (= luxuriam) exercebam*. *hi quibus luxuriam exercebam* are his testicles; see ch. 30 below.

superbie ... humiliando = (*divina gratia remedium contulit mihi*) *superbi(a)e vero, qu(a)e mihi nascebatur maxime ex litterarum scientiā—iuxta illud (verbum) Apostoli (Pauli), “Scientia inflat”—me humiliando combustione illius libri, quo maxime gloriabar*. The quotation is from I Cor. 8.1. On the book burning, see ch. 45.

16. (71.272) Quia igitur scortorum⁴ immunditiam semper abhorrebam, et ab accessu et frequentatione nobilium feminarum, studii scholaris assiduitate, revocabar, nec laicarum⁵ conversationem⁶ multum noveram, prava⁷ mihi, ut dicitur, fortuna blandiens⁸ commodiorem nacta est⁹ occasionem, qua me facilius de sublimitatis huius fastigio prosterneret—imo¹⁰ superbissimum nec accepte gratie memorem divina pietas humiliatum¹¹ sibi vindicaret.¹²

prava mihi, ut dicitur, fortuna blandiens = *prava fortuna, ut dicitur, blandiens mihi*. For the cliché, see the Replican tragedian T. Quinctius Atta *quibus natura prava magis quam fors aut fortuna obfuit*, Att. ap. Non. 425, 13 (Trag. Rel. ed. Rib. v. 110).

imo superbissimum ... vindicaret = *im(m)o divina pietas sibi vindicaret (me) superbissimum, nec accept(a)e grati(a)e memorem, humiliatum*.

¹ *luxūria*, *ae*, *f.*: (ML) “lust, leachery.”

² *uterque*, *utraque*, *utrumque*: “each” (of two).

³ *iuxtā*: here prep. + acc. “in accordance with” (OLD 7).

⁴ *scortum*, *ī*, *n.* “prostitute.”

⁵ *lāicus*, *a*, *um*: here “ordinary, non-noble”; in LL only “lay, not consecrated.”

⁶ *conversātiō*, *ōnis*, *f.*: “familiarity, habitual association.”

⁷ *prāvus*, *a*, *um*: “crooked; perverse.”

⁸ *blandior*, *blandīrī*, *blanditus* (sometimes with dative): “flatter; allure, charm.”

⁹ *nanciscor*, *nanciscī*, *nactus* or *nactus*: “obtain, get; find.”

¹⁰ *immō*: “or rather, more precisely.”

¹¹ *humiliō* (1): “abase, humiliate” (LL).

¹² *vindicō* (1); LL *vindicō* (1): “claim as one’s property.”

Quomodo in amorem Heloyse lapsus vulnus inde tam mentis quam corporis traxit.

c. AD 1115 or 1116

17.1 (71.280) Erat quippe in ipsa civitate Parisius adolescentula¹ quedam, nomine Heloysa, neptis² canonici cuiusdam, qui Fulbertus vocabatur, qui eam quanto amplius diligebat, tanto diligentius in omnem, qua poterat, scientiam litterarum promoveri studuerat. Que cum per faciem non esset infima, per habundantiam³ litterarum erat suprema. Nam quo bonum hoc—litteratorie scilicet scientie—in mulieribus est rarius, eo amplius puellam commendabat, et in toto regno nominatissimam fecerat.

adolescentula: “she may have been in her twenties ... or even close to thirty” (Clanchy 173); Marenbon thinks she was sixteen or seventeen (p. 14).

neptis canonici cuiusdam, qui Fulbertus vocabatur: Clanchy p. 12 says “there is no suggestion that this was a euphemism for illegitimate daughter”; at 46 he says “possibly she was his daughter, or the daughter of another cleric.”

qui eam ... studuerat = *qui eam quanto amplius diligebat, tanto diligentius studuerat (eam) promoveri in omnem scientiam litterarum, qua (Fulbertus) poterat.*

cum ... infima: concessive *cum* clause.

litteratorie scilicet scientie = *scilicet litteratori(a)e scienti(a)e*. *scilicet* can be “a purely epexegetic particle” in CL (OLD 5b); here it is used to introduce *litteratorie scientie*, nom. pl. in apposition to *bonum hoc*. Compare the modern use of *sc.* in footnotes etc.

17.2 (71.288) Hanc igitur, omnibus circumspectis que amantes allicere solent, commodiorem censui in amorem mihi copulare,⁴ et me id facillime credidi posse. Tanti quippe tunc nominis eram, et iuventutis et forme gratia preminebam,⁵ ut, quaecunque feminarum nostro dignarer amore, nullam vererer repulsam.⁶ Tanto autem facilius hanc mihi puellam consensuram credidi, quanto amplius eam litterarum scientiam et habere et diligere noveram; nosque etiam absentes, scriptis internuntiis⁷ invicem,⁸ liceret presentare,⁹ et pleraque audacius scribere quam colloqui, et sic semper iocundis interesse colloquiis.

omnibus circumspectis ... allicere solent: This means (I think) not that Abelard considered other possible lovers and concluded that Heloise was the best choice, but rather that, finding himself attracted to her, he considered the various options open to him.

commodiorem .. copulare = *censui copulare (eam) mihi in amorem commodiorem*. He decided to take things to the next level.

18.1 (72.300) In huius itaque adolescentule amorem totus inflamatus, occasionem quesivi, qua eam mihi domestica et cotidiana conversatione familiarem efficerem et facilius ad consensum traherem. Quod quidem ut fieret, egi¹⁰ cum predicto puelle avunculo,¹¹ quibusdam ipsius amicis intervenientibus, quatinus¹² me in domum suam, que scolis nostris proxima erat, sub quocumque procurationis precio,¹³ susciperet, hanc videlicet occasionem pretendens, quod studium nostrum domestica nostre familie cura plurimum prepediret, et impensa nimia nimium me gravaret.

sub quocumque procurationis precio: “at whatever price (was necessary) for the responsibility” i.e. “for the lease.”

domestica nostre familie cura: i.e. maintaining his own household.

¹ *adolescentula*, *ae*, *f.*: “young woman.”

² *neptis*, *is*, *f.*: (CL) “granddaughter, female relative”; (LL) “niece.”

³ *abundantia*, *ae*, *f.*: “abundance.”

⁴ *commodus*, *a*, *um*: “agreeable” (OLD 5).

⁵ *praemineō*, *praeminēre*: “stand out, be preeminent.”

⁶ *repulsa*, *ae*, *f.*: “rebuff” (in love, OLD 2b).

⁷ *internuntius*, *(i)ī*, *m.*: “messenger, intermediary, go-between.”

⁸ *invicem*: “mutually, reciprocally” (OLD 3).

⁹ *praesento* (1): “be present” (ML); “exhibit” (CL).

¹⁰ *agō*, *agere*, *ēgī*, *actum*: (w. *cum*) “do business with” (OLD 37; 39).

¹¹ *avunculus*, *ī*, *m.*: “uncle.”

¹² *quātenus*: “so that” (OLD 9; used in ML like *ut* to introduce purpose clauses).

¹³ *pretium*, *(i)ī*, *n.*: “price.”

18.2 (72.310) Erat autem cupidus ille valde, atque erga¹ neptim suam, ut amplius semper in doctrinam proficeret litteratoriam, plurimum studiosus. Quibus quidem duobus facile eius assensum² assecutus sum,³ et quod obtabam obtinui, cum ille videlicet et ad pecuniam totus inhiaret, et neptim suam ex doctrina nostra aliquid percepturam crederet. Super quo vehementer me deprecatus, supra quam sperare presumerem, votis meis accessit, et amori consuluit,⁴ eam videlicet totam nostro magisterio committens, ut, quotiens mihi a scolis reverso vaccaret,⁵ tam in die quam in nocte ei docende operam darem, et eam, si neglegentem sentirem, vehementer constringerem.⁶

neptim suam ... percepturam: *sc. esse*; indirect statement depending on *crederet*.

Super quo: “concerning which” (Andrée); “on top of this” (Levitan).

votis meis accessit: “he answered my prayers.” [Is this a CL idiom? it seems like it.] Abelard is being ironic: Fulbert didn’t know what those prayers were.

ut ... operam darem = *ut, quotiens vaccaret mihi reverso a sc(h)olis, darem operam ei docend(a)e, tam in die quam in nocte.*

et eam ... constringerem = *et (ut eam) vehementer constringam, si sentirem eam neglegentem.*

18.3 (72.321) In qua re quidem, quanta eius simplicitas esset vehementer ammiratus, non minus apud me obstupui, quam si agnam teneram famelico⁷ lupo committeret. Qui cum eam mihi non solum docendam, verum etiam vehementer constringendam traderet, quid aliud agebat, quam ut votis meis licentiam penitus daret, et occasionem (etiam si nollemus) offerret, ut quam videlicet blanditiis non possem, minis et verberibus facilius flecterem. Sed duo erant, que eum maxime a turpi suspicione revocabant, amor videlicet neptis, et continentie mee fama preterita.

quanta eius simplicitas ... ammiratus = *ammiratus vehementer quanta eius simplicitas esset.*

19.1 (72.332) Quid plura? Primum domo una coniungimur, postmodum animo. Sub occasione⁸ itaque discipline,⁹ amori penitus vaccabamus, et secretos regressus,¹⁰ quos amor optabat, studium lectionis offerebat. Apertis itaque libris, plura de amore quam de lectione verba se ingerebant,¹¹ plura erant oscula quam sententie;¹² sepius¹³ ad sinus¹⁴ quam ad libros reducebantur manus, crebrius¹⁵ oculos amor in se reflectebat¹⁶ quam lectio in scripturam dirigebat.

domo una: *una* is the adjective, with *domo*, not the adverb.

oculos amor ... reflectebat = *amor reflectebat oculos in se*. Note that *reflecto* means “turn back,” not “reflect.”

quam lectio ... dirigebat = *quam lectio (oculos) in scripturam dirigebat.*

¹ *ergā*: “with regard to” (OLD 3).

² *assensus, ūs, m.*: “approval.”

³ *assequor, assequi, assecutus*: “achieve, win” (OLD 3).

⁴ *consulō* (1): “provide for” (OLD 4).

⁵ *vacō* (1): “have leisure, be disengaged from other things” (OLD 6).

⁶ *constringō, constringere, constrinxī, constrictum* “restrain, control” (OLD 4); “punish” (ML).

⁷ *famēlicus, a, um*: “starved, famished.”

⁸ *occāsiō, ōnis, f.*: “opportunity” (OLD 1); “pretext” (LL).

⁹ *diciplīna, ae, f.*: “teaching, instruction.”

¹⁰ *regressus, ūs, M.*: “withdrawal, retreat.”

¹¹ *ingerō, ingerere, ingessi, ingestum*: “obtrude” (OLD 3); “din into someone’s ears, say repeatedly” (OLD 4).

¹² *sententia, ae, f.*: “thought, idea” (OLD 6a).

¹³ *saepe*, (comp.) *saepeius*: “often.”

¹⁴ *sinus, ūs, m.*: “fold in the clothing”; “breast, chest, bosom” (OLD 1ab).

¹⁵ *crēbrō, (comp.) crēbrius*: “often.”

¹⁶ *reflectō, reflectere, reflexī, reflectum*: “bend back, turn back.”

19.2 (73.339) Quoque minus suspicionis haberemus, verbera¹ quandoque² dabat amor, non furor, gratia, non ira, que omnium ungentorum suavitatem transcenderent. Quid denique? Nullus a cupidis³ intermissus est gradus amoris, et, si quid insolitum amor excogitare potuit, est additum; et quo minus ista fueramus experti gaudia, ardentius illis insistebamus, et minus in fastidium⁴ vertebantur; et quo me amplius hec voluptas occupaverat, minus philosophie vaccare poteram et scolis operam dare.

Quoque minus = *et quo minus*.

dabat amor: i.e. “love was the cause of.”

non furor ... non ira = *non furor, (sed) gratia, non ira (dabat quandoque verbera)*.

que ... transcenderent: the antecedent is presumably *verbera* (see Levitan); Bellows translates as though the antecedent were *amor*, presumably along with *gratia* to account for the plural of *transcenderent*, resulting is a much less disturbing statement about the place of beatings in a love affair.

a cupidis = *a (nobis) cupidis*.

gradus amoris: Ovid, *Ars Amatoria* 1.482 mentions the “stages” of love; apparently discussed by Arnulf of Orleans (whoever that is; so Andrée, without a reference.)

et minus in fastidium vertebantur = *et (gaudia) vertebantur minus in fastidium*.

20.1 (73.349) Tediosum mihi vehementer erat ad scholas procedere vel in eis morari, pariter et laboriosum, cum nocturnas amori vigilias⁵ et diurnas⁶ studio conservarem. Quem etiam ita negligentem et tepidum lectio tunc habebat, ut iam nichil ex ingenio, sed ex usu cuncta proferrem, nec iam nisi recitator⁷ pristinorum⁸ essem inventorum,⁹ et, si qua invenire liceret, carmina essent amatoria, non philosophie secreta. Quorum etiam carminum pleraque¹⁰ adhuc¹¹ in multis, sicut et ipse nosti, frequentantur¹² et decantantur¹³ regionibus, ab his maxime, quos vita similis oblectat.

cum nocturnas ... conservarem = *cum conservarem nocturnas vigilias amori, et (conservarem) diurnas (vigilias) studio*.

Quem etiam ... habebat = *lectio* (i.e. a lesson) *tunc habebat (me)* (the antecedent of *Quem* is Abelard himself) *etiam ita negligentem et tepidum*.

ut iam nichil ... proferrem = *ut iam (proferrem) nihil ex (meo) ingenio, sed proferrem cuncta ex usu*. He was teaching on autopilot.

nec iam ... inventorum = *nec iam essem recitator nisi pristinorum inventorum*.

carmina ... amatoria: One of these may survive among the *Carmina Burana*, namely *Hebet sidus laeti risus* (no. 169), which may contain a pun (sort of) on Phoebe (= “Helios”) and Heloise. See Dronke, E. P. M. *Medieval Latin and the Rise of European Love-Lyric*. Oxford, 1968. 1, 313-318; Dronke, Peter, and G. Orlandi. “New Works by Abelard and Heloise.” *Filologia Mediolatino* 12 (2005): 123-77. See appendix.

sicut et ipse nosti: *nostis* = *novisti* (CL). Scholars tell us that that Abelard’s addressee in the *Historia Calamitatum* is a literary fiction.

20.2 (73.359) Quantam autem mestitiam, quos gemitus, que lamenta nostri super hoc scholares assumerent, ubi videlicet hanc animi mei occupationem—immo perturbationem—presenserunt, non est facile dicere vel cogitare.

que lamenta ... assumerent = *qu(a) lamenta nostri sc(h)olares assumerent super hoc*. *assumerent* is imperfect subjunctive, presumably in an indirect question depending on *non est facile vel cogitare*.

¹ *verber, verberis*, n.: “blow” (OLD 3).

² *quandoque*: “now and then, sometimes” (LL; “at which time; at some time” CL).

³ *cupidus, a, um*: “eager” (OLD 1) or “lecherous” (OLD 5).

⁴ *fastidium, (i)ī, n.*: “distaste; disgust.”

⁵ *vigilia, ae, f.*: “periods of wakefulness” (usually in plural; OLD 4).

⁶ *diurnus, a, um*: “of the day, daytime.”

⁷ *recitator, ōris, m.*: “reciter, one who reads aloud.”

⁸ *pristinus, a, um*: “ancient, belonging to former times.”

⁹ *inventum, ī, n.*: “invention.”

¹⁰ *plērusque, plēraque, plērumque*: “most”; (pl.) “a great number.”

¹¹ *adhuc*: “up to the present time, still.”

¹² *frequentō* (1): “populate, throng”; here “repeat, perform” (OLD 5).

¹³ *decantō* (1): “chant.”

21.1 (73.363) Paucos enim iam res tam manifesta decipere poterat, ac neminem (credo) preter¹ eum ad cuius ignominiam maxime id spectabat, ipsum videlicet puelle avunculum. Cui quidem hoc cum a nonnullis² non numquam³ suggestum fuisset,⁴ credere non poterat, tum,⁵ ut supra memini, propter immoderatam sue neptis amicitiam, tum etiam propter ante acte vite mee continentiam cognitam.

ac neminem = *ac (res tam manifesta poterat decipere) neminem*.

ut supra memini: see 17.1.

propter ante ... cognitam = *propter cognitam continentiam vit(a)e me(a)e ante act(a)e. vitam agere* is CL for “lead a life” (OLD ago 31a).

21.2 (73.369) Non enim facile de his, quos plurimum diligimus,⁶ turpitudinem suspicamur,⁷ nec in vehementi dilectione⁸ turpis suspicionis⁹ labes¹⁰ potest inesse. Vnde et illud est beati Iheronimi in epistola ad Castricianum: “Solemus mala domus nostre scire novissimi,¹¹ ac liberorum ac coniugum vitia, vicinis¹² canentibus, ignorare.” Sed quod novissime¹³ scitur, utique¹⁴ sciri quandoque¹⁵ contingit, et quod omnes deprehendunt, non est facile unum latere. Sic itaque pluribus evolutis mensibus et de nobis accidit.

Vnde ... Castricianum = *Vnde et illud (dictum) est in epistula ad Castricianum*. The reference is to letter 147.10 of St. Jerome (c. 347-420), though the letter is in fact addressed to a deacon named Sabinianus.

utique sciri quandoque contingit = *utique contingit quandoque sciri*.

unum latere: “to be kept hidden from one person.” *lateō* + acc. is rare in CL.

21.3 (74.379) O quantus in hoc cognoscendo dolor avunculi! Quantus in separatione amantium dolor ipsorum! Quanta sum erubescencia¹⁶ confusus! Quanta contritione¹⁷ super afflictione puelle sum afflicto! Quantos meroris¹⁸ ipsa de verecundia mea sustinuit estus!¹⁹ Neuter quod sibi, sed quod alteri contigerat querebatur; neuter sua, sed alterius plangebat incommoda. Separatio autem hec corporum maxima erat copulatio animorum, et negata sui copia amplius amorem accendebat, et verecundie transacta iam passio inverecundiores²⁰ reddebat; tantoque verecundie minor extiterat passio, quanto convenientior videbatur actio.

Quantos meroris ... estus! = *quantos (a)estus m(a)eroris de meā verecundiā ipsā (= Heloysa) sustinuit*.

Separatio ... animorum: *h(a)ec separatio corporum autem erat maxima copulatio animorum*.

et verecundie ... reddebat = *et passio verecundi(a)e, iam transacta, reddebat (nos) inverecundiores*. Once the intensity of their shame passed, it made them more shameless.

tantoque verecundie ... videbatur actio = *(et) quanto actio videbatur convenientior, tanto[que] passio verecundiae extiterat minor*.

¹*praeter* (= acc.): “except for.”

²*nōnullus, a, um*: “a little” (plural) “some.”

³*nōnumquam*: “sometimes.”

⁴*suggerō, suggerrere, suggessī, suggestum*: “report” (see OLD 3b); “put forward (a point) for consideration” (OLD).

⁵*tum ... tum*: “both ... and.”

⁶*diligō, diligere, dilexī, dilectum*: “love, hold dear.”

⁷*suspīcor* (1): “suspect”; here + acc. (rare in CL).

⁸*dilectiō, ōnis, f.*: “love” (LL).

⁹*suspiciō, ōnis, f.*: “suspicion.”

¹⁰*lābēs, is, f.*: “disgrace, stain” (OLD 5).

¹¹*novissimus, a, um*: “latest; last.”

¹²*vicīnus, i, m.*: “neighbor.”

¹³*novissime*: “last” (OLD 3a).

¹⁴*utique*: “inevitably, necessarily” (OLD 3a).

¹⁵*quandoque*: “at some time or other, some day.”

¹⁶*erubescencia, ae, f.*: “blushing for shame, shamefacedness” (LL).

¹⁷*contrītiō, ōnis, f.*: “grief, dismay.”

¹⁸*maeror, ōris, m.*: “grief.”

¹⁹*aestus, ūs, m.*: “heat”; “flame, blaze.”

²⁰*inverecundus, a, um*: “shameless, immodest.”

c. AD 1118

22. (74.390) Actum itaque in nobis est quod in Marte et Venere deprehensis poetica narrat fabula. Non multo autem post, puella se concepisse¹ comperit,² et cum summa exultatione mihi super hoc ilico³ scripsit, consulens,⁴ quid de hoc ipse faciendum deliberarem.⁵ Quadam itaque nocte, avunculo eius absente, sicut nos condixeramus,⁶ eam de domo avunculi furtim sustuli, et in patriam meam sine mora trans misi. Vbi apud sororem meam tam diu conversata est, donec pareret⁷ masculum,⁸ quem Astralabium nominavit.

Actum ... facula = *Itaque (id) actum est in nobis quod poetica fabula narrat (actum esse) in Marte et Venere deprenensis*. The story of how Vulcan captured Mars and Venus in adultery would have been best known from Ovid, *Metamorphoses* 4.171-189; *Ars Amatoria* 2.561ff.

mihi super ilico hoc scripsit = *ilico scripsit mihi super hoc*.

consulens = *consulens me*.

quid ... deliberarem = *quid ipse deliberarem faciendum (esse) de hōc*.

Astralabium nominavit: the name is very unusual: an astralabe was an astronomical survey device, though the word was believed (wrongly) to mean *astris lapsus*, “fallen from the stars.” Petrus Astralabius grew up to take to become a priest.

23.1 (74.400) Avunculus autem eius, post ipsius recessum, quasi in insaniam conversus, quanto estuaret⁹ dolore, quanto afficeretur pudore, nemo nisi experiendo cognosceret. Quid autem in me ageret, quas mihi tenderet insidias,¹⁰ ignorabat. Si me interficeret seu in aliquo corpus meum debilitaret,¹¹ id potissimum metuebat, ne dilectissima neptis hoc in patria mea plecteretur.¹² Capere me et invitum alicubi¹³ coercere¹⁴ nullatenus¹⁵ valebat, maxime cum ego mihi super hoc plurimum providerem, quod eum, si valeret vel auderet, citius agredi non dubitarem.

hoc in patria mea plecteretur: “be punished for this in my country.” Heloise was vulnerable because she was on Abelard’s turf. *hoc* is ablative of cause (AG § 404, citing Cicero, *neglegentiā plectimur*).

Capere me ... valebat = *(avunculus) nullatenus valebat me capere et (me) alicubi coercere*.

¹ *concupiō, concipere, concēpī, conceptum*: “conceive, become pregnant” (OLD 3).

² *comperiō, comperire, comperī, compertum*: “learn.”

³ *ilicō*: “at once.”

⁴ *consulō, consulere, consulū, consultum*: “apply for advice, consult.”

⁵ *dēliberō* (1): “think” (+ infinitive, OLD 2b).

⁶ *condicō, condicere, condixī, conductum*: “appoint, fix” (a date; OLD 3).

⁷ *pariō, parere, peperī, partum*: “give birth to, bear.”

⁸ *masculus, ī, m.*: “male person.”

⁹ *gestuō* (1): “burn.”

¹⁰ *insidiae, ārum, f.pl.*: “ambush, trap”; “treacherous attack.”

¹¹ *dēbilitō* (1): “weaken, incapacitate.”

¹² *plectō, plectere*: “punish” (only found in passive).

¹³ *alicubi*: “somewhere.”

¹⁴ *coerceō, coercēre, coercuī, coercitum*: “confine, shut up” (OLD 1).

¹⁵ *nullatenus*: “by no means” (LL).

23.2 (74.410) Tandem ego, eius immoderate anxietati admodum¹ compatiens,² et de dolo, quem fecerat amor, tanquam³ de summa prodicione,⁴ me ipsum vehementer accusans, conveni hominem supplicando et promittendo quamcunque super hoc emendationem ipse constitueret, nec ulli mirabile id videri asserens, quicumque vim amoris expertus fuisset, et qui quanta ruina summos quoque viros ab ipso statim humani generis exordio mulieres deiecerint,⁵ memoria retineret. Atque ut amplius eum mittigarem supra quam sperare poterat, obtuli me ei satisfacere, eam scilicet quam corruperam mihi matrimonio copulando, dummodo id secreto fieret, ne fame detrimentum incurrerem. Assensit ille, et tam sua quam suorum fide et osculis eam, quam requisivi, concordiam mecum iniit, quo me facilius proderet.

immoderate anxietati = *immoderat(a)e anxietati*, dative with *compatiens*.

tanquam de summa prodicione: “as if it had been some supreme betrayal” (Levitan).

supplicando et promittendo: gerunds of purpose.

nec ulli mirabile id videri asserens = *asserens id videri mirabile nulli* (= *nec ... ulli*).

quicumque ... fuisset: the antecedent of *quicumque* is *ulli*.

et qui quanta ruina ... memoria retineret = *et qui memoriā retineret quantā ruinā mulieres deiecerint summos quoque viros, statim ab ipso exordio humani generis*. *quanta ruina* is presumably ablative of attendant circumstances.

ne fame detrimentum incurrerem = *ne incurrerem detrimentum fam(a)e*. “Though somewhat fatuous under the circumstances, Abelard’s desire for secrecy was not unwarranted” (Levitan). Priests could marry, but they suffered financially and teachers, in particular, were expected to be celibate.

et tam sua ... mecum iniit = *et iniit eam concordiam mecum quam requisivi tam suā (fide) quam fide suorum, et osculis*. *fide* and *osculis* are ablatives of attendant circumstances. *fide suorum* means “with the good faith of his people,” i.e. his relatives and supporters.

Dehortatio supradicte puelle a nuptis.

24.1 (75.425) Illico⁶ ego, ad patriam meam reversus, amicam reduxi ut uxorem facerem, illa tamen hoc minime approbante, immo penitus⁷ duabus de causis dissuadente, tam scilicet pro periculo, quam pro dedecore⁸ meo. Iurabat illum nulla unquam satisfactione super hoc placari posse, sicut postmodum cognitum est. Querebat etiam quam de me gloriam habitura esset, cum me ingloriosum efficeret, et se et me pariter humiliaret; quantas ab ea mundus penas exigere deberet, si tantam ei lucernam⁹ auferret; quante maledictiones, quanta dampna¹⁰ ecclesie, quante philosophorum lacrimae hoc matrimonium essent sequutur; quam indecens, quam lamentabile esset, ut, quem omnibus natura creaverat, uni me femine dicarem,¹¹ et turpitudini tante subicerem.

immo penitus ... dissuadente = *immo (illā) penitus dissuadente, de duobus causis*.

iurabat illum ... posse: *illum* = *avunculum suum*, i.e. Fulbert. The subject of *iurabat* is Heloise.

Querebat etiam ... habitura esset = *(Heloysa) qu(a)erebat etiam quam gloriam habitura esset de me*.

cum me ingloriosum efficeret: the subject is still Heloise; marrying Abelard (she said) would ruin his reputation.

quantas ab ea ... lucernam auferret = *quantas p(o)enas mundus deberet exigere ab ea (ab Helyosā), si (Heloysa) auferret tantam lucernam ei* (= *mundo*). For *lucerna* as “the light of the world” see Matthew 5.14: *vos estis lux mundi*; John 5.35: *ille erat lucerna ardens et lucens vos autem voluistis exultare ad horam in luce eius*.

essent sequutur = *secūtū(a)e essent*. *sequutus* for *secutus* is CL but rare.

quem omnibus natura creaverat = *(ego Abelardus) quem natura creaverat omnibus*. Heloise thought that Abelard belonged to the whole world.

uni me femine dicarem = *(quam lamentabile esset ut ego Abelardus) dicarem me uni feminae*.

¹*admodum*: “very much.”

²*compator, compati, compassus*: “have pity for, take pity on” (+ dat.; LL).

³*tanquam*: “as though.”

⁴*prōditiō, ōnis*, f.: “betrayal.”

⁵*dēiciō, dēicere, dēiēcī, dēiectum*: “throw to the ground” (OLD 6b).

⁶*ilicō*: “at once.”

⁷*penitus*: here “utterly” (OLD 5).

⁸*dēdecus, oris*, n.: “disgrace.”

⁹*lucerna, ae*, f.: “lamp.”

¹⁰*dammum, ī*, n.: “loss.”

¹¹*dicō* (1): “dedicate, devote.”

24.2 (75.438) Detestabatur¹ vehementer hoc matrimonium, quod mihi per omnia probrosum² esset atque honerosum.³ Pretendebat⁴ infamiam mei pariter et difficultates matrimonii, ad quas quidem vitandas nos exortans⁵ Apostolus ait: *Solutus es ab uxore? noli querere uxorem. Si autem acceperis uxorem, non peccasti; et si nupserit virgo, non peccabit. Tribulationem tamen carnis habebunt huiusmodi.*⁶ *Ego autem parco vobis, et cetera.* Item: *Volo autem vos sine sollicitudine esse, et cetera.*

per omnia: “in all respects” (OLD *omnis* 4d).

ad quas ... exortans = *ad quas (difficultates) vitandas quidem ex(h)ortans nos.*

Apostolus ait: St. Paul, in II Corinthians 7.27-28 and 7.32.

huiusmodi: with *tribulationem*, not *carnis*.

25.1 (76.447) Quod si⁷ nec Apostoli consilium nec sanctorum exhortationes de tanto matrimonii iugo⁸ suscipierem, saltem,⁹ inquit, philosophos consulerem, et que super hoc ab eis vel de eis scripta sunt attenderem. Quod plerumque¹⁰ etiam sancti ad increpationem¹¹ nostram diligenter faciunt.

sanctorum exhortationes: presumably the teachings of the church Fathers on celibacy.

etiam sancti ... faciunt: the church Fathers also invoke (pagan) philosophers, as we are about to see. The indicative shows this is not Heloise’s opinion but an objective fact.

25.2 (76.452) Quale illud est beati Iheronimi, in primo contra Iovinianum, ubi scilicet commemorat Theophrastum, intolerabilibus nuptiarum molestiis assiduisque inquietudinibus ex magna parte diligenter expositis, uxorem sapienti non esse ducendam¹² evidentissimis rationibus astruxisse,¹³ ubi et ipse, illas exhortationis philosophice rationes tali fine concludens: “Hoc,” inquit, “et huiusmodi Theophrastus disserens, quem non suffundat¹⁴ Christianorum?” et cetera.

Quale illud est beati Iheronimi = *quale (dictum?) est illud (dictum) beati Hieronimi.*

in primo contra Iovinianum = *in primo (libro) contra Iovinianum.* Jerome, *Contra Iovinianum* 1.47-48.

Theophrastum: Theophrastus (c. 371-287 BCE) was the successor of Aristotle as head of the Academy in Athens. Relatively little of his work survives, including (I believe) the text referred to by Jerome.

ex magna parte = *magnā ex parte* “to a great extent” (OLD *pars* 2b).

commemoratur Theophrastum ... uxorem sapienti non esse ducendam evidentissimis rationibus astruxisse = *commemoratur ... Theophrastum astruxisse evidentissimis rationibus uxorem non esse ducendum sapienti.* *commemoratur* governs the indirect statement *Theophrastum astruxisse*, which governs the indirect statement *uxorem non esse ducendum*. *sapienti* is dative of agent with the passive periphrastic *uxorem non esse ducendam* (all correct CL; the only unusual ML feature is the use of *astruo* in CL “build on” as a verb of speaking.)

ubi et ipse ... inquit: the subject is Jerome.

“Hoc” ... “et huiusmodi Theophrastus disserens”: Jerome seems to be using (not CL) “nominative absolute”; CL would prefer a *cum* clause or an ablative absolute. Jerome, *Adversus Iovinianum* 1.48 (291b)

“quem non suffundat Christianorum = *quem Christianorum non (Theophrastus) suffundat.* In CL *ora rubore suffundere* can mean “make someone blush”; in LL *suffundere* can mean “make blush” on its own.

¹ *dētestor* (1): “detest, loathe.”

² *probrōsus, a, um:* “disgraceful.”

³ *onerōsus, a, um:* “burdensome.”

⁴ *praetendō, praetendere, praetendī, praetentum:* “put forward as a reason” (OLD 4a).

⁵ *exhortor* (1): “encourage.”

⁶ *huiusmodi:* “of this kind” (OLD *modus* 12d).

⁷ *quod si* or *quodsi*: “but if”

⁸ *iugum, ī, n.:* “yoke” (of marriage etc, OLD 2b).

⁹ *saltem:* “at least.”

¹⁰ *plerumque:* “mostly”; here “often” (OLD 2)

¹¹ *increpātiō, ōnis, f.:* “rebuking” (LL).

¹² *dūcō, dūcere, dūxī, ductum:* (of a man) “lead home as a wife, marry” (often *domum ducere*).

¹³ *astruō, astruere, astruxī, astructum:* “build on, add” (CL); “demonstrate” (ML).

¹⁴ *suffundō, suffundere, suffudī, suffusum:* “fill the complexion (with color)” (OLD 3c); “make blush” (LL).

25.3 (76.460) Idem in eodem: “Cicero,” inquit, “rogatus ab Hyrtio, ut post repudium¹ Therentie, sororem eius duceret, omnino² facere supersedit,³ dicens non posse se et uxori et philosophie operam pariter dare.” Non ait: “operam dare,”⁴ sed adiunxit, “pariter,” nolens quicquam agere, quod studio equaretur⁵ philosophie.

Idem = Hieronymus.

Cicero ... rogatus ab Hyrtius: Aulus Hirtius, consul 43 BCE, was a correspondent of Cicero, but I don’t know if these letters survive.

post repudium Therentie: Cicero divorced his wife Terentia in 47 or 46 BCE.

operam ... dare: “apply oneself to (with dative; OLD *opera* 2b).

26.1 (76.467) “Vt autem hoc philosophici studii nunc omittam impedimentum, ipsum consule honeste conversationis⁶ statum. Que enim conventio⁷ sclarium ad pedissequas,⁸ scriptoriorum⁹ ad cunabula,¹⁰ librorum sive tabularum ad colos,¹¹ stilorum sive calamorum¹² ad fusos¹³? Quis denique, sacris vel philosophicis meditationibus intentus, pueriles vagitus,¹⁴ nutricum¹⁵ que hos mittigant nenias,¹⁶ tumultuosam familie tam in viris quam in feminis turbam, sustinere poterit?

“Vt autem etc. Abelard now quotes (or pretends to quote) Heloise in *oratio recta*. According to Andrée what follows is a quotation, from either a letter or a conversation.

ipsum consule honeste conversationis statum = *consule honeste ipsum statum conversationis*. *consule* is imperative, *honeste* is an adverb. *status conversationis* here means, in effect, “the realities of married life.”

ad pedissequas: “with female attendants” here presumably “nannies, nursemaids.” It seems slightly odd that the first thing that comes to Heloise’s mind is the relationships between scholars and caregivers.

nutricum que hos mittigant nenias = *nenias nutricum quae mittigant hos (vagitūs)*. The antecedent of *quae* is presumably *nenias*.

tumultuosam familie ... turbam = *tumultuosam turbam famili(a)e, tam in viris quam in viris*. *familia* here has its CL sense of “household,” referring especially to servants. In theory *tam in viris* puts the emphasis on male servants, but I wonder if this is not ironic; “Heloise” seems (again) to be very worried about the intrusion of women generally into the life of a scholar.

26.2 (76.475) Que etiam inhonestas¹⁷ illas parvulorum sordes¹⁸ assiduas tolerare valebit? Id, inquires, divites possunt, quorum palatia vel domus ample diversoria¹⁹ habent, quorum opulencia non sentit expensas, nec cotidianis sollicitudinibus cruciatur. Sed non est, inquam, hec conditio philosophorum que divitum, nec qui opibus student vel secularibus implicantur curis divinis, seu philosophicis vacabunt officiis.

Quae ... valebit: “Heloise” now turns to the situation of a wife and mother.

Sed non est ... que divitum = *Sed haec condicio philosophorum, inquam, non est (eadem condicio) quae divitum (est)*.

¹ *repudium*, (*i*)*ī*, n.: “divorce.”

² *omnino*: “absolutely.”

³ *supersedeō*, *supersedere*, *supersēdī*, *supersessum*: “abstain from” (+ inf. OLD 2b).

⁴ *operam dāre*: “apply oneself to” (+ dat.; OLD *opera* 2b).

⁵ *aequō* (1): “regard as equal in worth” (OLD 9); “equal, rival, match” (OLD 11).

⁶ *conversātiō*, *ōnis*, f.: “conduct, behavior” (OLD 3); “way of life” (ML).

⁷ *conventiō*, *ōnis*, f.: “agreement” (OLD 4); “meeting” (ML).

⁸ *pedisequa*, *ae*, f.: “female attendant.”

⁹ *scriptōrium*, *ī*, n.: “monastic writing-room” (ML).

¹⁰ *cūnābula*, *ōrum*, n. pl.: “cradle.”

¹¹ *colus*, *ī*, m.: “distaff” (used to hold raw wool in spinning)

¹² *calamus*, *ī*, m.: “reed; pen.”

¹³ *fūsus*, *ī*, m.: “spindle” (used in spinning wool).

¹⁴ *vāgītus*, *ūs*, m.: “wail, the cry (of a baby).”

¹⁵ *nūtrix*, *īcis*, f.: “wet-nurse.”

¹⁶ *nēnia*, *ae*, f.: “charm, jingle”; (in plural) “silly things, nonsense.”

¹⁷ *inhonestus*, *a*, *um*: “shameful, degrading.”

¹⁸ *sordēs*, *is*, f.: “dirt, filth.”

¹⁹ *dēuersōrium* or *dīuersōrium*, (*i*)*ī*, n.: “lodging, inn” (CL); “floor” (ML).

26.3 (77.483) Vnde et insignes olim¹ philosophorum, mundum² maxime contempnentes,³ nec tam relinquentes seculum⁴ quam fugientes, omnes sibi voluptates interdixerunt, ut in unius philosophie requiescerent amplexibus.⁵ Quorum unus et maximus Seneca, Lucilium instruens ait: ‘Non cum vaccaveris philosophandum est. Omnia negligenda sunt ut huic assideamus,⁶ cui nullum tempus satis magnum est. Non multum refert,⁷ utrum⁸ omittas philosophiam an intermittas. Non enim, ubi interrupta est, manet. Resistendum est occupationibus, nec explicande⁹ sunt sed submovende.’

‘Non cum vaccaveris philosophandum est etc.: Seneca, Epistulae Morales 72.3.

27.1 (77.493) “Quod nunc igitur apud nos amore Dei sustinent, qui vere monachi dicuntur, hoc desiderio philosophie, qui nobiles in gentibus¹⁰ extiterunt philosophi. In omni namque populo, tam gentili scilicet quam Iudaico sive Christiano, aliqui semper extiterunt fide seu morum honestate ceteris preminentes, et se a populo aliqua continentie vel abstinentie singularitate segregantes. Apud Iudeos quidem antiquitus¹¹ Nazarei, qui se Domino secundum legem consecrabant, sive filii prophetarum Helye vel Helysei sectatores, quos, beato attestante Iheronimo, monachos legimus in veteri Testamento.

Quod nunc ... philosophi = igitur (ei), qui (ut) nobiles philosophi extiterunt in gentibus, (sustinent) hoc desiderio philosophi(a)e, quod nunc (ei), qui vere monachi dicuntur, sustinent apud nos.

Nazarei: “the Nazarenes” are referred to in the Old Testament as particularly associated with Jewish rituals and as more abstemious than other Jews; they abstained from wine and did not cut their hair.

filii prophetarum Helye ve Helysei: “the sons of the prophets Elijah and Elisha, their followers.” See esp. I and II Kings. [I take it “sons of the prophets” is a Biblical expression for “followers.”]

beato attestante Iheronimo monachos: Jerome, *Ep.* 125.7 (p. 125) refers to the *filii prophetarum* mentioned in the Old Testament as “monks”: *filii prophetarum—quos monachos in veteri legimus testamento—aedificabant sibi casulas prope fluentia Iordanis et turbis urbium derelictis polenta et herbis agrestibus victitabant.*

¹ *olim*: “formerly, in olden times” (OLD 1a).

² *mundus*, *ī*, *m.*: “the heavens; the world” (CL); “the secular world, the world of sin” (vs. the Church, LL).

³ *contemnō*, *contemnere*, *contempsī*, *contemptum*: “look down on, scorn, despise.”

⁴ *saeculum*, *ī*, *n.*: “the present time” (OLD 3); “the world, worldliness” (LL).

⁵ *amplexus*, *ūs*, *m.*: “embrace.”

⁶ *assideō*, *assidēre*, *assēdī*, *assessum*: “pay attention to” (+ dat. OLD 4).

⁷ *rēfert*, *rēferre*, *rētulit*: “it makes a difference, it is important.”

⁸ *utrum*: “whether” (introduces the first alternative in a disjunctive sentence, the second being introduced by *an*).

⁹ *explicō* (1): “free from creases, folds, etc.” Here perhaps “make room for” (OLD 4b).

¹⁰ *gens*, *gentis*, *m.*: “tribe, race”; in pl. “gentiles” or “heathens” (LL).

¹¹ *antiquitus*: “long ago.”

27.2 (77.504) “Novissime¹ autem tres ille philosophie secte, quas Iosephus in libro Antiquitatum distinguens, alios Phariseos, alios Saduceos, alios nominat Esseos. Apud nos vero monachi, qui videlicet aut communem apostolorum vitam, aut priorem illam et solitariam Iohannis imitantur. Apud gentiles autem, ut dictum est, philosophi. Non enim sapientie vel philosophie nomen tam ad scientie perceptionem quam ad vite religionem referebant, sicut ab ipso etiam huius nominis ortu didicimus,² ipsorum quoque testimonio sanctorum.

novissime: either the word here means “more recently” (not CL), or Abelard sees the world of the *New* Testament as very recent.

Iosephus ... Esseos: Josephus (CE 37-100) discusses (in Greek) the three Jewish sects prominent in the 1st Century CE, the Pharisees, the Sadducees, and the Essenes (*Jewish Antiquities* 18.1.11). [When was Josephus translated into Latin? Of course Heloise knew Greek; but still.]

Apud nos vero monachi: supply *extiterunt*, as in the first sentence of 27.

qui videlicet ... imitantur = *qui videlicet aut (imittantur) communem vitam apostolorum, aut imittantur illam (vitam) et solitariam (vitam) Iohannis*. The Apostles are seen as the models for monks and nuns living in religious communities, John the Baptist as the model for anchorites (hermits).

Apud gentiles: again, supply *extiterunt*.

Non enim sapientie ... didicimus: the word *philosophia* means “love of wisdom” in Greek, and thus allows Heloise to infer that it originally referred *ad religionem vit(a)e* rather than *ad perceptionem scienti(a)e*.

ipsorum ... sanctorum: explained in what follows; the *sancti* are the church fathers.

27.3 (77.513) “Vnde et illud est beati Augustini, VIII de Civitate Dei libro, genera quidem philosophorum distinguuntis: ‘Italicum genus actorem habuit Phitagoram Samium, a quo et fertur ipsum philosophie nomen exortum. Nam cum antea sapientes appellarentur, qui modo quodam laudabilis vite aliis prestare videbantur, iste interrogatus, quid profiteretur, philosophum se esse respondit, id est studiosum vel amatorem sapientie, quoniam sapientem profiteri arrogantissimum videbatur.’ Hoc itaque loco cum dicitur: ‘qui modo quodam laudabilis vite aliis prestare videbantur,’ et cetera, aperte monstratur sapientes gentium, id est philosophos, ex laude³ vite potius quam scientie sic esse nominatos. Quam sobrie⁴ autem atque continenter ipsi vixerint, non est nostrum⁵ modo⁶ ex exemplis colligere, ne Minervam ipsam videar docere.

Vnde est illud: “from among which (i.e. the *sancti*, the church fathers) there is this (passage).” Augustine, *De Civitate Dei* 8.2.

actorem (ML) = (CL) *auctorem*.

Phitagoram (ML) = (CL) *Pythagoram*.

et fertur = *etiam ferunt*.

modo quodam laudabilis vite = *quodam modo laudabilis vit(a)e*.

Hoc itaque loco cum dicitur = *itaque cum dicitur hoc loco*.

ne Minervam ipsam videar docere: roughly “so as not to preach to the choir.” The proverb is in Cicero, Jerome, Boethius and contemporaries of Heloise and Abelard. See Samuel Singer, *Thesaurus proverbiorum medii aevi: Lexikon der Sprichwörter des romanisch-germanischen Mittelalters* (1966).

¹ *nouissimē*: “very recently, lately.”

² *discō, discere, didicī*: “learn.”

³ *laus, laudis*, f.: “praise.”

⁴ *sōbriē*: “moderately.”

⁵ *nostrum est*: “it is my task” (OLD *noster* 8a).

⁶ *modo*: “just now” (OLD 5b).

28.1 (78.528) “Si autem sic laici gentilesque vixerint, nulla scilicet professione religionis astricti, quid te clericum atque canonicum facere oportet, ne divinis officiis turpes preferas voluptates, ne te precipitem¹ hec Caribdis absorbeat, ne obcenitatibus istis te impudenter atque irrevocabiliter immergas? Qui, si clerici prerogativam non curas, philosophi saltem² defende dignitatem. Si reverentia Dei contempnitur, amor saltem honestatis impudentiam³ temperet.

Si autem ... vixerint, ... quid ... oportet. sic = *sobrie et continenter*. si ... vixerint ... quid ... oportet is presumably a mixed condition, with perfect subjunctive in the protasis (“if they have lived”) and present indicative in the apodosis (“what should you do?”). **te clericum et canonicum** = *te, (ut) clericum et canonicum*. Abelard was not ordained as a priest until later, when he became abbot of Saint-Gildas, but at this time he was presumably a *clericus* in minor orders (sexton, reader, exorcist, or acolyte), and as a teacher he should have been *canonicus*, a canon in the cathedral to which the school was attached (Andrée).

ne ... preferas, ne ... absorbeat: negative purpose clauses. **Caribdis** = *Charybdis*, *is, f.*, the famous whirlpool in the Straits of Messene, between Sicily and Italy (not a sea monster, *pace* Andrée). Used in CL of a “voracious or cruel” person (OLD); used as an image of sensuality in Abelard’s 4th Letter to Heloise (Levitan). [and surely elsewhere in Medieval literature?]

28.2 (78.536) Memento⁴ Socratem uxorum⁵ fuisse, et quam fedo⁶ casu hanc philosophie labem⁷ ipse primo luerit,⁸ ut deinceps ceteri exemplo eius cautiores efficerentur. Quod nec ipse preterit Iheronimus, ita in primo Contra Jovinianum de ipso scribens Socrate: ‘Quodam autem tempore, cum infinita convitia⁹ ex superiori loco ingerenti Xanthippe restitisset, aqua profusus immunda, nichil respondit amplius quam, capite detergo: “Sciebam,” inquit, “futurum ut ista tonitrua¹⁰ ymber¹¹ sequeretur.” ’

Memento: “remember”; the future 2nd person singular imperative is the regular imperative form for *meminī*. Socrates was married to Xanthippe, famous (as we shall see) as a scold.

et quam fedo casu ... luerit = *et (memento) quam f(o)edo casu ipse (= Socrates) primo luerit hanc labem philosophi(a)e*.

nec ipse preterit = *ipse dicit*.

in primo Contra Jovinianum: Jerome, *Adversus Iovinianum* 1.48 (291 B-C).

cum infinita convitia ... restitisset = *cum (ipse) restitisset Xanthipp(a)e ingerenti infinita convitia (= convicia) ex superiore loco*. Xanthippe was yelling at him out of an upstairs window.

aqua profusus immunda = *profusus aquā immundā*.

“Sciebam ... sequeretur.” = “*Sciebam,*” *inquit,* “*futurum esse ut ymber (= imber) sequeretur ista tonitrua.*” *futurum* (or *fore*) + *ut* is one way express an indirect statement in the future (CL).

¹ *praeceps, praecipitis*: “plunging headlong.”

² *saltem*: “at least.”

³ *impudentia, ae, f.*: “shamelessness, immodesty.”

⁴ *meminī, meminisse*: “remember” (perfect with present force).

⁵ *uxor* (1): “be married” (ML).

⁶ *foedus, a, um*: “foul, loathesome.”

⁷ *lābēs, is, f.*: “fall”; “disgrace, dishonor” (OLD 5).

⁸ *luō, luere, luī*: “pay for; atone for.”

⁹ *convīcium, (i)ī, n.*: “insult, abuse.”

¹⁰ *tonitrus, ūs, m.* (but acc. pl. *tonitrua* once in CL): “thunder.”

¹¹ *imber, imbris, m.*: “rain.”

29.1 (73.545) Addebat denique ipsa et quam periculosum mihi esset eam reducere, et quam sibi carius existeret, mihiq̄ue honestius amicam dici quam uxorem, ut me ei sola gratia conservaret, non vis aliqua vinculi nuptialis constringeret, tantoque nos ipsos ad tempus separatos gratiora de conventu¹ nostro percipere² gaudia, quanto rariora. Hec et similia persuadens seu dissuadens, cum meam deflectere non posset stultitiam, nec me sustineret offendere, suspirans vehementer et lacrimans perorationem suam tali fine terminavit: “Vnum,” inquit, “ad ultimum restat,³ ut, in perditione duorum, minor non succedat⁴ dolor, quam precessit amor.” Nec in hoc ei, sicut universus agnovit mundus, prophecie defuit spiritus.

quam sibi carius ... quam uxorem = (*addebat*) et quam carius sibi existeret (= *esset*) dici amicam quam (*dici*) uxorem, mihiq̄ue (*quam*) honestius (*eam dici amicam quam uxorem*).

ut me etc.: presumably a result clause, explaining the consequence of Heloise being *amica* rather than *uxor*.

tantoque nos ipsos ... quanto rariora = (*et addebat*) nos ipsos, ad tempus (*CL in tempus*) separatos, percipere tanto gratiora de conventu nostro quanto rariora. Although they would be separated at times (*ad tempus*) their pleasures when getting together (*de conventu nostro*) would be greater because they would be more rare. *ad tempus* in CL means “punctually” (OLD 8e); here it must mean “at times.”

ut ... non succedat ... precessit amor = *ut non minor dolor succedat, in perditione (nostrum) duorum, quam amor precessit*. **succedat** is presumably jussive (or potential?) subjunctive, and presumably ironic; Heloise doesn’t *want* there to be as much pain as there has already been pleasure, but she accepts that it might be inevitable.

nec in hoc ei ... spiritus = *nec in hoc (= in hac re) spiritus propheci(ae) defuit ei (= Heloysae), sicut univ(er)us mundus agnovit*.

29.2 (79.559) Nato itaque parvulo nostro, sorori mee commendato, Parisius occulte revertimur, et, post paucos dies, nocte secretis orationum⁵ vigiliis in quadam ecclesia celebratis, ibidem, summo mane,⁶ avunculo eius atque quibusdam nostris vel ipsius amicis assistentibus, nuptiali benedictione confederamur.⁷ Moxque occulte divisim⁸ abscessimus,⁹ nec nos ulterius¹⁰ nisi raro latenterque vidimus, dissimulantes plurimum quod egeramus. Avunculus autem ipsius atque domestici eius, ignominie sue solatium querentes,¹¹ initum¹² matrimonium divulgare et fidem mihi super hoc datam violare ceperunt,¹³ illa autem econtra¹⁴ anathematizare¹⁵ et iurare, quia¹⁶ falsissimum esset. Vnde vehementer ille commotus crebris eam contumeliis¹⁷ afficiebat.

in quadam ecclesia: the church has never been identified; Clanchy 191 suggests it may have been the chapel of Stephen de Garlande in Notre Dame.

summo mane: “at the very break of day.” [Andrée says *mane* is an adverb, strengthened by another adverb, but I would have thought it was an indeclinable noun + adjective.] Weddings were supposed to take place in the daytime, so dawn would have been a good time for avoiding attention.

nostris vel ipsius amicis: i.e. “my friends or her friends”; *noster* is clearly and editorial “we.”

fidem mihi super hoc datam: i.e. the uncle had promised to keep the marriage secret.

illa = *Heloysa*.

¹ *conventus*, *ūs*, m. “the action of coming together” (OLD 1).

² *percipiō*, *percipere*, *percēpī*, *perceptum*: “acquire, reap” (OLD 3).

³ *restō* (1): “remain; be left unchanged.”

⁴ *succēdō*, *succēdere*, *succēsī*, *successum*: “come after” (in a temporal sense; OLD 6).

⁵ *orātiō*, *ōnis*, f.: “prayer” (LL).

⁶ *mane*: “in the morning” (adverb and indeclinable neuter noun).

⁷ *conföderō* (1): “join in a union” (LL).

⁸ *divīsīm*: “separately” (LL).

⁹ *abscēdō*, *abscēdere*, *abscēsī*, *abscessum*: “go away.”

¹⁰ *ulterius*: “any more, any longer” (OLD 2b).

¹¹ *quaerō*, *quaerere*, *quaesīvī*, *quaesitum*: “seek.”

¹² *ineō*, *inīre*, *inīī*, *initum*: “enter.”

¹³ *coeptī* (two syllables), *coepisse*, *coeptum*: “begin” (perfect with present meaning).

¹⁴ *ēcontrā* or *ē contrā*: “on the contrary” (LL).

¹⁵ *anathematizō* (1): “curse” (LL).

¹⁶ *quia*: “because”; (with verb of saying) “that” (rare but CL).

¹⁷ *contumēlia*, *ae*, f.: “insult.”

30.1 (79.573) Quod cum ego cognovissem, transmisi eam ad abbatiam quandam sanctimonialium prope Parisius, que Argenteolum appellatur, ubi ipsa olim puellula¹ educata fuerat atque erudita, vestesque ei religionis, que conversationi² monastice convenirent, excepto velo,³ aptari⁴ feci, et his eam indui. Quo audito, avunculus et consanguinei seu affines eius opinati sunt me nunc sibi plurimum⁵ illuisse,⁶ et ab ea moniali⁷ facta me sic facile velle expedire.⁸

Quod ... cognovissem: *quod* refers to the events of the previous paragraph, and is the object of *cognovissem*.

transmisi eam ad abbatiam: for Abelard's right to do this, as her husband, see Clanchy 192.

Argenteolum: The convent of Saint Mary, at Argenteuil, about 10 miles north of Paris; it was one of the most prestigious convents in the area around Paris.

educata fuerat: "the use of perfect forms of *esse* to form compound tenses, *fui* for *sum*, *fueram* for *fuerat*, etc., was sanctioned by Donatus, *Ars minor*, 4, 361 (p. 594), and is widely employed in ML" (Andrée).

conversationi monastice = *conversationi monastic(a)e*.

excepto velo: sending Heloise to a convent "would ordinarily have signified an intention to dissolve the marriage," but Abelard's focus on the fact that she did not take the veil apparently suggests that he did not understand it this way (Levitan). Heloise's status "was not that of a full-fledged nun but of an associate" (Clanchy 193); the word for this was *conversans*.

et ab ea ... expedire = *et (opinati sunt) me velle facile expedire sic ab ea (= Helyosā) facta moniali*.

30.2 (79.581) Vnde vehementer indignati, et adversum me coniurati, nocte quadam quiescentem me atque dormientem in secreta⁹ hospicii¹⁰ mei camera,¹¹ quodam mihi serviente¹² per pecuniam corrupto, crudelissima et pudentissima ultione¹³ punierunt, et quam summa ammiratione¹⁴ mundus exceperat,¹⁵ eis videlicet corporis mei partibus amputatis, quibus id quod plangebant¹⁶ commiseram. Quibus mox in fugam conversis, duo, qui comprehendi potuerunt, oculis et genitalibus privati sunt. Quorum alter ille fuit supradictus serviens, qui, cum in obsequio¹⁷ meo mecum maneret, cupiditate ad proditionem¹⁸ ductus est.

quodam ... corrupto: ablative absolute.

crudelissima et pudentissima ultione: "with vengeance that was extremely cruel and extremely wicked." *pudens* in CL means "decent" or "modest," and I can find no evidence that it means anything different in ML. But scholars do not seem to read *impudentissima*.

eis videlicet ... amputatis: ablative absolute.

id quod plangebant: "that (crime) which they were lamenting," i.e. the seduction of Heloise.

Quibus ... conversis: ablative absolute, with the relative referring back to the subject of *punierunt*, presumably "hired henchmen" of Fulbert (Andrée).

qui potuerunt comprehendi: presumably by supporters of Abelard.

oculis et genitalibus privati sunt: "apparently not an uncommon punishment for treason" (Andrée). [Though I don't see what treason has to do with it.]

cum ... maneret: a concessive or a circumstantial *cum* clause.

¹ *puellula*, ae, f.: "young girl."

² *conversātiō*, ōnis, f.: "conduct" (CL), i.e. "way of life."

³ *vēlum*, ī, n.: "sail; sheet; curtain"; "a nun's veil" (ML).

⁴ *aptō* (1): "fit; prepare."

⁵ *plūrimum*: "most of all, greatly."

⁶ *illūdō*, *illūdere*, *illūsi*, *illūsum*: either "fool around" or "deceive" (OLD 1 and 2).

⁷ *monialis*, f.: "nun" (LL; Niermeyer doesn't give quantities).

⁸ *expediō*, *expedire*, *expediū* or *ī*, *expeditum*: "free, disentangle."

⁹ *sēcrētus*, a, um: "separate; private" (not "secret").

¹⁰ *hospitium*, (i)ī, n.: "lodgings" (OLD 3b).

¹¹ *camera* (CL also *camara*), ae, f.: "vault" (CL); "room" (ML).

¹² *serviens,ntis*, m./f.: "servant" (ML).

¹³ *ultiō*, ōnis, f.: "vengeance."

¹⁴ *admīrātiō*, ōnis, f.: "wonder, surprise" (OLD 1; "admiration" is OLD 2).

¹⁵ *excipiō*, *excipere*, *excēpī*, *exceptum*: "pick up, catch" (of spoken words, OLD 11a); "gather" (information, OLD 11b).

¹⁶ *plangō*, *plangere*, *planxī*, *planctum*: "bewail, mourn for."

¹⁷ *obsequium*, (i)ī, m.: "obedience, allegiance" (OLD 3), i.e. "service, employment."

¹⁸ *prōditiō*, ōnis, f.: "betrayal."

De plaga¹ illa corporis.

31.1 (80.592) Mane² autem facto tota ad me civitas congregata, quanta stuperet ammiratione, quanta se affligeret lamentatione, quanto me clamore vexarent, quanto planctu perturbarent, difficile, immo impossibile est exprimi. Maxime vero clerici, ac precipue³ scolares nostri, intolerabilibus me lamentis et eiulatibus⁴ cruciabant,⁵ ut multo amplius ex eorum compassione quam ex vulneris lederer⁶ passione,⁷ et plus erubescantiam⁸ quam plagam⁹ sentirem, et pudore magis quam dolore affligerer.¹⁰

tota ... civitas congregata ... vexarent. With *vexarent* the verb changes to plural: “a *constructio ad sensum* moving from a reflexive object when the predicate is singular to Abelard as object when the predicate is plural (extrapolated from the collective notion inherent in *civitas*)”

(Andrée). [I get the *constructio ad sensum*, but don’t understand what he means about the *objects*.]

multo amplius ... quam; plus ... quam; magis quam: “tricolon of comparatives, moving gradually closer together” (Andrée).

31. (80.600) Occurrebat animo, quanta modo¹¹ gloria pollebam,¹² quam facili et turpi casu hec humiliata, immo penitus esset extincta, quam iusto Dei iudicio in illa corporis mei portione plecterer,¹³ in qua deliqueram;¹⁴ quam iusta proditiōe¹⁵ is, quem antea prodideram, vicem¹⁶ mihi retulisset; quanta laude mei emuli¹⁷ tam manifestam equitatem¹⁸ efferrent,¹⁹ quantam perpetui doloris contritionem²⁰ plaga hec parentibus meis et amicis esset collatura; quanta dilatatione²¹ hec singularis infamia universum mundum esset occupatura; qua²² mihi ulterius via pateret;²³ qua fronte in publicum prodirem,²⁴ omnium digitis demonstrandus, omnium linguis corrodendus,²⁵ omnibus monstruosum spectaculum futurus.

Occurrebat animo: i.e. “I kept thinking about”; introduced nine indirect questions.

quanta ... pollebam = *quantā gloriā modo pollebam*. The indicative is “puzzling” (Andrée).

quam facili et turpi casu: “with what a banal and a disgraceful accident” (see Andrée).

hec humiliata ... extincta = *h(a)ec (gloria) humiliata (esset), immo extincta esset*.

plaga ... esset occupatura: for the first periphrastic conjugation see AG § 195.

qua mihi ulterius via pateret = *quā viā pateret mihi ulterius*.

¹ *plāga*, ae, f.: “blow”; “wound.”

² *māne* (here indeclinable neuter noun): “morning.”

³ *praecipue*: “particularly, especially.”

⁴ *eiulātus*, ūs, m. “wailing, shrieking.”

⁵ *cruciō* (1): “torture”; “cause mental anguish” (to, OLD 3).

⁶ *laedō*, *laedere*, *laesi*, *laesum*: “harm, damage.”

⁷ *passiō*, *ōnis*, f.: “suffering” (LL).

⁸ *erubescantia*, ae, f.: “blushing” (LL).

⁹ *plaga*, ae, f.: “blow”; “wound.”

¹⁰ *affligō*, *affligere*, *afflīxi*, *afflictum*: “vex, afflict” (OLD 6).

¹¹ *modo*: “only recently, just now” (OLD 5).

¹² *polleō*, *pollēre*: “have importance, carry weight.”

¹³ *plectō*, *plectere*: “punish” (only found in passive).

¹⁴ *dēlinquō*, *dēlinquere*, *dēlīquī*, *dēlictum*: “do wrong, err” (OLD 2).

¹⁵ *prōditiō*, *ōnis*, f.: “betrayal.”

¹⁶ *vicis*, is, f. “repayment” (of an injury or a favor, OLD 5).

¹⁷ *aemulus*, ī, m.: “rival.”

¹⁸ *aequitās*, *ātis*, f.: “justice” (OLD 4).

¹⁹ *efferō*, *efferre*, *extulī*, *exlātum*: “highlight, exaggerate” (OLD 12).

²⁰ *contritiō*, *ōnis*, f.: “grief, dismay.”

²¹ *dilātiō*, *ōnis*, f. “delay; interval of space” (CL); here apparently “diffusion” (not in LS or Niermeyer).

²² *quā*: “in what direction” (adverb).

²³ *pateō*, *patēre*, *patui*: “be open.”

²⁴ *prōdeō*, *prōdīre*, *prōdī*, *prōditum*: “proceed, come forth.”

²⁵ *corrōdō* (1): “gnaw, chew up.”

32. (80.613) Nec me etiam parum¹ confundeat,² quod, secundum³ occidentem⁴ legis litteram, tanta sit apud Deum eunuchorum⁵ abominatio,⁶ ut homines amputatis vel attritis⁷ testiculis eunuchizati⁸ intrare ecclesiam, tanquam⁹ olentes¹⁰ et immundi,¹¹ prohibeantur, et, in sacrificio quoque, talia penitus animalia respuantur.¹² Liber Numeri, capitulo LXXIII: *Omne animal, quod est contritis*,¹³ *vel tonsis*,¹⁴ *vel sectis*¹⁵ *ablatisque testiculis, non offeretis Domino*; Deuteronomii, capitulo XXI: *Non intrabit eunuchus, atritis vel amputatis testiculis, et absciso veretro*,¹⁶ *ecclesiam Dei*.

secundum occidentem legis litteram: cf. II. Cor. 3:6: *littera enim occidit, Spiritus autem vivificat*.

Liber Numeri, capitulo LXXIII: [there is no Numbers 74. The correct reference is Leviticus 22:24: “Ye shall not offer unto the Lord that which is bruised, or crushed, or broken, or cut; neither shall ye make any offering thereof in your land.”]

contritis, vel tonsis, vel sectis ablatisque testiculis: ablative of description; the participles all modify *testiculis*.

Deuteronomii, capitulo XXI: the correct reference is Deuteronomy 23:1: “He that is wounded in the stones, or hath his privy member cut off, shall not enter into the congregation of the Lord.”

33.1 (80.624) In tam misera me contritione¹⁷ positum, confusio—fateor—pudoris potius quam devotio conversionis ad monastichorum¹⁸ latibula¹⁹ claustrorum²⁰ compulit. Illa tamen, prius ad imperium nostrum sponte²¹ velata,²² et monasterium ingressa. Ambo²³ itaque simul sacrum habitum²⁴ suscepimus, ego quidem in abbatia sancti Dyonisii, illa in monasterio Argenteoli supradicto.

In tam misera ... positum = *me positum in tam misera contritione*.

Illā = *Heloyssa*.

sponte: CL would be *suā sponte*, “of her own accord”; *sponte* in CL means “deliberately.”

in abbatia sancti Dyonisii: The abbey of Saint-Denis, a few miles north of Paris.

in monasterio Argenteoli supradicto: above, ch. 30.

¹ *parum*: “not enough.”

² *confundō, confundere, confūdī, confūsum*: “disturb, dismay” (OLD 10).

³ *secundum* (prep. + acc.): “according to.”

⁴ *occidō, occidere, occidī, occisum*: “kill, cause death.”

⁵ *eunūchus, ī, m.*: “eunuch” (εὐνοῦχος).

⁶ *abōminātiō, ōnisi, f.*: “abomination” (LL).

⁷ *atterō, atterere, attritū, attritum*: “wear away; weaken.”

⁸ *eunūchizātus, a, um*: “made into a eunuch” (LL).

⁹ *tamquam*: “as though.”

¹⁰ *oleō, olēre, oluī*: “smell, give off a smell.”

¹¹ *immundus, a, um*: “unclean.”

¹² *respuō, respuere*: “reject.”

¹³ *conterō, conterere, contritū, contritum*: “grind; wear out.”

¹⁴ *tondeō, tondēre, (totondī), tonsum*: “cut, clip.”

¹⁵ *secō, secāre, secuī, sectum*: “sever, cut off.”

¹⁶ *verētrum, ī, n.*: “the penis.”

¹⁷ *contritū, ōnis, f.*: “grief, dismay.”

¹⁸ *monasticus, a, um*: “monastic” (ML).

¹⁹ *latibulum, ī, n.*: “hiding place, lair.”

²⁰ *claustrum, ī, n.*: “cage, prison” (OLD 2); monastic building, cloister (ML).

²¹ *spons, spontis, f.*: “will, volition.”

²² *velō* (1): “cover, veil over.”

²³ *ambō, ae, o* (plural): both

²⁴ *habitus, ūs, m.*: “style of dress” (OLD 3).

33.2 (81.629) Que quidem,¹ memini, cum eius adolescentiam a iugo² monastice regule tanquam intolerabili pena³ plurimi frustra⁴ deterrerent ei compacientes,⁵ in illam Cornelie querimoniam, inter lacrimas et singultus,⁶ prout⁷ poterat, prorumpens ait:

Quae quidem = *Heloysa quidem*.

cum eius adolescentiam ... compacientes = *cum plurimi, compacientes ei [= Helyosae] deterrerent adolescentiam eius a iugo monastic(e) regul(a)e, tanquam intolerabili p(o)enā*.

in illam Cornelie querimoniam: Cornelia was the wife of Pompey; the lament quoted is from Lucan, *Pharsalia* 8.94-98, in which Cornelia bewails Pompey's defeat at the battle of Pharsalus and his impending murder of her husband on the shores of Egypt. Presumably Abelard is imagining that Heloise would say the kinds of things Cornelia says in Lucan, rather than claiming that she actually said them.

“O maxime coniux!⁸
O thalamis⁹ indigne¹⁰ meis! Hoc iuris habebat
in tantum fortuna capud? Cur impia nupsi,
si miserum factura fui? Nunc accipe penas,¹¹
sed quas sponte luam.¹²”

Atque in his verbis ad altare mox properat, et confestim ab episcopo benedictum velum ab altari tulit, et se monastice professioni coram¹³ omnibus alligavit.

O thalamis indigne meis! = *O (coniux) indigne meis thalamis*.

Hoc iuris ... / fortuna capud = *habebat fortuna hoc iuris in tantum capud [CL caput]*. *iuris* is partitive genitive. *caput* can mean “leader” (OLD 13), though the word is ironic, since Pompey famously was decapitated after his murder.

Cur impia nupsi: i.e. “why did I wrongly marry you?”

si miserum factura fui = *si (te) miserum factura fui*. [I can't remember why Cornelia would say that all this was *her* fault.]

Nunc accipe penas, sed quas sponte luam = *nunc accipe poenas quas (tamen) sponte luam*. She is happy to be punished for wronging him.

et confestim ab episcopo benedictum velum ab altari tulit: “If these really were the circumstances, the bishop should have suspended the proceedings, not because Heloise had quoted a pagan poet instead of a Christian prayer, but rather because she was evidently in no state of mind to make her final vows” (Clanchy 166).

¹ *quidem*: “indeed” (emphasizing the preceding word).

² *iugum*, *ī*, n.: “yoke.”

³ *poena*, *ae*, f.: “punishment.”

⁴ *frustrā*: “in vain, to no avail.”

⁵ *compator*, *compatī*, *compassus*: “to suffer with, feel compassion for” (LL).

⁶ *singultus*, *ūs*, f.: “sob.”

⁷ *prout*: “to the extent that” (OLD 2).

⁸ *coniunx* or *coniux*, *ugis*, m./f.: “spouse.”

⁹ *thalamus*, *ī*, m.: “bedroom.”

¹⁰ *indignus*, *a*, *um*: “unworthy” (+ gen. or abl.).

¹¹ *poena*, *ae*, f.: “punishment.”

¹² *luō*, *luere*: “suffer by way of expiation” (esp. with *poenas*; OLD 1a).

¹³ *cōram*: “in the presence of, before” (prep. + abl.).

34. (81.642) Vix autem de vulnere adhuc¹ convalueram,² cum, ad me confluentes, clerici tam ab abbate³ nostro quam a me ipso continuis supplicationibus efflagitabant,⁴ quatinus,⁵ quod hucusque⁶ pecunie vel laudis cupiditate egeram, nunc amore Dei operam⁷ studio darem, attendens quod mihi fuerat a Domino talentum commissum ab ipso esse cum usuris exigendum, et qui divitibus⁸ maxime hucusque intenderam,⁹ pauperibus erudiendis amodo¹⁰ studerem; et ob hoc maxime dominica manu me nunc tactum esse cognoscerem, quo liberius, a carnalibus illecebris et tumultuosa vita seculi abstractus, studio litterarum vaccarem, nec tam mundi quam Dei vere philosophus fierem.

quod hucusque ... cupiditate egeram = *(illud) quod hucusque egeram cupiditate pecuni(a)e vel laudis. nunc amore Dei ... darem* = *nunc operam dare studio [dative] amore Dei.*

attendens

quod ... exigendum = *talentum quod commissum fuerat mihi a Domino exigendum esse ab ipso (Domino) cum usuris.* The reference is to the parable of the servants and the talents, Matthew 25:14-30.

et ob hoc ... cognoscerem = *et cognoscerem me nunc tactum esse dominica manu ob hoc maxime.*

quo liberius: "in order that ... more freely." *quō* + a comparative adverb and the subjunctive is a good CL type of purpose clause.

35.1 (81.654) Erat autem abbatia illa nostra, ad quam me contuleram, secularis admodum vite atque turpissime, cuius abbas ipse quo ceteris prelatione¹¹ maior, tanto vita deterior atque infamia notior erat. Quorum quidem intolerabiles spurcitas¹² ego, frequenter atque vehementer, modo privatim modo publice, redarguens,¹³ omnibus me, supra modum,¹⁴ onerosum atque odiosum effeci. Qui, ad cotidianam discipulorum nostrorum instantiam¹⁵ maxime gavisus,¹⁶ occasionem nacti sunt,¹⁷ qua me a se removerent.

Erat autem abbatia ... turpissime = *illa autem abbatia, ad quam me contuleram, erat admodum secularis atque turpissim(ae)e vit(a)e. vitae* (with *secularis atque turpissime*) is genitive quality (UK genitive of description). The abbey is St. Denis, see above ch. 33.

cuius abbas: Adam, abbot of St. Denis from 1094 to 1122.

quo ceteris ... notior erat = *quo maior ceteris (erat) pr(a)latione, tanto erat deterior vitā et notior infamiā.* *ceteris* is ablative of comparison; *prelatione, vita, and infamia* are ablatives of means.

Quorum ... spurcitas ... omnibus ... effeci: the antecedent of *quorum* is *omnibus*.

Qui ... removerent = *Qui, maxime gavisus ad cotidianam instantiam nostrorum discipulorum, occasionem nacti sunt, qua removerent me a se.* CL would be *gavisus in cotidianum instantiam*. It is not clear to me why Abelard's enemies would be *happy* about his students' enthusiasm, or why it would have given them the opportunity to remove him.

¹ *adhuc*: "still."

² *convalescō, convalescere, convalui*: "recover" (medically; OLD 2).

³ *abbās, ātis, m.*: "abbot" (LL).

⁴ *efflagitō* (1): "ask for insistently, demand."

⁵ *quātenus*: "so that" (OLD 9; used in ML like *ut* to introduce purpose clauses).

⁶ *hucusque*: "to this point, thus far."

⁷ *operam dare*: "pay attention to" (+ dat.).

⁸ *dīves, itis, m.*: "rich man."

⁹ *intendō, intendere, intendī, intentum*: "direct one's efforts (to), apply oneself (to)" (OLD 11).

¹⁰ *amodo*: "from this time forward, henceforth" (LL).

¹¹ *praelātiō, ōnis, f.*: "the act of giving precedence" (CL); "power, authority" (ML).

¹² *spurcitia, ae, f.*: "filth, dirt; moral turpitude."

¹³ *redarguō, redarguere*: "convict."

¹⁴ *supra modum*: "excessively" (OLD 4b).

¹⁵ *instantia, ae, f.*: "earnestness, insistence" (OLD 2).

¹⁶ *gaudeō, gaudēre, gāuīsus*: "be pleased, rejoice."

¹⁷ *nanciscor, nanciscī, nactus*: "gain possession of, acquire."

c. AD 1119

35.2 (82.663) Diu itaque illis instantibus atque importune¹ pulsantibus, abbate² quoque nostro et fratribus intervenientibus, ad cellam quandam recessi, scolis³ more solito vaccaturus. Ad quas quidem tanta scolarium multitudo confluit, ut nec locus ospitiis⁴ nec terra sufficeret alimentis.

illis = *discipulis meis*.

ad cellam: "to a priory" (Levitan, but *cella* surely suggests something more private). Levitan says it was probably near Nogent-sur-Seine, in Champagne, where Abelard would later found his monastery "The Paraclete." See Clanchy 229-230.

scolis more solito vaccaturus: "in order to have the leisure for my students, in the usual way."

36.1 (82.668) Vbi, quod professioni mee convenientius erat, sacre plurimum lectioni studium intendens, secularium artium disciplinam, quibus amplius assuetus fueram,⁵ et quas a me plurimum requirebant, non penitus abieci, sed de his quasi hamum⁶ quendam fabricavi, quo illos philosophico sapore⁷ inescatos⁸ ad vere philosophie lectionem attraherem, sicut et summum Christianorum philosophorum Origenem consuevisse Hystoria meminit ecclesiastica.

quod professioni mee conventius erat = (*id*) quod conventius erat professioni me(a)e.

sacre plurimum lectioni studium intendens = intendens plurimum (meum) studium sacr(a)e lectioni.

secularium artium disciplinam: i.e. the study of logic, Abelard's original intellectual forte.

requirebant: *sc. discipuli*.

de his = *de secularibus artibus*.

sicut et summum ... ecclesiastica = *sicut Historia Ecclesiastica meminit Origenem, summum Christianorum philosophorum, consuevisse.*

Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History* 6.8ff, translated from the Greek by Rufinus (4th cent.). Origen (ca. 185-254) was an important church father; despite condemnations for heresy his works had been translated into Latin and were well known in the west.

36.2 (82.676) Cum autem in divina scriptura non minorem mihi gratiam⁹ quam in seculari Dominus contulisse videretur, ceperunt admodum ex utraque lectione scole¹⁰ nostre multiplicari et cetere omnes vehementer attenuari.

Cum autem ... contulisse videretur = *Cum autem Dominus videretur contulisse mihi non minorem gratiam in divina scriptura quam in seculari (lectione).*

ceperunt admodum ... vehementer attentuari = *nostr(a) sc(h)ol(a)e c(o)eperunt admodum multiplicari ex utraque lectione, et omnes ceter(a)e sc(h)ol(a)e (co)eperunt vehementer attenuari.* ex utraque lectione means "by lecturing on both logic and theology."

¹ *importūnē*: "unseasonably, inconveniently."

² *abbās, ātis*, m. "abbot" (LL).

³ *schola, ae*, f.: "school"; (ML) "student."

⁴ *hospitium, (i)ī*, n.: "guest accommodation" (OLD 3).

⁵ *assuēscō, assuēscere, assuēvī, assuētum*: "become accustomed" (OLD 2).

⁶ *hāmus, ī*, m. "hook; fish-hook."

⁷ *sapor, sapōris*, m.: "flavor, taste."

⁸ *inescō* (1): "fill with food, gorge" (OLD 2).

⁹ *gratia, ae*, f.: "popularly, esteem, credit" (OLD 5).

¹⁰ *schola, ae*, f.: "school"; (ML) "student."

36.3 (82.679) Vnde maxime magistrorum invidiam atque odium adversum me concitavi, qui in omnibus que poterant mihi derogantes, duo precipue¹ absenti mihi semper obieiebant:² quod scilicet proposito³ monachi valde sit contrarium secularium librorum studio detineri, et quod sine magistro ad magisterium⁴ divine lectionis accedere presumpsissem; ut sic videlicet omne mihi doctrine scolaris exercitium⁵ interdiceretur; ad quod incessanter⁶ episcopos, archiepiscopos, abbates, et quascunque poterant religiosi nominis personas, incitabant.

que poterant = *qu(a)e poterant*.

duo precipue ... obieiebant = *semper obieiebant praecipue duo* [neuter plural, substantivized] *mihi absenti*.

quod scilicet ... studio detineri = *quod scilicet (me) detineri studio s(a)ecularium librorum valde sit contrarium proposito monachi*. The subjunctive in this clause and the next one shows that Abelard is reporting the objections, not endorsing them. [Andrée says that *valde ... contrarium* is “impersonal, taking the indirect object *proposito*, and further qualified by the prolativ infinitive, *detineri*.” But I wouldn’t call that impersonal, I don’t think.]

ut sic videlicet ... interdiceretur = *ut sic videlicet omne exercitium sc(h)olaris doctrin(a)e mihi interdiceretur*. Purpose clause. *scolaris doctrina* must mean “teaching.”

De libro theologie sue et persecutione quam inde sustinuit a condiscipulis.

AD 1121

37.1 (82.690) Accidit⁷ autem mihi, ut ad ipsum fidei nostre fundamentum humane rationis similitudinibus disserendum primo me applicarem, et quendam theologie tractatum⁸ de unitate et trinitate divina, scolariis nostris componerem, qui humanas et philosophicas rationes requirebant, et plus que intelligi quam que dici possent efflagitabant,⁹ dicentes quidem verborum superfluum esse prolationem,¹⁰ quam intelligentia¹¹ non sequeretur, nec credi posse aliquid, nisi primitus¹² intellectum, et ridiculosum esse aliquem aliis predicare,¹³ quod nec ipse, nec illi quos doceret, intellectu capere possent, Domino ipso arguente quod ceci¹⁴ essent duces cecorum.

ut ad ipsum fidei ... applicarem = *ut primo applicarem me ad ipsum fundamentum nostr(a)e fidei disserendum, similitudinibus human(a) rationis*. He used analogies (*similitudines*) from human reason to expound the foundation of Christian faith. *ad ipsum fundamentum ... disserendum* is a gerundive expression purpose, with *applicarem*.

et quendam theologie tractatum: this was the *Theologia Summi Bonui*, subsequently revised twice; the text has been reconstructed by Constant Mews; Buytaert, E. and C. Mews, eds. *Petri Abaelardi Opera Theologica III*. Corpus Christianorum, 13. Turnhout, 1987.

scolariis nostris componerem, qui humanas et philosophicas rationes requirebant: Abelard surely *wanted* to write about the Trinity, even if what he says here about student demands is true.

et plus que ... efflagitabant = *et (scolares) efflagitabant plus (illa) qu(a)e (possent) intelligi quam (illa) qu(a)e possent dici*.

dicentes quidem ... non sequeretur = *dicentes quidem prolationem verborum, quam intelligentia non sequeretur, superfluum esse*. Clanchy 36 notes that this was Abelard’s view as well as that of his students; it was also “a reversal of the St Anselm’s of Canterbury’s rule that ‘Unless you believe, you shall not understand’” (Clanchy 266).

Domino ipso ... cecorum: “Let them alone: they be blind leaders of the blind. And if the blind lead the blind, both shall fall into the ditch” (Matthew 15:14).

¹*praecipue*: “particularly, especially.”

²*obicere, obieci, obieci*: “cite as grounds for disapproval, throw in one’s teeth.”

³*propositum, ī, n.*: “practice, way of life” (OLD 2).

⁴*magisterium, (i)ī, n.*: “teaching, instruction.”

⁵*exercitium, ī, n.*: “practice.”

⁶*incessanter*: “incessantly” (LL).

⁷*accidit ut + subj.*: “it happens/ it happened that” (OLD *accido* 7a).

⁸*tractatus, ūs, m.*: “treatment, discussion” (OLD 3); “sermon” (LL).

⁹*efflagitō* (1): “ask for insistently, demand.”

¹⁰*prolatiō, ōnis, f.*: “a putting forward (or examples), adducing.”

¹¹*intelligentia, ae, f.*: “understanding.”

¹²*primitus*: “first, to begin with.”

¹³*praedicō* (1): “proclaim” (CL); “preach” (the Gospel, LL).

¹⁴*caecus, a, um*: “blind.”

37.2 (83.703) Quem quidem tractatum, cum vidissent et legissent plurimi, cepit¹ in commune omnibus plurimum placere, quod in eo pariter omnibus satisfieri super hoc questionibus videbatur. Et quoniam questiones iste pre omnibus difficiles videbantur, quanto earum maior extiterat gravitas, tanto solutionis earum censebatur² maior subtilitas.

quod in eo ... videbatur = *quod in eo videbatur pariter satisfieri omnibus qu(a)estionibus super hoc*. **satisfieri** is an impersonal form of *satisfacio* (OLD), depending on the impersonal **videbatur**: “it seemed that there was satisfaction.” **super hoc**: apparently means “on the whole question of theology.”

quanto earum maior extiterat gravitas = *quanto gravitas earum extiterat maior*.
tanto solutionis ... subtilitas = *tanto subtilitas solutionis earum censebatur maior*. Clanchy 267 notes that Abelard must have known this was special pleading, given what comes next.

38.1 (83.708) Vnde emuli³ mei, vehementer accensi, concilium⁴ contra me congregaverunt, maxime duo illi antiqui insidiatores,⁵ Albericus scilicet et Lotulfus, qui iam defunctis magistris eorum et nostris, Guillhelmo scilicet atque Anselmo, post eos quasi regnare se solos appetebant, atque etiam ipsis tanquam heredes succedere.

antiqui insidiatores: *antiquus insidiator* is “a standard epithet for the devil” (Andrée).

Albericus ... Lotulfus: They had been Abelard’s colleagues at Laon, see 13.1. On the role of Roscelin, not mentioned by Abelard, see Clanchy 295.

Guillhelmo ... atque Anselmo: William of Champeaux died in 1121 (Andrée) or 1122 (Clanchy). Anselm of Laon died in 1117.

March, 1121

38.2 (83.714) Cum autem utrique⁶ Remis scholas regerent, crebris suggestionibus archiepiscopum suum Radulfum adversum me commoverunt, ut ascito Conano Prenestino episcopo, qui tunc legatione fungebatur in Gallia, conventiculum quoddam sub nomine concilii in Suesionensi civitate celebrarent, meque invitarent, quatenus⁷ illud opusculum, quod de Trinitate composueram, mecum afferrem. Et factum est ita.

Remis: “at Rheims.”

Radulfum: Raol of Rheims, archbishop from 1106 to 1124.

Conano Prenestino: Cono (or Conan), a Swabian, was bishop of Praeneste (modern Palestrina), an ally of William of Champeaux, and a supporter of the Gregorian reforms. He was “the most senior and formidable of all the papal legates,” though Abelard presents him as unlearned (Clanchy 295-296).

conventiculum quoddam sub nomine concilii: “a little meeting, which they grandly styled a council” (Levitan).

in Suesionensi civitate: at Soissons, about 60 miles north of Paris.

quatenus ... afferrem: *quatenus* + subj. = *ut* + subj.; rare in CL.

¹ *coepī* (two syllables), *coepisse*, *coeptum*: “begin” (perfect with present meaning).

² *censeō*, *censēre*, *censuī*, *cansum*: “appraise, value” (OLD 8).

³ *aemulus*, *ī*, m.: “rival, competitor.”

⁴ *concilium*, (*ij*)ī, n.: “assembly, council.”

⁵ *insidiātor*, *ōris*, m.: “one who lies in ambush.”

⁶ *uterque*, *utraque*, *utrumque*: “each” (of two).

⁷ *quātenus*: “up to that point”; here “so that” (OLD 9).

39.1 (83.721) Antequam autem illuc¹ pervenirem, duo illi predicti emuli nostri ita me in clero et populo diffamaverunt,² ut pene³ me populus paucosque, qui advenerant ex discipulis nostris, prima die nostri adventus,⁴ lapidarent,⁵ dicentes me tres deos predicare et scripsisse, sicut ipsis persuasum fuerat. Accessi autem, mox ut ad civitatem veni, ad legatum, eique libellum nostrum inspiciendum et diiudicandum tradidi, et me, si aliquid scripsissem aut dixissem quod a catholica fide dissentiret, paratum esse ad correctionem vel satisfactionem obtuli.⁶ Ille autem statim mihi precepit⁷ libellum ipsum archiepiscopo illisque emulis meis defferre, quatinus⁸ ipsi inde iudicarent, qui me super hoc accusabant, ut illud in me etiam compleretur: *Et inimici nostri sunt iudices*.

duo illi predicti emuli: Alberic and Lotulf.

ut pene me populus paucosque ... lapidarent = *ut p(a)ene populus lapidarent me paucosque, qui advenerant ex discipulis nostris, primā die nostri adventūs*. **lapidarent:** plural with subject *populus*, a *constructio ad sensum*. “Lynching was no imaginary fear” (Clanchy 289).

tres deos predicare et scripsisse: this would have been spectacularly heretical; Orthodox Christian doctrine is that there is one god in three persons. The theological differences between Abelard and his enemies were far more subtle than this.

ad legatum: i.e. to the papal envoy Cono; see chapter 38.

mox ut ad civitatem veni: “as soon as I came to the city”; CL would be *mox quam* or *simul ut*.

et me ... paratum ... obtuli: “I presented myself as ready to,” “I offered to.”

Et inimici nostri sunt iudices: Deuteronomy 32:31: “For their rock is not as our Rock, even our enemies themselves being judges.”

¹*illuc*: “to that place, thither.”

²*diffāmō* (1): “defame, slander.”

³*paene*: “almost.”

⁴*adventus, ūs, m.*: “arrival.”

⁵*lapidō* (1): “throw stones at.”

⁶*offerō, offerre, obtulī, oblātum*: “present, bring to someone’s attention” (see OLD 4).

⁷*praecipio, praecipere, praecēpī, praeceptum*: “order” (OLD 7).

⁸*quātenus*: “so that” (OLD 9; used in ML like *ut* to introduce purpose clauses).

39.2 (84.736) Sepius autem illi inspicientes atque revolventes libellum, nec quid in audientia proferre adversum me auderent invenientes, distulerunt usque¹ in finem concilii libri ad quam anhelabant² dampnationem.³ Ego autem singulis diebus, antequam sederet concilium, in publico, omnibus, secundum quam scripseram, fidem catholicam disserebam, et, cum magna ammiratione, omnes, qui audiebant, tam verborum apertionem⁴ quam sensum nostrum commendabant. Quod cum populus et clerus inspiceret,⁵ ceperunt ad invicem dicere: “Ecce nunc palam loquitur, et nemo in eum aliquid dicit, et concilium ad finem festinat,⁶ maxime in eum, ut audivimus, congregatum. Numquid⁷ iudices cognoverunt quia ipsi potius quam ille errant?” Ex quo emuli nostri cotidie magis ac magis inflamabantur.

nec quid in audientia ... invenientes = *nec invenientes quid auderent proferre in audientia adversum me*. **in audientia**: “in open session” (Levitan).

libri ad quam ... dampnationem = *damnationem libri, ad quam anhelabant*.

tam verborum apertionem quam sensum nostrum: i.e. both the exposition of particular passages and the more general conclusions about their meaning.

“Ecce nunc palam loquitur, etc.: “But lo, he speaketh boldly, and they say nothing unto him” (John 7.26).

et concilium ad finem ... congregatum = *et concilium maxime congregatum in eum (= Abelardum), ut audivimus, festinat ad finem*.

Numquid iudices cognoverant quia: “Can it really be that the judges have recognized?” **numquid** in CL means “can it be that?,” indicating surprise; Abelard is being ironic, since what he would want them to say is “Surely, at last.” **quia** (ML) = (CL) *ut*; *cognosco* does not take a final clause in CL.

ipsi potius quam ille errant = *ipsi (iudices) errant potius quam ille (Abelardus)*. cf. John 7.26: “But lo, he speaketh boldly, and they say nothing unto him. Do the rulers know indeed that this is the very Christ?” “Abelard, in the words of the clergy and the people, applies the words of the Gospel about Christ to himself” (Andrée).

40.1 (84.751) Quadam autem die, Albericus ad me, animo intemptantis, cum quibusdam discipulis suis accedens, post quedam blanda colloquia, dixit se mirari quoddam, quod in libro illo notaverat, quod scilicet, cum Deus Deum genuerit, nec nisi unus Deus sit, negarem tamen Deum se ipsum genuisse. Cui statim respondi, “Super hoc, si vultis, rationem proferam.” “Non curamus,” inquit ille, “rationem humanam, aut sensum⁸ vestrum in talibus, sed auctoritatis verba solummodo.”⁹ Cui ego, “Vertite,” inquam, “folium¹⁰ libri, et invenietis auctoritatem.”

¹ *usque in*: “as far as, until.”

² *anhēlō* (1): “thirst for, pant after” (OLD 6, rare and literal).

³ *damnātiō, ōnis, f.*: “condemnation.”

⁴ *apertiō, ōnis, f.*: “opening” (of a building, CL); “unfolding” (LL).

⁵ *inspiciō, inspicere, inspexi, inspectum*: “watch” (OLD 2).

⁶ *festinō* (1): “hasten.”

⁷ *numquid*: “is it really possible that?”

⁸ *sensus, ūs, m.*: “understanding, perception.”

⁹ *solummodo*: “only.”

¹⁰ *folium, (i)lī, n.*: “leaf” (of a plant, CL); leaf of paper (LL).

40.2 (84.760) Et erat presto¹ liber, quem secum ipse detulerat. Revolvi² ad locum,³ quem noveram, quem ipse minime compererat,⁴ ut qui non nisi nocitura⁵ mihi querebat. Et voluntas Dei fuit, ut cito occurreret mihi quod volebam. Erat autem sententia intitulata *Augustinus De Trinitate libro I*: “Qui putat eius potentie Deum, ut se ipsum ipse genuerit, eo⁶ plus errat, quod non solum Deus ita non est, sed nec spiritualis creatura, nec corporalis. Nulla enim omnino⁷ res est, que se ipsam gignat.”⁸

ut qui non ... querebat = ut (aliquis) qui qu(a)rebat non nisi (illa) nocitura mihi.

“Qui putat ... se ipsam gignat” = “Qui putat Deum (esse) eius potenti(a)e, ut ipse genuerit se ipsum, plus erat eo, quod non solum Deus non est ita [ut ipse genuerit se ipsum], sed nec spiritualis creatura [est ita], nec corporalis (creatura). eius potentie: genitive of quality / description. The passage in question is Abelard’s *Theologia “Summi boni”* II.62 (p. 134), quoting Augustine, *De Trinitate* 1.1 (p. 28).

40.3 (85.769) Quod cum discipuli eius qui aderant audissent, obstupefacti erubescabant. Ipse autem, ut se quoquomodo⁹ protegeret, “Bene,” inquit, “est intelligendum.” Ego autem subieci hoc non esse novellam,¹⁰ sed ad presens nichil attinere, cum ipse verba tantum, non sensum, requisisset; si autem sensum et rationem attendere vellet, paratum me dixi ei ostendere, secundum¹¹ eius sententiam, quod in eam lapsus esset¹² heresim,¹³ secundum quam is, qui pater est, sui ipsius filius sit. Quo ille audito, statim quasi furibundus effectus, ad minas¹⁴ conversus est, asserens nec rationes meas nec auctoritates mihi in hac causa suffragaturas esse.¹⁵ Atque ita recessit.

“Bene ... est intelligendum”: “(This) has to be understood in the right way.”

secundum eius sententiam = secundum sententiam eius (Alberici). Construe with *lapsus esset heresim*. Alberic, according to his own doctrine, had fallen into heresy.

quod in eam ... heresim = quod (Albericus) lapsus esset in eam h(a)eresim. heresim: for the declension of Greek 3rd declension nouns see AG § 81.

qui pater est, sui ipsius filius sit: qv. Clanchy.

¹ *praesto* (adv.): “available, at hand.”

² *revolvō, revolvēre, revolūi, revolutū*: “roll back”; “roll through a book” (see OLD 2b).

³ *locus, ī, m.*: “chapter, passage.”

⁴ *comperiō, comperere, comperuī, compertum*: “discover.”

⁵ *noceō, nocēre, nocuī, nocitum*: “harm.”

⁶ *eo*³: “for this reason” (introducing a final clause, OLD 1c).

⁷ *omnino*: “absolutely.”

⁸ *gignō, gignere, genuī, genitum*: “create.”

⁹ *quoquo modo*: “in anyway possible” (OLD *quisquis* 8).

¹⁰ *novella, ae, f.*: “piece of news” (ML; 13th cent.).

¹¹ *secundum* (prep. + acc.): “in accordance with” (OLD 5).

¹² *labor, labī, lapsus*: “fall.”

¹³ *haeresis, eōs or is, f.*: “sect” (CL); “heresy” (LL).

¹⁴ *minae, ārum, f.pl.*: “threats.”

¹⁵ *suffragor* (1): “support.”

41. (85.782) Extrema vero die concilii, priusquam residerent,¹ diu legatus ille atque archiepiscopus cum emulis meis et quibusdam personis deliberare ceperunt, quid de me ipso et libro nostro statueretur,² pro quo maxime convocati fuerant. Et quoniam ex verbis meis aut scripto, quod erat in presenti, non habebant quid in me pretenderent, omnibus aliquantulum³ conticentibus⁴ aut iam mihi minus aperte detrahentibus,⁵ Gaudrifus, Carnotensis episcopus, qui ceteris episcopis et religionis nomine et sedis dignitate precellebat, ita exorsus est:⁶

legatus ille: i.e. the papal envoy Conon; see chapter 38.

archiepiscopus: Raol of Rheims; ch. 38.

cum emulis meis et quibusdam personis: i.e. with Alberic, Lotulf, and others (Levitan).

quod erat in presenti: “which was before them”; in *pr(a)senti* in CL means “now”; in ML it can mean “in the presence of” (Andrée).

Gaudrifus, Carnotensis episcopus: Geoffrey of Lèves, bishop of Chartres.

42.1 (85.791) “Nostis, Domini omnes qui adestis, hominis huius doctrinam, qualiscunque sit, eiusque ingenium, in quibuscunque studuerit, multos assentatores⁷ et sequaces⁸ habuisse, et magistrorum tam suorum quam nostrorum famam maxime compressisse,⁹ et quasi¹⁰ eius vineam¹¹ a mari usque ad mare palmites¹² suos extendisse.

hominis huius doctrinam ... habuisse = *doctrinam huius hominis, qualicunque sit, eiusque ingenium, in quibuscunque studuerit [= in studiis eius] habuisse multos assentatores et sequaces*. A first indirect statement depending on *nostis*.

et magistrorum ... compressisse = *et (doctrinam eiusque ingenium) compressisse (famam) tam magistrorum suorum quam famam (magistrorum) nostrorum*. A second indirect statement depending on *nostis*.

et quasi eius vineam ... extendisse: a third indirect statement depending on *nostis*. Cf. Psalm 72:8: “He shall have dominion also from sea to sea, and from the river unto the ends of the earth”; 80:11: “She sent out her boughs unto the sea, and her branches unto the river.”

¹ *residō, rēsīdere, resēdī*: “sit down.”

² *statuō, statuere, statuī, statūtum*: “decide” (with internal accusative, OLD 9d).

³ *aliquantulum*: “to a small extent, a fair amount.”

⁴ *conticeō, conticēre*: “be silent” (rare in CL; the usual word is *conticēscō*).

⁵ *dētrahō, dētrahere, dētraxī, dētractum*: “speak in disparagement (of)” (OLD 8).

⁶ *exorior, exorīrī, exortus*: “arise, present oneself”; here “get up to speak.”

⁷ *assentātor, ōris, m.*: “flatterer, yes-man.”

⁸ *sequācēs, ium, m.pl.*: “those addicted to following” (OLD 1b, but rare).

⁹ *comprimō, comprimere, compressī, compressum*: “curb, subdue” (OLD 7); “silence” (OLD 8b).

¹⁰ *quasi*: “in a manner of speaking, as it were” (OLD 9a).

¹¹ *vineā, ae, f.*: “vineyard.”

¹² *palmes, itis, m.*: “vine-branch, shoot.”

42.2 (85.797) “Si hunc preiudicio,¹ quod non arbitror, gravaveritis,² etiamsi recte, multos vos offensuros sciatis, et non deesse plurimos, qui eum defendere velint, presertim cum in presenti scripto nulla videamus, que aliquid obtineant aperte calumpnie, et quia iuxta³ illud Jheronimi: ‘Semper in propatulo⁴ fortitudo emulos habet, feriuntque summos fulgura⁵ montes,’ videte, ne plus ei nominis conferatis violenter agendo, et plus nobis criminis ex invidia quam ei ex iusticia conquiramus.⁶

Si hunc preiudicio ... sciatis = *Si gravaveritis hunc pr(a)eiudic(i)o, quod non aribror (feceritis), estiamsi (eum gravavertis) recte, sciatis vos multos effensuros (esse).* **hunc** = *Abelardum*. André calls this “a conditional future ‘ideal’ sentence, representing the matter as still in suspense.” [I’m not sure what we call that in American grammar books.]

que aliquid obtineant aperte calumpnie = *qu(a)e aperte obtineant aliqui calumni(a)e.*

‘Semper in propatulo ... fulgura montes’: Jerome, *Hebraicae quaestiones in Genesim*, Praef. 18-20, quoting Horace, *Odes* 2.10.9-12.

Saepius ventis agitur ingens
pinus et celsae graviore casu
decidunt turres feriuntque summos
fulgura montis.

videte, ne plus ei nominis conferatis= *videte, ne conferatis ei [Abelardo] plus nominis.*

quam ei ex iusticia conquiramus: the *quam* picks up *plus ... nominis* and *plus ... criminis*.

42.3 (86.807) “‘Falsus enim rumor,’ ut predictus doctor meminit, ‘cito opprimitur, et vita posterior iudicat de priore.’ Si autem canonice⁷ agere in eum disponitis,⁸ dogma⁹ eius vel scriptum in medium proferatur, et interrogato libere respondere liceat, ut convictus vel confessus penitus obmutescat,¹⁰ iuxta illam saltem¹¹ beati Nichodemi sententiam, qua Dominum ipsum liberare cupiens aiebat: *Numquid lex nostra iudicat hominem, nisi audierit ab ipso prius, et cognoverit quid faciat?*”

‘Falsus enim rumor etc.: Jerome, *Epistles* 54. 13.

et vita posterior iudicat de priore: “and (one’s) later life passes judgement on (one’s) earlier life.”

in medium proferatur: *in medium proferre* means “make public.”

interrogato libere respondere liceat = *liceat (ei = Abelardo), interrogato, libere respondere.*

Numquid lex etc.: “Doth our law judge any man, before it hear him, and know what he doeth?”

43.1 (86.715) Quo audito, statim emuli mei obstrepentes exclamaverunt: “O sapientis consilium, ut contra eius verbositatem contendamus, cuius argumentis vel sophismatibus universus obsistere mundus non posset!” Sed, certe, multo difficilior erat cum ipso contendere Christo, ad quem tamen audiendum Nichodemus iuxta legis sanctionem invitabat.

“O sapientis consilium” etc.: Abelard’s enemies (*emuli*) are here being sarcastic.

“Sed certe” etc. This is presumably Geoffrey’s response to the sarcastic *emuli*. The MSS contain no indication that Geoffrey is the speaker, and André does not add the quotation marks, but otherwise “the sentence remains a very uncharacteristic aside of Abelard’s own” (Levitan).

ad quem audiendum ... invitabat = *ad quem (Christum) audiendum Nichodemus invitabat* [“was extending an invitation”], *iuxta sanctionem legis*. For Nicodemus’ insistence that Jesus receive a hearing see John 7:50-51.

¹*praeiudicium, (i)i, n.*: “prejudgement” (OLD 2).

²*gravō* (1): “oppress, overpower” (OLD 2).

³*iuxtā*: here prep. + acc. “in accordance with” (OLD 7).

⁴*propatulus, a, um*: “open”; *in propatulo* = “in the open.”

⁵*fulgur, fulguris, n.*: “flash of lightning.”

⁶*conquirō, conquīrere, conquīsītū* or *conquīsītū*: “search out and collect”; i.e. “get.”

⁷*canonicē*: “according to church discipline” (LL).

⁸*dispōnō, dispōnere, disposū, dispositum*: “arrange, ordain” (OLD 6).

⁹*dogma, atis, n.*: “tenet, doctrine.”

¹⁰*obmutescō, obmutescere, obmūtū*: “be silenced, be come silent.”

¹¹*saltem*: “at least.”

43.2 (86.823) Cum autem episcopus ad id quod proposuerat eorum animos inducere non posset, alia via eorum invidiam refrenare¹ attemptat, dicens ad discussionem tante rei paucos qui aderant non posse sufficere, maiorisque examinis causam hanc indigere;² in hocque ulterius³ tantum suum esse consilium, ut ad abbatiam meam, hoc est monasterium sancti Dyonisii, abbas meus, qui aderat, me reduceret, ibique pluribus ac doctioribus personis convocatis, diligentiori examine quid super hoc faciendum esset statueretur. Assensit legatus huic novissimo consilio, et ceteri omnes.

alia via: ablative of means.

in hocque ulterius tantum suum esse consilium = (*et dicens*) suum ulterius consilium in hōc esse tantum. *tantus, a, um* (CL “so great”) here seems to mean simply “such that, that.”

ibique pluribus ... statueretur = (*et ut*) ibi statueretur quid faciendum esset super hoc, diligentiori examini, pluribus ad doctioribus personis convocatis.

Assensit legatus: i.e. the papal envoy Conon; see chapter 38.

43.3 (86.833) Inde mox legatus assurrexit, ut missam⁴ celebraret antequam concilium intraret, et mihi per episcopum illum licentiam constitutam mandavit, revertendi scilicet ad monasterium nostrum, ibi expectaturo quod conductum⁵ fuerat.

revertendi: a gerund in the genitive, depending on *licentiam constitutam*.

expectaturo: future active participle in the dative, agreeing with *mihi*. In CL prose the future active participle is not typically adjectivally (i.e. without a form of *sum*). Here it expresses purpose, also not typical in CL.

quod conductum fuerat: in CL we would expect *quod condiceretur* (AG § 585).

44.1 (87.838) Tunc emuli mei, nichil se egisse cogitantes si extra diocesim suam hoc negotium ageretur, ubi videlicet vim minime exercere valerent, qui scilicet de iusticia minus confidebant, archiepiscopo persuaserunt hoc sibi valde ignominiosum esse, si ad aliam audientiam causa hec transferretur, et periculosum fieri, si sic evaderem. Et statim ad legatum concurrentes, eius immutaverunt sententiam, et ad hoc invitum pertraxerunt,⁶ ut librum sine ulla inquisitione dampnaret atque in conspectu omnium statim combureret,⁷ et me in alieno monasterio perhenni⁸ clausura⁹ cohiberet.¹⁰ Dicebant enim ad dampnationem libelli satis hoc esse debere, quod nec Romani pontificis nec Ecclesie auctoritate eum commendatum legere publice presumpseram, atque ad transcribendum iam pluribus eum ipse prestitissem; et hoc perutile futurum fidei christiane, si exemplo mei, multorum similis presumptio preveniretur.

nichil se egisse cogitantes = *cogitantes se egisse nihil*; they thought they would accomplished nothing.

ubi videlicet ... valerent: *ubi* picks up *extra diocesim suam*; his enemies worried that they would not be able to use violence against Abelard in another diocesis.

archiepiscopo: Raol of Rheims; ch. 38.

ad legatum: the papal envoy Conon; see chapter 38.

et ad hoc invitum pertraxerunt = *et (aemuli) pertraxerunt (eum = legatum), invitum, ad hoc*.

atque ad transcribendum ... ipse prestitissem = *atque (quod) ipse iam pr(a)estitissem eum [= librum] pluribus [hominibus] ad transcribendum*. I.e. he had published the book, also without the sanction of the Pope or the Church.

¹ *refrēnō* (1): “rein in; restrain.”

² *indigēō, indigēre, indigūi*: “stand in need of, require.”

³ *ulterior, ulterius*: “additional, further” (OLD 5).

⁴ *missa, ae, f.*: “mass” (LL).

⁵ *condicō, condicere, condixi, conductum*: “give notice; appoint.”

⁶ *pertrahō, pertrahere, pertraxi, pertractum*: “drag along”; here “persuade, force.”

⁷ *combūrō, combūrere, combussī, combustum*: “destroy with fire, burn up.”

⁸ *perennis, e*: “constant, uninterrupted.”

⁹ *clausūra, ae, f.*: “monastic enclosure” (ML).

¹⁰ *cohibeō, cohibēre, cohibuī, cohibitum*: “hold within; confine.”

44.2 (87.855) Quia autem legatus ille minus quam necesse esset litteratus¹ fuerat, plurimum archiepiscopi consilio nitebatur,² sicut et archiepiscopus illorum. Quod cum Carnotensis presensisset episcopus, statim machinamenta³ hec ad me retulit, et me vehementer hortatus est, ut hoc tanto levius tolerarem, quanto violentius agere eos omnibus patebat; atque hanc tam manifeste invidie violentiam eis plurimum obfuturam, et mihi profuturam non dubitarem; nec de clausura monasterii ullatenus⁴ perturbarer, sciens profecto⁵ legatum ipsum, qui coactus hoc faciebat, post paucos dies, cum hinc recesserit, me penitus liberaturum. Et sic me, ut potuit, flentem flens, et ipse consolatus est.

sicut et archiepiscopus illorum = sicut et archiepiscopus (nitebatur consilio) eorum [= emulorum meorum]

Carnotensis ... episcopus: Geoffrey of Lèves, bishop of Chartres; see on 41.

omnibus patebat: "it was clear to everyone"; *pateō* is not listed as an impersonal usage of *pateō* in OLD, but it seems [to me] good CL.

atque hanc ... dubitarem = atque (non dubitarem) hanc violentiam plurimum obfuturam (esse) tam manifest(a)e invidi(a)e eis, et non dubitarem (hanc violentiam) mihi profuturam (esse). manifeste invidie is genitive of quality (= UK genitive of description).

De combustione ipsius libri.

45.1 (87.868) Vocatus itaque statim ad concilium, adfui, et, sine ullo discussionis examine, me ipsum compulerunt, propria manu, librum memoratum meum in ignem proicere. Et sic combustus est. Vt tamen non nichil dicere viderentur, quidam de adversariis meis id submurmuravit,⁶ quod in libro scriptum deprenderat solum patrem Deum omnipotentem esse. Quod cum legatus subintellexisset,⁷ valde admirans⁸ ei respondit hoc nec de puerulo aliquo credi debere, quod adeo⁹ erraret, cum communis, inquit, fides et teneat et profiteatur tres omnipotentes esse. Quo audito Terricus quidam, scolaris¹⁰ magister, irridendo¹¹ subintulit¹² illud Athanasii: "Et tamen non tres omnipotentes, sed unus omnipotens."

sine ullo discussionis examine: "without any question or discussion" (Levitan).

Vt tamen ... viderentur = ut tamen (illi / aemuli) non viderentur nichil dicere. They felt they had to say something. Purpose clause.

id submurmuravit, quod ... deprenderat: CL would be *submurmuravit* (se) *depre*(he)ndisse

solum patrem Deum omnipotentem: if Abelard had said this, it would have been profoundly anti-trinitarian. In fact his view was that the three persons of the Trinity corresponded to different aspects of God: the Father to power, the Son to wisdom, and the Holy Spirit to goodness (Levitan).

cum legatus subintellexisset: the Papal legate, Conon of Palestrina; ch. 38.

respondit ei ... quod adeo erraret = respondit ei [= cuidam de adversariis meis] hoc, quod adeo erraret, nec debere credi de aliquo puerulo. [I think the point is that Conon is defending Abelard, since even a small child couldn't have said what Abelard's enemy (*quidam de adversariis*) said he said.

inquit = (CL) inquit.

tres omnipotentes esse: the *tres* are the three persons of the Trinity.

Terricus quidam: probably Thierry of Chartres (d. ca. 1156).

irridendo: in CL this would be a gerund in the ablative, "in mocking"; in LL and ML the gerund becomes almost an indeclinable present participle. So also *disputando* in ch. 2.

illud Athanasii: "Et tamen non tres omnipotentes, sed unus omnipotens." Athanasius of Alexandria (d. 373) was famous for his resistance to the Arian heresy and for his creed, still used in Roman Catholic, Anglican and Lutheran churches, but less commonly than the Nicene Creed and the Apostles' Creed. The Athanasian Creed is pointedly Anti-Arian, and thus emphasizes the power of God the Father, as here.

¹ *litterātus*, a, um: "well-read, cultured, erudite."

² *nitor*, *nitī*, *nixus* or *nisus*: "lean on"; "rely on."

³ *māchināmentum*, ī, n. "device" (CL); "trick, stratagem" (LL).

⁴ *ullātenus*: "in any respect whatsoever" (LL).

⁵ *profectō*: "undoubtedly, without question"

⁶ *submurmurō* (1): "murmur softly" (CL but rare).

⁷ *subintellegō*, *subintellegerē*: "understand a little of" (LL).

⁸ *admiror* (1): "be surprised by, wonder at" (not necessarily with approval, OLD 1)>

⁹ *adeō*: "to such an extent, so much."

¹⁰ *scholāris*, e: "of a school" (LL).

¹¹ *irridēō*, *irridēre*, *irrisī*, *irrisum*: "laugh at, mock."

¹² *subinferō*, *subinferre*: "subjoin."

45.2 (88.880) Quem cum episcopus suus increpare cepisset et reprimere quasi reum, qui in maiestatem¹ loqueretur, audacter ille restitit, et quasi Danielis verba commemorans, ait: “*Sic fatui, filii Israel non iudicantes, neque quod verum est cognoscentes, condemnastis filium Israel. Revertimini ad iudicium, et de ipso iudice iudicate, qui talem iudicem quasi ad instructionem fidei et correctionem erroris instituitis. Qui cum iudicare deberet, ore se proprio condemnavit, divina hodie misericordia innocentem patenter, sicut olim Susannam a falsis accusatoribus, liberante.*”

illud Athanasii: “that saying (word) of Athanasius.

episcopus suus: i.e. Geoffrey of Lèves, bishop of Chartres, see chs. 41 and 44.

qui in maiestatem loqueretur: “as though speaking treason,” literally “as though speaking against *maiestas*, the CL word for treason, short for *maiestas laesa* or *maiestas imminuta*.

audacter ille resistit: *ille = Terricus quidam.*

quasi Danielis verba commemorans: *quasi* is used here because Terricus did not quote the Book of Daniel precisely, changing “daughter of Israel” (Susanna) to “son of Israel.” The story of Susanna and elders is told in the Book of Daniel, ch. 13 (considered a separate book in King James Bible); Susanna was falsely accused of promiscuity by two lecherous elders, who would have put her to death but for the intervention of Daniel.

***Sic fatui, filii Israel etc.*:** Daniel 13:48-49 (= The History of Susanna 48-49) “But he standing in the midst of them, said: “Are ye so foolish, ye children of Israel, that without examination or knowledge of the truth, you have condemned a daughter of Israel? Return to judgment, for they have borne false witness against her.”

divina hodie misericordia ... liberante = *divinā mīericoriā hodie liberante patenter innocentem, sicut olim (liberante) Susannam a falsis accusatoribus.*

46.1 (88.981) Tunc archiepiscopus assurgens, verbis prout² oportebat commutatis, sententiam legati confirmavit, dicens: “Revera, domine” inquit “omnipotens Pater, omnipotens Filius, omnipotens Spiritus sanctus, et qui ab hoc dissentit, aperte devius est, nec est audiendus. Et modo,³ si placet, bonum est ut frater ille fidem suam coram⁴ omnibus exponat, ut ipsa, prout oportet, vel approbetur vel improbetur atque corrigatur.”

verbis prout oportebat commutatis: i.e. Archbishop Raol changed the legate’s formulation to make it more palatable to Abelard.

domine: [I am not sure who is addressed here. Is the archbishop speaking very politely to Abelard? or the legate? Both Andrée and Levitan print a lowercase d, so not The Lord.]

omnipotens Pater etc. This is the formulation of the Athanasian Creed, here emphasizing the power of the second and third persons of the Trinity.

frater ille: i.e. Abelard.

ipsa = *fides*.

46.2 (88.898) Cum autem ego ad profitendam et exponendam fidem meam assurgerem, ut quod sentiebam verbis propriis exprimerem, adversarii dixerunt non aliud mihi necessarium esse, nisi ut symbolum Athanasii recitarem, quod quisvis puer eque⁵ facere posset. Ac ne ex ignorantia pretenderem excusationem, quasi qui verba illa in usu non haberem, scripturam ad legendum afferri fecerunt. Legi inter suspiria,⁶ singultus⁷ et lacrimas, prout potui. Inde, quasi reus et convictus abbati Sancti Medardi, qui aderat, traditus ad claustrum eius tanquam ad carcerem trahor; statimque concilium solvitur.

symbolum Athanasii: i.e. the Athanasian Creed. [I can’t find this meaning of *symbolum* in the dictionaries, but it’s surely common in LL.]

abbati Sancti Medardi: the abbot of Saint-Médard, in Soissons, was named Geoffrey “Stagneck.”

¹ *māiestas, ātis*, f. “dignity.”

² *prout*: “according as, as.”

³ *modo*: “now” (OLD 5b).

⁴ *cōram*: “in the presence of, before” (prep. + abl.).

⁵ *aequē*: “likewise, also” (OLD 4).

⁶ *suspirium, (i)ī*, n. “sigh.”

⁷ *singultus, ūs*, m.: “sob.”

47.1 (89.910) Abbas autem et monachi illius monasterii me sibi remansurum ulterius arbitantes, summa exultatione susceperunt, et cum omni diligentia tractantes, consolari frustra nitebantur.¹ Deus, qui iudicas equitatem,² quanto tunc animi felle,³ quanta mentis amaritudine te ipsum insanus arguebam, te furibundus accusabam, sepius repetens illam beati Anthonii conquestionem: “Ihesu bone, ubi eras?” Quanto autem dolore estuarem,⁴ quanta erubescencia⁵ confunderer, quanta desperatione perturbarer, sentire tunc potui, proferre⁶ non possum.

Abbas autem etc. According to the life of St. Godwin, prior of Saint Médard, the monastery was a kind of reform school for wayward monks, where Abelard was threatened with physical punishment for making sarcastic remarks (!). (Levitan) [Though I can't find any information on this biography].

sibi remansurum: CL would be *secum* (or *ibi*).

illam beati Anthonii conquestionem: “Ihesu bone, ubi eras?”: St. Antony of Egypt (d. 356) was considered the first Christian monk. The *Life of Antony* by St. Athanasius was translated into Latin. [I don't have a reference to the passage, or a copy of the Latin translation. Chapter 10 of the Greek (trans. Ellershaw) has: “Nor was the Lord then forgetful of Antony's wrestling, but was at hand to help him. So looking up he saw the roof as it were opened, and a ray of light descending to him. The demons suddenly vanished, the pain of his body straightway ceased, and the building was again whole. But Antony feeling the help, and getting his breath again, and being freed from pain, besought the vision which had appeared to him, saying, ‘Where wert thou? Why didst thou not appear at the beginning to make my pains to cease?’ And a voice came to him, ‘Antony, I was here, but I waited to see thy fight; wherefore since thou hast endured, and hast not been worsted, I will ever be a succour to thee, and will make thy name known everywhere.’ Having heard this, Antony arose and prayed, and received such strength that he perceived that he had more power in his body than formerly. And he was then about thirty-five years old.”

Quanto autem dolore estuarem etc.: indirect questions depending on *sentire ... potui* and *proferre non possum*.

proferre non possum: “I cannot speak of (now).”

47.2 (89.919) Conferebam⁷ cum his que in corpore passus olim fueram quanta nunc sustinerem; et omnium hominum me estimabam miserrimum. Parvam illam ducebam prodicionem in comparatione huius iniurie, et longe amplius fame quam corporis detrimentum plangebam, cum ad illam ex aliqua culpa devenerim, ad hanc me tam patentem⁸ violentiam sincera intentio amorque fidei nostre induxissent, que me ad scribendum compulerant.

Conferebam cum his ... nunc sustinerem = conferebam quanta nunc sustinerem cum his qu(a)e in corpore olim passus (sum). *qu(a) olim in corpore passus (sum)* refers to his castration.

Parvam illam ... prodicionem: his castration.

et longe amplius ... plangebam = plangebam (detrimentum) fam(a)e longe amplius quam detrimentum corporis.

cum ad illam ... devenerim = cum [because] devenerim [= devenissem] ad illam (prodicionem) ex aliqua culpa. He was responsible for his castration.

ad hanc ... induxissent = sincera intentio amorque fidei nostr(a) induxissent me ad hanc tam patentem violentiam. He condemnation at Soissons was due to good intentions and genuine conviction.

¹ *nitor, niti, nixus or nitus*: “strive.”

² *aequitās, ātis, f.*: “fairness, justice.”

³ *fel, fellis, n.*: “bile, gall.”

⁴ *aestuō (1)*: “burn fiercely.”

⁵ *erubescencia, ae, f.*: “shamefacedness” (LL).

⁶ *proferō, prōferre, prōtulī, prōlātum*: “put forth; give voice to, pronounce.”

⁷ *conferō, conferre, contulī, collatum*: “compare” (OLD 14).

⁸ *patens, patens*: “obvious, unmistakable” (OLD 3).

48. (89.928) Cum autem hoc tam crudeliter et inconsiderate factum omnes, ad quos fama delatum est, vehementer arguerent,¹ singuli qui interfuerant a se culpam repellentes in alios transfundebant,² adeo³ ut ipsi quoque emuli nostri id consilio suo factum esse denegarent, et legatus, coram omnibus, invidiam Francorum super hoc maxime detestaretur.⁴ Qui statim penitentia ductus, post aliquos dies, cum ad tempus coactus satisfecisset illorum invidie, me de alieno eductum monasterio ad proprium⁵ remisit, ubi fere, quotquot erant olim, iam, ut supra memini, infestos habebam, cum eorum vite turpitudine et impudens conversatio⁶ me suspectum penitus haberet, quem, arguentem, graviter⁷ sustineret.⁸

Cum autem ... transfundebant = cum [since] autem omnes, ad quos (hoc) delatum est fama, vehementer arguerent hoc factum (esse) tam crudeliter et inconsiderate.

id consilio ... denegarent = denegarent id factum esse consilio suo.

invidiam Francorum super hoc maxime detestaretur = maxime detestaretur invidiam Francorum super hoc. [qv. Clanchy]

ad tempus: “to suit the occasion” (OLD *tempus* 10c).

ad proprium remisit = memisit (me) ad proprium (monasterium). i.e. he sent Abelard back to St. Denis.

ubi fere quotquot ... infestos habebam = ubi iam habebam infestos fere quotquot olim erant, ut supra memini. On the hostility of the monks of St. Denis see above ch. 35; Abelard had criticized them for their *intolerabiles spurcicias*

49.1 (89.941) Paucis autem elapsis mensibus, occasionem eis fortuna obtulit, qua me perdere molirentur.⁹ Fortuitu¹⁰ namque, mihi quadam die legenti, occurrit quedam Bede sententia, qua in expositione Actuum¹¹ Apostolorum, asserit Dyonisium Ariopagitam Corinthiorum potiusquam Atheniensium fuisse episcopum. Quod valde eis contrarium videbatur, qui suum Dyonisium esse illum Ariopagitam iactitant,¹² quem ipsum Atheniensem episcopum gesta eius fuisse profitentur. Quod cum reperissem, quibusdam circonstantium¹³ fratrum, quasi iocando, monstravi testimonium, scilicet illud Bede quod nobis obiciebatur.¹⁴

occurrit quedam Bede sententia etc. Bede, *Expositio actuum apostolorum*, commenting on Acts 17:34: “Howbeit certain men clave unto him, and believed: among which was Dionysius the Areopagite, and woman named Damaris, and others with them.” Dionysius of Corinth (ca. 170 CE) was known as the author of eight letters described by Eusebius, *HE* 4.23; his letter to the Athenians identified Dionysius the Areopagite as there first bishop of Athens.

quem ipsum ... profitentur = quem ipsum gesta eius [= Dionysii] profitentur fuisse Atheniensem episcopum. [I don’t know how they could have had an opinion about the gesta of Dionysius the bishop of Athens.]

scilicet illud ... obiciebatur: “namely that thing of Bede’s which was being thrown up in opposition to us” (as monks of Saint Denis).

¹ *arguō, arguere, arguī, argūtum*: “allege, assert.”

² *transfundō, transfundere, transfūdī, transfūsum*: “transfer.”

³ *adeō*: “to such an extent, so much.”

⁴ *dētestor* (1): “express abhorrence for” (OLD 2).

⁵ *proprius, a, um*: “one’s own.”

⁶ *conversātiō, ōnis, f.*: “behavior” (OLD 3).

⁷ *graviter*: “with reluctance, with displeasure” (OLD 6).

⁸ *sustineō, sustinēre, sustinū*: “put up with, endure” (OLD 7).

⁹ *mōlior, mōlīrī, mōlītus*: “bring about (that), contrive” (+ inf.).

¹⁰ *fortuitū*: “by chance.”

¹¹ *actus, ūs, m.*: “deed, act” (OLD 11).

¹² *iactō* (1): “brag, boast” (OLD 11).

¹³ *circumstō, circumstāre, circumstetī*: “stand around.”

¹⁴ *obicīō, obicere, obiēcī, obiectum*: “cite as grounds for disapproval, throw in one’s teeth.”

49.2 (90.952) Illi vero, valde indignati, dixerunt Bedam mendacissimum scriptorem, et se Huldoinum abbatem suum veriore habere testem, qui, pro hoc investigando, Greciam diu perlustravit et, rei veritate agnita, in gestis illius, que conscripsit, hanc veraciter¹ dubitationem removit. Vnde, cum unus eorum me importuna interrogatione pulsaret, quid mihi super hac controversia, Bede videlicet atque Huldoini, videretur, respondi Bede auctoritatem, cuius scripta universe Latinorum frequentant² Ecclesie, graviorem mihi videri.

Huldoinum abbatem suum: Hilduin (d. 840) wrote a *Vita sancti Dionysii* identifying three early Christians named Dionysius as the same person: Dionysius the Areopagite (Acts 17:19; 34), the late antique Christian platonist now known as pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite, and Dionysius of Paris, the missionary to Gaul (c. 250). [I take it that Dionysius the Areopagite of *Acts* was thought to have become Bishop of Athens?] [For the text, PL vol. CVI coll. 23-50; BHL n. 2175; Repertorium vol. V p. 495; CSLMA (2010) vol. III pp. 498-503; Te.Tra. (2012) vol. IV pp. 322-34] In general, see Clanchy 232-3.

Greciam diu perlustravit: modern authors seem to assume that Hilduin simply conflated existing written accounts of Dionysius.

quid mihi ... videretur = *quid Bed(a)e videlicet atque Huldoini videretur mihi super hac controversia.*

cuius scripta ... frequentant Ecclesie = *cuius scripta frequentant Ecclesi(a)e Latinorum universe.*

De persecutione abbatis sui et fratrum in eum.

50.1 (90.962) Ex quo illi, vehementer accensi, clamare ceperunt nunc me patenter ostendisse³ quod semper monasterium illud nostrum infestaverim,⁴ et quod nunc maxime toti regno derogaverim,⁵ ei videlicet honorem illum auferens quo singulariter gloriaretur, cum eorum patronum Ariopagitam fuisse denegarem. Ego autem respondi nec me hoc denegasse,⁶ nec multum curandum esse, utrum ipse Ariopagita an aliunde⁷ fuerit, dummodo tantam apud Deum adeptus sit⁸ coronam.

quod semper ... infestaverim: *ostendo* can take an indirect question in CL. I'm not sure it can take *quod* + subj.

nec me hoc denegasse: [I think this is true; Abelard had only pointed that (according to Bede) Dionysius was Bishop of Corinth, not Athens; he could still have been the Areopagite and (as far as Abelard was concerned) the missionary to Gaul. Presumably the monks had a sneaking suspicion that their Dionysius could not really be a 3rd century missionary and a 1st century Athenian.]

50.2 (90.970) Illi vero, ad abbatem statim concurrentes, quod mihi imposuerant, nuntiaverunt. Qui libenter hoc audivit, gaudens se occasionem aliquam adipisci, qua me opprimeret, utpote qui, quanto ceteris turpius vivebat, magis me verebatur. Tunc, consilio suo congregato et fratribus congregatis, graviter mihi comminatus est,⁹ et se ad regem cum festinatione¹⁰ missurum dixit, ut de me vindictam¹¹ sumeret, tanquam regni sui gloriam et coronam ei auferente. Et me interim bene observari precepit, donec me regi traderet. Ego autem ad regularem disciplinam, si quid deliquissem, frustra me offerebam.

tanquam regni sui gloriam et coronam ei auferente: i.e. Abelard would be charged with treason; for the importance of St. Denis see Clanchy 234ff.

ad regularem disciplinam: "the discipline of monastic rule" (Levitan).

¹*veraciter*: "truly" (LL).

²*frequentō* (1) "populate; occupy" (OLD 1-2); here apparently "be widely read, be popular with" (+ dat.).

³*ostendō, ostendere, ostendi, ostentum* or *ostensum*: "show."

⁴*infestō* (1): "vex, harass"; "attack, destroy."

⁵*dērogō* (1): "detract from"; "dishonor" (LL); "slander" (ML).

⁶*dēnegō* (1): "deny."

⁷*aliunde*: "from somewhere else."

⁸*adipiscor, adipiscī, adeptus*: "acquire."

⁹*comminor* (1): threaten.

¹⁰*festinātiō, ōnis*, f.: "speed, hurry."

¹¹*vindicta, ae, f.* "punishment" (OLD 2).

51. (91.982) Tunc ego nequitiam eorum vehementer exhorrens, utpote¹ qui iam diu tam adversam habuissem fortunam, penitus desperatus, quasi adversum me universus coniurasset mundus, quorumdam consensu fratrum mei miserantium, et quorumdam discipulorum nostrorum suffragio,² nocte latenter aufugi, atque ad terram comitis Theobaldi proximam, ubi antea in cella moratus fueram, abscessi. Ipse quippe et aliquantulum mihi³ notus erat, et oppressionibus meis, quas audierat, admodum⁴ compaciebatur.⁵ Ibi autem in castro⁶ Pruvigni morari cepi, in cella videlicet quadam Trecensium monachorum, quorum prior antea mihi familiaris extiterat, et valde dilexerat, qui valde in adventu meo gavisus⁷ cum omni diligentia me procurabat.⁸

ad terram comitis Theobaldi proximam: Theobald, count of Blois, Châteaudun, Chartres, Sancerre, Provins, Meaux, and Champagne (c. 1152). He was second in power only to the king of France.

ubi antea in cella moratus fueram: at Saint-Ayoud, in Provins. This was probably when he had withdrawn from St. Denis to become a teacher. [see above].

in castro Pruvigni: in Provins.

Trecensium monachorum: “monks from Troyes.”

quorum prior: Radulf, prior of St. Ayoul.

52.1 (91.996) Accidit autem quadam die ut ad ipsum castrum abbas noster ad predictum comitem pro quibusdam suis negotiis veniret. Quo cognito, accessi ad comitem cum priore illo, rogans eum, quatinus⁹ pro me ipse intercederet ad abbatem nostrum, ut me absolveret et licentiam daret vivendi monastice,¹⁰ ubicunque mihi competens locus occurreret. Ipse autem, et qui cum eo erant in consilio, rem posuerunt responsuri comiti super hoc in ipsa die, antequam recederent. Inito autem consilio, visum est eis me ad aliam abbatiam velle transire, et hoc sue dedecus inmensum fore.

responsuri comiti: “being about to reply to the count” [?].

et hoc sue dedecus inmensum fore = *et hoc fore inmensum dedecus su(a)e*. [*sue* = (CL) *sibi*?].

52.2 (91.1006) Maxime namque glorie sibi imputabant, quod ad eos in conversione mea divertissem,¹¹ quasi ceteris omnibus abbatibus contemptis, et nunc maximum sibi imminere dicebant opprobrium, si, eis abiectis, ad alios transmearem. Vnde nullatenus¹² vel me vel comitem super hoc audierunt, immo mihi statim comminati sunt¹³ quod, nisi festinus¹⁴ redirem, me excommunicarent, et priori illi ad quem refugeram, modis omnibus interdixerunt ne me deinceps¹⁵ retineret, nisi excommunicationis particeps esse sustineret. Quo audito, tam prior ipse quam ego valde anxii¹⁶ fuimus.

quod ad eos in conversione mea divertissem: the subjunctive is in “virtual indirect discourse” (UK “oblique”), because these were the monks’ thoughts at the time; AG § 592. **in conversione mea:** i.e. when Abelard had first become a monk.

interdixerunt ne me deinceps retineret: according to Andrée *interdico* is a technical term, similar to “excommunicate”; if that is right, here *interdixerunt* must mean “They told him, on pain of being placed under an interdict.”

¹ *utpote* quī: “as one might expect in one who, as is natural in one who” (+ subj.).

² *suffrāgium*, (*i*)ī, n.: “vote”; “help” (OLD 5b).

³ *aliquantulum*: “a little, slightly.”

⁴ *admodum*: “greatly, very much.”

⁵ *compatior*, *compati*, *compassus*: “feel pity for” (LL).

⁶ *castrum*, ī, n.: “fortified settlement.”

⁷ *gaudeō*, *gaudēre*, *gāuīsus*: “rejoice, be pleased.”

⁸ *prōcūrō* (1): “attend to.”

⁹ *quātenus*: “so that” (OLD 9; used in ML like *ut* to introduce purpose clauses).

¹⁰ *monasticē*: “in a monastic way” (ML; Niermeyer has *monasticus*, *a*, *um* only).

¹¹ *divertō*, *divertere*, *divertī*, *diversum*: “leave.”

¹² *nullatenus*: “by no means” (LL).

¹³ *comminor* (1): threaten.

¹⁴ *festīnus*, *a*, *um*: “swift.”

¹⁵ *deinceps*: “from now on, from then on” (OLD 3).

¹⁶ *anxior* (1): “worry oneself” (ML).

53.1 (92.1017) Abbas autem in hac obstinatione recedens post paucos dies defunctus est. Cui cum alius successisset, conveni eum cum episcopo Meldensi, ut mihi hoc, quod a predecessore eius petieram indulgeret. Cui rei cum nec ille primo acquiesceret, postea, intervenientibus amicis quibusdam nostris regem et consilium eius super hoc compellavi et sic, quod volebam, impetravi.¹ Stephanus quippe regis tunc dapifer,² vocato in partem abbate et familiaribus eius, quesivit ab eis, cur me invitum retinere vellent, ex quo incurrere facile scandalum³ possent et nullam utilitatem habere, cum nullatenus⁴ vita mea et ipsorum convenire possent.

Abbas ... defunctus est: Abbot Adam died on 19 Feb. 1122.

cum alius successisset: the new abbot was the famous Abbot Suger (d. 1151).

conveni eum: *convenio* in CL can be transitive, “resort to” or “take legal action against” (OLD 2ab).

cum episcopo Meldensi: “with the bishop of Meaux”; his name was Bouchard (d. 1134).

regem ... compellavi: King Louis the VI “the fat” (r. 1108-1137)

Stephanus ... dapifer: Stephen de Garlande (d. 1148), high steward to the king, and probably a longtime supporter of Abelard.

in partem: “aside.”

cum nullatenus vita mea et ipsorum convenire possent = *cum vita mea et (vita) ipsorum nullatenus possent convenire*.

53.2 (92.1028) Sciebam autem in hoc regii consilii sententiam esse ut, quo minus regularis⁵ abbatia illa esset, magis regi esset subiecta atque utilis, quantum videlicet ad lucra⁶ temporalia. Vnde me facile regis et suorum assensum assequi credideram. Sicque actum est. Sed ne gloriationem suam, quam de me habebat, monasterium nostrum amitteret, concesserunt mihi ad quam vellem solitudinem transire, dummodo nulli me abbacie subiugarem, hocque in presentia regis et suorum utrimque⁷ assensum est et confirmatum.

Sciebam autem ... esse = *sciebam autem sententiam regii consilii esse in hoc*. The *consilium regium* was the royal council. **in hoc** here means “tending in this direction” [?].

quo minus regularis abbatia illa esset: result clause expanding *sententiam esse*. [I don’t understand why Abelard’s presence would change the status of the abbey.]

quantum videlicet ad lucra temporalia: “at least as much as pertains to worldly profits.”

¹*impetrō* (1): “obtain by request”; “succeed in gaining, obtain.”

²*dapifer, dapiferī*, m.: “servant who waits tables, steward” (LL).

³*scandalum, ī*, n.: “stumbling block” (σκάνδαλον); “temptation, cause of offence” (LL).

⁴*nullatenus*: “by no means” (LL).

⁵*rēgulāris, e*: “conforming to monastic rules” (ML).

⁶*lucrum, ī*, n.: “profit.”

⁷*utrimque*: “on both sides.”

c. AD 1122

54.1 (92.1038) Ego itaque ad solitudinem quandam in Trecensi pago¹ mihi antea cognitam me contuli, ibique, a quibusdam terra mihi donata, assensu episcopi terre, oratorium quoddam in nomine sancte Trinitatis ex callis² et culmo³ primum construxi. Vbi cum quodam clerico nostro latitans,⁴ illud vere Domino poteram decantare: *Ecce elongavi fugiens et mansi in solitudine*. Quod cum cognovissent scolares, ceperunt undique concurrere, et relictis civitatibus et castellis solitudinem inhabitare, et, pro amplis domibus, parva tabernacula sibi construere, et, pro delicatis cibis, herbis agrestibus et pane cibario⁵ victitare,⁶ et pro mollibus stratis,⁷ culmum sibi et stramen⁸ comparare,⁹ et pro mensis, glebas¹⁰ erigere,¹¹ ut vere eos priores philosophos imitari crederes, de quibus et Iheronimus in secundo Contra Iovinianum his commemorat verbis:

ad solitudinem: “this was meant only figuratively”; the monastery of the Paraclete only five miles from Nogent-sur-Seine, with access to main roads and fairs (Clanchy 156).

in Trecensi pago: “in the territory of Troyes.”

mihi antea cognitam: see 35.2

assensu episcopi terre: the bishop of Troyes was Hatto.

in nomine sancte Trinitatis: “a defiant reference to his condemnation at Soissons” (Marenbon 19); he would later change the to “The Paraclete.”

ex callis et culmo primum construxi: this may mean that he built the oratory with his own hands (Clanchy 239).

Ecce elongavi fugiens et mansi in solitudine: Psalm 54:8 *Psalmi 54:8 ecce elongavi fugiens et mansi in solitudine. diapsalma* (= 55:7, “Lo, then would wander far off, and remain in the wilderness. Selah.”

in secundo Contra Iovinianum: Jerome, *Adv. Jovin.* 2.8-9 (297a-298c).

54.2 (93.1053) “Per quinque sensus, quasi per quasdam fenestras,¹² vitiorum ad animam introitus¹³ est. Non potest metropolis¹⁴ et arx¹⁵ mentis capi, nisi per portas irruerit hostilis exercitus. Si circensibus quispiam delectatur, si athletarum certamine, si mobilitate histrionum,¹⁶ si formis mulierum, si splendore gemmarum, vestium et ceteris huiusmodi, per oculorum fenestras anime capta libertas est, et impletur illud propheticum: *Mors intravit per fenestras nostras*. Igitur, cum per has portas quasi quidam perturbationum cunei¹⁷ ad arcem nostre mentis intraverint, ubi erit libertas? ubi fortitudo eius? ubi de Deo cogitatio? Maxime cum tactus¹⁸ depingat¹⁹ sibi etiam preteritas voluptates, et recordatione vitiorum cogat animam compati²⁰ et quodammodo²¹ exercere quod non agit.

per oculorum ... libertas = libertas anim(a)e capta est per fenestras oculorum. The apodosis of the condition begin with *Si circensibus etc.*

Mors intravit per fenestras nostras: Jeremiah 9:21, “For death is come up unto our windows, and is entered into our palaces, to cut off the children from without, and the young men from the streets.”

¹ *pāgus*, ī, m.: “country district” (CL); “the territory of a *civitas* (ML)

² *callum*, ī, n.: “hide, skin.”

³ *culmus*, ī, m.: “staw.”

⁴ *latitō* (1): “remain in hiding, lie up.”

⁵ *cibārius*, a, um: “plain, provided as rations” (of food; OLD 2).

⁶ *victitō* (1): “subsist.”

⁷ *strātum*, ī, n.: “coverlet”; “bed.”

⁸ *strāmen*, inis, n.: “hay.”

⁹ *comparō* (1): “prepare.”

¹⁰ *glēba*, ae, f.: “lump of earth, clod.”

¹¹ *ērigō*, *ērigere*, *ērexī*, *ērectum*: “raise up; set up.”

¹² *fenestra*, ae, f.: “window.”

¹³ *introitus*, ūs, m.: “entrance.”

¹⁴ *metropolis*, is, f.: “capital city.”

¹⁵ *arx*, arcis, f.: “citadel.”

¹⁶ *histrion*, ōnis, f.: “actor.”

¹⁷ *cuneus*, ī, m.: “wedge; closely packed unit of soldiers.”

¹⁸ *tactus*, ūs, m.: “touch”; here “sense of feeling” (Andrée); “sensation” (Leviton).

¹⁹ *dēpingō*, *dēpingere*, *dēpinxī*, *dēpictum*: “paint, depict.”

²⁰ *comptior*, *compti*, *compassus*: “feel compassion for”; (here?) “feel sympathy” (LL).

²¹ *quidam modo* or *quodammodo*: “in a manner, so to speak.”

54.3 (93.1067) “His igitur rationibus invitati, multi philosophorum reliquerunt frequentias¹ urbium et ortulos² suburbanos, ubi ager irriguus³ et arborum come⁴ et susurrus⁵ avium,⁶ fontis speculum,⁷ rivus⁸ murmurans, et multe oculorum auriumque illecebre,⁹ ne per luxum et habundantiam copiarum anime fortitudo mollesceret et eius pudicitia¹⁰ stupraretur.¹¹ Inutile quippe est crebro¹² videre per que aliquando¹³ captus sis, et eorum te experimento¹⁴ committere, quibus difficulter careas.¹⁵ Nam et Pytagorei, huiuscemodi frequentiam declinantes, in solitudine et desertis locis habitare consueverant.

per que aliquando captus sis = (*illa*) *per qu(a)e aliquando captus sis*. Relative clause of characteristic. [Levitan has “Why get used to sights that someday may enslave you” but the perfect subjunctive suggests “that once have enslaved you.”]

et Pytagorei: “even the Pythagoreans” (Levitan) [I can’t remember why it would be particularly surprising that Pythagoreans avoided crowds; some of them did supposedly live in special communities, so we might imagine them as more social than many other philosophers.]

54.4 (93.1077) Sed et ipse Plato, cum dives esset et thorum¹⁶ eius Diogenes lutatis¹⁷ pedibus conculcaret,¹⁸ ut posset vacare philosophie, elegit Academiam villam, ab urbe procul,¹⁹ non solum desertam, sed et pestilentem,²⁰ ut, cura et assiduitate²¹ morborum,²² libidinis impetus²³ frangerentur, discipulique sui nullam aliam sentirent voluptatem, nisi earum rerum quas discerent.”

cum dives esset etc.: concessive *cum* clause.

thorum eius Diogenes lutatis pedibus conculcaret: Diogenes Laertius 6.26 reports that Diogenes the Cynic once “trampled on Plato’s carpets and said, ‘I trample upon Plato’s vainglory.’” Diogenes uses the word σπρώματα, which could mean “coverlets” as well as “carpets.”

elegit Academiam villam: either “he chose the Academy (as) his country home” or else *academius, a, um* is a variant of CL *Acadēmicus, a, um*. The Academy in Athens was a gymnasium chosen by Plato as the location for his school.

¹ *frequentia, ae, f.*: “multitude” (OLD 4b).

² *hortulus, ī, m.*: “garden.”

³ *irriguus, a, um*: “well-watered.”

⁴ *coma, ae, f.*: “hair”; “foliage.”

⁵ *susurrus, ī, m.*: “whisper.”

⁶ *avis, avis, f.*: “bird.”

⁷ *speculum, ī, n.*: “mirror.”

⁸ *rius, ī, m.*: “stream, brook.”

⁹ *illecebra, ae, f.*: “allurement, enticement.”

¹⁰ *pudicitia, ae, f.*: “chastity.”

¹¹ *stuprō* (1): “have illicit sex with”; “defile.”

¹² *crebrō*: “often.”

¹³ *aliquandō*: “at some time or other” (in the past or in the future).

¹⁴ *experimentum, ī, n.*: “experience” (OLD 2).

¹⁵ *careō, carēre, caruī, caritum*: “go without, lack” (+ abl.).

¹⁶ *torus, ī, m.*: “bed, couch” (OLD 5).

¹⁷ *lutō* (1): “cover with mud.”

¹⁸ *conculcō* (1): “trample on.”

¹⁹ *procul*: “far from.”

²⁰ *pestilens, pestilentis*: “unhealthy.”

²¹ *assiduitās, ātis, f.*: “constant attention.”

²² *morbus, ī, m.*: “sickness.”

²³ *impetus, ūs, m.*: “urge” (OLD 5).

54.5 (93.1084) Talem et filii prophetarum, Helyseo adherentes, vitam referuntur duxisse, de quibus ipse quoque Iheronimus, quasi de monachis illius temporis, ad Rusticum monachum, inter cetera ita scribit: “Filii prophetarum, quos monachos in veteri legimus Testamento, edifficabant¹ sibi casulas² prope fluentia³ Iordanis, et turbis et urbibus derelictis, polenta⁴ et herbis agrestibus victitabant.”⁵ Tales discipuli nostri ibi super Arduzonem fluvium casulas suas edificantes, heremite⁶ magis quam scholares videbantur.

Talem et filii ... referuntur duxisse = *et filii prophetarum referuntur duxisse talem vitam, adh(a)erentes Helyseo*. Cp. II. Kings 6:1-2 “And the sons of the prophets said unto Elisha, Behold now, the place where we dwell with thee is to strait for us. Let us go, we pray thee, unto Jordan, and take thence every man a beam, and let us make a place there, where we may dwell.” See also ch. 26 above.

de quibus ipse quoque Iheronimus: Jerome, *Epistles* 125.7 (p. 125).

prope fluentia Iordanis: CL would be *prope flumen Iordanis*.

super Arduzonem fluvium: “on the banks of the river Ardusson.”

55. (94.1094) Quanto autem illuc⁷ maior solum erat confluentia et quanto duriorem in doctrina nostra vitam sustinebant, tanto amplius mihi emuli estimabant gloriosum et sibi ignominiosum, qui, cum cuncta que poterant in me egissent, omnia cooperari mihi in bonum dolebant. Atque ita iuxta illud Iheronimi, “Me procul ab urbibus, foro, litibus, turbis remotum, sic quoque, ut Quintilianus ait, latentem invenit invidia,” quia, apud semetipsos⁸ tacite conquerentes et ingemiscientes, dicebant: “Ecce *mundus totus post eum abiit*,” nichil persequendo profecimus, sed magis eum gloriosum effecimus. Extinguere nomen eius studuimus, sed magis accendimus. Ecce in civitatibus omnia necessaria scholares ad manum habent, et civiles delicias contempnentes, ad solitudinis inopiam confluunt, et sponte miseri fiunt.”

“Me procul ab urbibus etc. Jerome, *Hebraicae quaestiones in Genesim*, Praef. 20-22. Quintilian was a famous Roman teacher of rhetoric (d. ca. 100 CE), though the quotation is from a collection of practice speeches attributed to him incorrectly, Pseudo-Quintilian, *Declamationes maiores* 13.2.

mundus totus post eum abiit: John 12:19, “The Pharisees therefore said among themselves, Perceive ye how ye prevail nothing? behold, the world is gone after him.”

56. (94.1109) Tunc autem precipue⁹ ad scholarum regimen intolerabilis me compulit paupertas, cum fodere¹⁰ non valerem et mendicare erubescerem. Ad artem itaque quam noveram recurrens, pro labore manuum ad officium linguae, compulsus sum. Scholares autem ultro mihi quolibet necessaria preparabant, tam in victu¹¹ scilicet quam in vestitu vel cultura agrorum seu in expensis edificiorum, ut nulla me scilicet a studio cura domestica retardaret. Cum autem oratorium nostrum modicam eorum portionem capere non posset, necessario ipsum dilataverunt,¹² et de lapidibus et lignis construentes melioraverunt.¹³

ad scholarum regimen: i.e. to teaching.

intolerabilis me compulit paupertas: “He made this excuse presumably to forestall critics saying that monks should not be teaching, particularly not a monk who had undertaken to be a hermit” (Clanchy 240).

cum fodere non valerem et mendicare erubescerem: cp. Luke 16:3, “Then the steward said within himself, What shall I do? for my lord taketh away from me the stewardship: I cannot dig; to beg I am ashamed.”

¹ *aedificō* (1): “build.”

² *casula*, ae, f.: “humble cottage.”

³ *fluens, fluentis*: “flowing”; not a substantive in CL.

⁴ *polenta*, ae, f.: “barley-meal” (modern polenta is made from corn).

⁵ *victitō* (1): “subsist.”

⁶ *heremita*, ae, m.: “hermit” (ἐρημίτης).

⁷ *illuc*: “to that place, thither.”

⁸ *semet ipsum* or *semetipsum*: “himself, herself, itself, themselves” (intensive form of the reflexive pronoun *se*).

⁹ *praecipue*: “particularly, especially.”

¹⁰ *fodiō, fodere, fodi, fossum*: “dig.”

¹¹ *victus, ūs*, m.: “sustenance, food.”

¹² *dilatō* (1): “make wider, expand.”

¹³ *meliorō* (1): “improve” (CL but rare).

57.1 (94.1120) Quod, cum in honore sancte Trinitatis esset fundatum ac postea dedicatum, quia tamen ibi profugus¹ ac iam desperatus² divine gratia consolationis aliquantulum respirassem,³ in memoria huius beneficii ipsum Paraclitum nominavi. Quod multi audientes non sine magna admiratione susceperunt,⁴ et nonnulli hoc vehementer calumpniati sunt,⁵ dicentes non licere Spiritui sancto specialiter, magis quam Deo patri ecclesiam aliquam assignari; sed vel soli Filio, vel toti simul Trinitati, secundum consuetudinem antiquam.

Quod: i.e. *oratorium nostrum*.

divine gratia consolationis = *consolationis divin(a)e gratiā*.

ipsum Paraclitum nominavi: "I actually named it "the Paraclete." I.e. he changed the name from "Holy Trinity." *paraclitum* was originally a Greek word for "comforter," used for the Holy Spirit. John 14:16, "And I will pray the Father, and he shall give you another Comforter, that he may abide with you forever."

57.2 (96.1130) Ad quam nimirum⁶ calumpniam hic eos error plurimum⁷ induxit, quod inter "Paraclitum" et "Spiritum Paraclitum" nichil referre⁸ crederent, cum ipsa quoque Trinitas, et quelibet in Trinitate persona, sicut Deus vel adiutor dicitur, ita et paraclitus, id est consolator, recte nuncupetur,⁹ iuxta illud Apostoli: *Benedictus Deus et pater domini nostri Ihesu Christi, pater misericordiarum, et Deus totius consolationis, qui consolatur nos in omni tribulatione nostra: et secundum quod Veritas ait: Et alium Paraclitum dabit vobis.*

cum ipsa quoque trinitas ... recte nuncupetur = *cum sicut ipsa quoque trinitas, et qu(a)elibet persona in trinitate, dicitur Deus vel adiutor, ita et (ipsa trinitas et quelibet persona in trinitate) recte nuncupetur paraclitus, id est consolator.*

Benedictus Deus et pater etc. II Cor. 1:3-4, "Grace be unto you, and peace, from God our Father, and from the Lord Jesus Christ. (4) I thank my God always on your behalf, for the grace of God which is given you by Jesus Christ."

Et alium Paraclitum dabit vobis: John 14:16, "And I will pray to the Father, and he shall give you another comforter, that he may abide with you forever."

¹*profugus, a, um:* "fugitive."

²*despērātus, a, um:* "lacking hope, desperate."

³*respirō* (1): "recover one's breath."

⁴*suscipio, suscipere, suscipi, susceptum:* "embrace, adopt" (OLD 7b).

⁵*calumnior* (1): "criticize unfairly, find fault with" (OLD 4).

⁶*nimirum:* "without doubt, evidently."

⁷*plurimum:* "most of all."

⁸*refert, referre, rētulit:* "it makes a difference."

⁹*nuncupō* (1): "designate, call" (OLD 6).

58.1 (95.1139) Quid etiam impedit, cum omnis Ecclesia in nomine Patris et Filii et Spiritus sancti pariter consecratur, nec sit eorum in aliquo possessio diversa, quod domus Domini non ita Patri vel Spiritui sancto ascribatur, sicut Filio? Quis titulum eius, cuius est ipsa domus, de fronte vestibuli radere¹ presumat? Aut cum se Filius in sacrificium Patri obtulerit, et secundum hoc in celebrationibus missarum² specialiter ad Patrem orationes dirigantur, et hostie³ fiat immolatio, cur eius precipue altare esse non videatur, cui maxime supplicatio et sacrificium agitur?

Quid etiam impedit ... sicut Filio = *quid etiam impedit quod domus Domini non ascribatur non ita Patri vel Spiritui sancto, sicut Filio, cum omnis Ecclesia pariter consecratur in nomine Patris et Filii et Spiritui sancti, nec possessio sit diversa in aliquo eorum.* **quid ... impedit:** means “what prevents” and takes a final clause with *quod ... ascribatur*. **omnis Ecclesia:** the Church as the community of all believers. **domus Domini:** “an individual church building.” [Abelard seems to be portraying his detractors as saying that every church building should be dedicated to Jesus Christ.]

Quis titulum ... presumat = *quis pr(a)esumat radere titulum eius, cuius ipsa domus, de fronte vestibuli.* “Who would dare erase the owner’s name from the door of his own house” (Levitan). [I don’t actually understand this translation: I thought it meant “who would dare to erase the name of the dedicatee of this very house (= church building)”]; i.e. There’s nothing wrong with dedications of churches that are not to Jesus Christ, so why would anyone change their names.]

hostie fiat immolatio: “and there is an offering of the Host (in Holy Communion). The Latin is CL for animal sacrifice, adopted as a metaphor (?) for Holy Communion. [This is presumably standard in Christian Latin, but LS and Niermeyer offer not guidance.]

cur eius precipue ... sacrificium agitur? = *cur pr(a)ecipue altare non videatur esse eius, cui maxime supplicatio et sacrificium agitur.* Since prayers are made to God the Father, why shouldn’t the altar of the church be dedicated to Him?

58.2 (95.1149) Numquid⁴ rectius eius, qui immolatur, quam illius, cui immolatur, altare dicendum est? An melius Dominice Crucis aut Sepulchri vel beati Michaelis seu Iohannis aut Petri vel alicuius sancti, qui nec ibi immolantur, nec eis immolatur, aut obsecrationes eis fiunt, altare quis esse profitebitur? Nimirum⁵ nec inter idolatras⁶ altaria vel templa aliquorum dicebantur, nisi quibus ipsi sacrificium atque obsequium impendere intendebant.

qui immolatur: i.e. Christ.

cui immolatur: God the Father.

An melius ... profitebatur? = *An quis profitebatur melius esse altare dominic(a)e crucis aut sepulchri vel beati Michaelis seu Iohannis aut Petri vel alicuius sancti, qui nec ibi immolantur, nec eis immolatur, aut eis fiunt obsecrationes?* **dominice crucis:** the Holy Cross. **sepulchri:** the Holy Sepulchre.

Nimirum nec inter idolatres: in the days of paganism, altars and temples were named after the gods to which the pagans gave sacrifices and respect.

¹*radō, radere, rāsī, rāsum:* “scrape.”

²*missa, ae, f.:* “mass” (LL).

³*hostia, ae, f.:* “sacrificial animal, sacrifice.”

⁴*numquid:* “is it really possible that?”

⁵*nīmīrum:* “without doubt, evidently.”

⁶*idōlatrēs, ae, m.:* “idolater”; LS and Niermeyer don’t have *idolatre*s.

59. (95.1158) Sed fortasse dicat aliquis, ideo¹ Patri non esse vel ecclesias vel altaria dedicanda, quod eius aliquod factum non existit, quod specialem ei sollempnitatem² tribuat. Sed hec profecto³ ratio ipsi hoc Trinitati aufert, et Spiritui sancto non aufert, cum ipse quoque Spiritus ex adventu suo propriam habeat Pentecostes⁴ sollempnitatem, sicut Filius ex suo natalis sui festivitatem. Sicut enim Filius missus in mundum, ita et Spiritus sanctus in discipulos propriam sibi vindicat⁵ sollempnitatem.

quod specialem ei sollempnitatem tribuat: “that warrants a feast day dedicated specifically to him” (Levitan).

ipsi hoc Trinitati aufert: “takes this away from the Trinity itself.”

sicut Filius ex suo = *sicut Filius ex suo (adventu)*.

ita et Spiritus sanctus in discipulos = *ita et Spiritus sanctus (missus est) in discipulos*. At Pentecost.

60.1 (96.1167) Cui etiam probabilius quam alicui aliarum personarum templum ascribendum videtur, si diligentius apostolicam attendamus auctoritatem atque ipsius Spiritus operationem? Nulli enim trium personarum speciale templum specialiter ascribit Apostolus, nisi Spiritui sancto. Non enim ita templum Patris vel templum Filii dicit, sicut templum Spiritus sancti, in prima ad Corinthios, ita scribens: *Qui adheret Domino, unus Spiritus est*. Item: *An nescitis quia corpora vestra templum sunt Spiritus sancti, qui in vobis est, quem habetis a Deo, et non estis vestri?* Quis etiam divinorum sacramenta beneficiorum, que in ecclesia fiunt, operationi divine gratie, que Spiritus sanctus intelligitur, nesciat specialiter ascribi?

Cui etiam probabilius ... videtur: i.e. the Holy Spirit is a more likely (*probabilius*) candidate for a dedication than the other persons of the Trinity. The rhetorical question makes translation difficult.

apostolicam ... auctoritatem: i.e. the authority of St. Paul. [I take it that in citing Paul Abelard is being rhetorical rather than analytical: the two passages from First Corinthians certainly do not suggest that Paul would single out the Holy Spirit as the dedicatee of a monastery.]

“Qui adheret Domino, unus Spiritus est.” I Cor. 6:17, “But he that is joined unto the Lord is one spirit.”

“An nescitis quia corpora etc.” I Cor. 6:19, “What? know ye not that your body is the temple of the Holy Ghost which is in you, which ye have of God, and ye are not your own?”

Quis etiam ... specialiter ascribi = *quis etiam nesciat sacramenta divinorum beneficiorum, quae in Ecclesia fiunt, ascribi specialiter operationi divin(a)e grati(ae), qu(a)e intelligitur (esse) Spiritus sanctus*. **que in ecclesia fiunt:** Levitan translates “of the Church” but it seems to me that what Abelard means is that the sacraments “take place in a church” and thus that it is right to name a church after the Holy Spirit.]

60.2 (96.1180) Ex aqua quippe et Spiritu sancto in baptismo renascimur et tunc primo quasi speciale templum Deo constituimur. In consummatione quoque septiformis Spiritus gratia traditur, quibus ipsum Dei templum adornatur atque dedicatur. Quid ergo mirum, si ei persone, cui specialiter spirituale templum Apostolus tribuit, nos corporale assignemus? Aut cuius persone rectius ecclesia esse dicitur, quam eius cuius operationi cuncta, que in ecclesia, ministrantur beneficia specialiter assignantur?

In confirmatione ... gratia traditur = *septiformis gratiā Spiritūs traditur quoque in confirmatione*. Patristic authors like Augustine inferred from Isaiah 11:1-2 that the Holy Spirit conveyed seven canonical gifts; Victorinus, *Commentarii in Apocalypsim Iohannis* 1.4: *Septiformem spiritum in Esaia legimus (Esa. XI, 2), spiritum videlicet sapientiae et intellectus, consilii et fortitudinis, scientiae et pietatis, spiritum timoris Domini*. “Roman Catholicism teaches that initiates receive them at Baptism, and that they are strengthened at Confirmation, so that one can proclaim the truths of the faith” (Wikipedia).

quibus ... dedicatur: the antecedent of *quibus* is *gratia septiformis*, a *constructio ad sensum*.

nos corporale assignemus = *nos assignemus (templum) corporale*.

¹*ideō*: “for that reason.”

²*sollemnitās, ātis*, f.: “ritual observance” (CL); “festival, celebration of a day (LL).

³*profectō*: “undoubtedly, without question”

⁴*Pentēcostē, ēs*, f.: “Pentecost” (the fiftieth day after Easter); “Whitsunday.”

⁵*vindicō* (1), sometimes written *vendicō* (LS): “claim, arrogate.”

60.3 (96.1189) Non tamen hoc ita conicimus,¹ ut, cum Paraclitum primo nostrum vocaverimus oratorium, uni ipsum persone nos dicasse fateamur, sed propter eam quam supra reddidimus causam, in memoria scilicet nostre consolationis, quamquam si illo quoque quo creditur modo id fecissemus, non esset rationi adversum, licet consuetudini incognitum.

uni ipsum persone nos dicasse fateamur: “that we would say that we had dedicated it (*ipsum*) to (only) one person (of the Trinity).
sed propter eam quam supra reddidimus causam = *sed (fateamur nos dicasse ipsum) propter eam causam quam supra reddidimus.*
quamquam si ... fecissemus = *quamquam si id quoque fecissemus illo modo quo creditur.*

De persecutione quorundam quasi novorum apostolorum in eum

61.1 (97.1196) Hoc autem loco me corpore latitante,² sed fama tunc maxime universum mundum perambulante, et illius poetici figmenti,³ quod Echo dicitur, instar⁴ penitus retinente, quod videlicet plurimum vocis habet sed nichil substantie, priores emuli, cum per se iam minus valerent, quosdam adversum me novos apostolos, quibus mundus plurimum credebat, excitaverunt. Quorum alter regularium canonicorum vitam, alter monachorum se resuscitasse gloriabatur.

Hoc autem ... nichil substantie: *hoc autem loco, me latitante corpore, sed (me) maxime perambulante mundum, et (me) penitus retinente instar illius poetici figmenti, quod Echo dicitur, (et) quod videlicet habet plurimum vocis sed nichil substanti(a)e.* **me ... latitante, (me) ... perambulante, et (me) ... retinente** are three ablative absolutes. **corpore** and **fama** are ablatives of instrument. **illius poetici figmenti** is genitive with *instar*. **quod Echo dicitur:** see Ovid, Met. 3.359. **instar** is neuter acc. sing., “counterpart”; object of *retinente*.
priores emuli: identified as Alberic of Rheims and Lotulf the Lombard (see on ch. 13 above).
apostolos: Abelard’s use of this word instead of *nuntius* is sarcastic. Traditionally identified as Norbert of Xanten (d. 1134), founder of the Premonstratensian order, Bernard of Clairvaux (d. 1153), who founded the abbey of Clairvaux, and in 1140 would successfully prosecute Abelard for heresy at Sens. “Referring to people without naming them was an admired rhetorical art, which Cicero recommends, and which Abelard uses elsewhere (Clanchy 244).”

61.2 (97.1204) Hii predicando per mundum discurrentes et me impudenter quantum poterant corrodentes,⁵ non modice tam ecclesiasticis quibusdam quam secularibus potestatibus contemptibilem ad tempus effecerunt, et de mea tam fide quam vita adeo sinistra disseminaverunt, ut ipsos quoque amicorum nostrorum precipuos a me averterent, et si qui adhuc pristini amoris erga me aliquid retinerent, hoc ipsi modis omnibus metu illorum dissimularent.

non modice ... ad tempus effecerunt = *ad tempus effecerunt (me) non modice contemptibilem tam quibusdam ecclesiasticis (potestatibus) quam (quibusdam) secularibus potestatibus.* **ad tempus** means “to suit the needs of the occasion” (OLD *tempus* 10c).
et de mea tam fide ... disseminaverunt = *et disseminaverunt (ea) adeo sinistra tam de meā fide quam (de meā) vitā.*
hoc ipsi ... dissimularent = *ipsi (= praecipui amicorum nostrorum) dissimularent hoc (= aliquid pristini amoris erga me) omnibus modis, metu illorum (= hii discurrentes et me corrodentes).*

¹ *cōniciō, cōnicere, cōniēcī, cōniectum*: “aim (at a result)” (OLD 6c).

² *latitō* (1): “remain in hiding, lie up.”

³ *figmentum, ī, n.*: “fiction.”

⁴ *instar*, n. (only in nom. or acc.): “counterpart, equal.”

⁵ *corrōdō, corrōdere, corrōsī, corrōsum*: “gnaw, chew up.”

62.1 (97.1213) Deus ipse mihi testis est, quotiens aliquem ecclesiasticarum personarum conventum adunari¹ noveram, hoc in dampnationem meam agi credebam. Stupefactus ilico² quasi supervenientis ictum fulguris³ expectabam, ut quasi hereticus aut prophanus in conciliis traheretur aut sinagogis. Atque ut de pulice⁴ ad leonem, de formica⁵ ad elefantem comparatio ducatur, non me mitiori animo persequebantur emuli mei quam beatum olim Athanasium heretici.

ut quasi hereticus ... traheretur: depends on *expectabam*, even though *expectabam* also has *ictum supervenientis fulguris* as a direct object. [?]
aut sinagogis: “or in assemblies” but “also playing on New Testament associations of persecutions (Andrée).

beatum olim Athanasium: Athanasius of Alexandria (d. 373 CE) was exiled five times for his defence of Nicene orthodoxy.

62.2 (97.1221) Sepe autem, Deus scit, in tantam lapsus sum desperationem, ut, Christianorum finibus excessis, ad gentes transire disposerem, atque ibi quiete sub quacunque tributi pactione⁶ inter inimicos Christi Christiane⁷ vivere. Quos tanto magis propitios me habiturum credebam, quanto me minus Christianum ex imposito mihi crimine suspicarentur, et ob hoc facilius ad sectam suam inclinari posse crederent.

ad gentes transire disposerem: the *gentes* (“heathen”) are probably the Muslims in Spain.

sub quacunque tributi pactione: under somekind of agreement about tribute.

Quos tanto magis ... inclinari posse crederent = *credebam me habiturum (eos = quos) tanto magis propitios, quanto suspicarentur me minus (esse) Christianum, ex crimine imposito mihi, et (quanto) crederent (me) facilius inclinari ad sectam suam ob hoc.* the subjunctives are in “virtual indirect discourse” (UK “oblique”), giving Abelard’s opinion about what the Muslims would think.

De abbacia ad quam assumptus est et persecutione tam filiorum, id est monachorum,
quam tyranni in eum

c. AD 1125-1127

63.1 (98.1229) Cum autem tantis perturbationibus incessanter affligerer atque hoc extremum michi superesset consilium, ut apud inimicos Christi ad Christum confugerem, occasionem quandam adeptus, qua insidias⁸ istas paululum declinare me credidi, incidi in Christianos atque monachos gentibus longe seiores atque peiores. Erat quippe in Britannia minore, in episcopatu Venecensi, abbacia quedam sancti Gildasii Ruiensis, pastore defuncto desolata. Ad quam me concors⁹ fratrum electio cum assensu principis terre vocavit, atque hoc ab abbate nostro et fratribus facile impetravit.

in Christianos ... seiores atque peiores = *in Christianos atque monachos (qui erant) longe seiores atque peiores gentibus.* **gentibus** is ablative of comparison.

in Britannia minore: in Brittany, as in ch. 2.

in episcopatu Venecensi: “in the diocese of Vannes.”

abbacia quedam sancti Gildasii Ruiensis: the abbey of St. Gildas of Rhuys, (also called Gildas of Strathclyde or Gildas the Wise, ca. 500-570). Gildas was the author of the *De excidio et conquestu Britanniae*, a history of the Anglo-Saxon invasion of Britain. He was from Scotland, but fled to Brittany and founded a monastery at Rhuys (Brittany).

concors fratrum electio: “a unanimous vote of the brothers.”

principis terre: Conon the Fat, count of Nantes (d. 1142).

hoc ab abbate nostro et fratribus facile impetravit: i.e. Abbot Suger and his monks gave him permission to take up the position in Brittany. “Perhaps Suger saw this as a chance to remove Abelard from the kingdom; perhaps as a way of bringing reform to a particularly corrupt monastery” (Marenbon 21).

¹*adūnō* (1): “unite” (LL).

²*ilicō*: “at once.”

³*fulgur, fulguris*, n.: “flash of lightning.”

⁴*pūlex, pūlicis*, m.: “flea.”

⁵*formīca*, ae, f.: “ant.”

⁶*pactiō, ōnis*, f.: “agreement, compact.”

⁷*Christiānē*: “in a Christian manner.”

⁸*insidiae, ārum*, f.pl.: “ambush, trap”; “treacherous attack.”

⁹*concors, concordis*: “mutually agreeing.”

63.2 (98.1239) Sicque me Francorum invidia ad Occidentem sicut Iheronimum Romanorum expulit ad Orientem. Numquam enim huic rei, sciatur Deus, acquievissem, nisi ut quocunque modo has, quas incessanter sustinebam oppressiones, ut dixi, declinarem. Terra quippe barbara et terre lingua mihi incognita erat, et turpis atque indomabilis illorum monachorum vita omnibus fere notissima, et gens terre illius inhumana atque incompressa. Sicut ergo ille, qui, imminente sibi gladio, perterritus in precipitium¹ se collidit,² et, ut puncto temporis mortem unam differat, aliam incurrit, sic ego ab uno periculo in aliud scienter me contuli. Ibique ad horisoni undas Oceani, cum fugam mihi ulterius terre postremitas non preberet, sepe in orationibus meis illud revolvebam: *A finibus terre ad te clamavi, dum anxietur cor meum.*

Sicque me Francorum ... ad Orientem = *Sicque invidia Francorum (me expulit) ad Occidentem, sicut (invidia) Romanorum expulit Iheronimum ad Orientem.* Jerome moved from Rome to Palestine in part because the Romans grew suspicious of him, especially because of his close relationships with aristocratic Roman women.

Terra quippe barbara: Abelard was technically from Brittany, but from a part of the county in the extreme south east, and his father was probably not a Breton and clearly Abelard did not speak Breton.

Sicut ergo ille: “like that (famous) man (who) ...” [Is this a well known story in ancient or medieval literature?]
puncto temporis: “in an instant” (Andrée, who says this is not CL).

cum fugam mihi ulterius terre postremitas non preberet = *cum postremitas terr(a)e non p(a)reberet fugam ulterius mihi.* Presumably a causal *cum* clause.

A finibus terre etc. Psalm 60:3 (61:2) “From the end of the earth will I cry unto thee, when my heart is overwhelmed: lead me to the rock that is higher than I.”

64.1 (99.1255) Quanta enim anxietate illa etiam, quam regendam susceperam, indisciplina fratrum congregatio cor meum die ac nocte cruciaret, cum tam anime mee quam corporis pericula pensarem, neminem iam latere³ arbitror. Certum quippe habebam, quod, si eos ad regularem vitam, quam professi fuerant, compellere temptarem, me vivere non posse, et si hoc, in quantum possem, non agerem, me dampnandum esse.

Quanta enim anxietate ... die et nocte cruciaret = *quantā enim anxietate etiam illa indisciplina congregatio fratrum cruciaret cor meum die et nocte.*

Certum quippe habebam: “for indeed I was convinced”; [I’m not sure if this is CL or not.]

ad regularem vitam: i.e. “(proper) monastic life.”

me dampnandum esse: “I would be damned” (Levitan).

¹*praecipitium*, *it*, n.: “a fall from a great height.”

²*collidō*, *collidere*, *collisī*, *collisum*: “crush.”

³*lateō*, *latēre*, *latuī*: “be hidden”; here “be hidden from (transitive; OLD 8).

64.2 (99.1262) Ipsam etiam abbatiam tyrannus quidam in terra illa potentissimus ita iam diu sibi subiugaverat, ex inordinatione¹ scilicet ipsius monasterii nactus² occasionem, ut omnia loca monasterio adiacentia in usus proprios redeget, ac gravioribus exactionibus³ monachos ipsos quam tributarios Iudeos exagitaret. Vrgebant me monachi pro necessitudinibus cotidianis, cum nichil in commune haberent, quod eis ministrarem, sed unusquisque de propriis olim marsupiis⁴ se et concubinas⁵ suas cum filiis vel filiabus sustentaret. Gaudebant me super hoc anxari, et ipsi quoque furabantur⁶ et asportabant,⁷ que poterant, ut, cum in administratione ista deficerem, compellerer aut a disciplina cessare aut omnino recedere.

tirannus quidam: an unidentified local landowner, not Duke Conan.

ex inordinatione: “on account of the disorder.”

ac gravioribus exactionibus ... Iudeos exagitaret = *ac exagitaret ipsos monachos exactionibus gravioribus quam (exactionibus quibus exagitaret) tributarios Iud(a)eos*. [did Jews pay taxes everywhere in France? how much?]

Vrgebant me monachi pro necessitudinibus cotidianis etc.: “St Gildas, it seems, displayed all the vices of unreformed Benedictinism” (Marenbon 21).

quod eis ministrarem: “which I could dispense to them.”

de propriis olim marsupiis: i.e. from the funds they had before they became monks.

cum filiis vel filiabus: *filia, ae, f.* in CL the dative and ablative plural ending is regularly *-abus*, esp. when contrasted with masc. *filiis*.

65.1 (99.1275) Cum autem tota terre illius barbaries⁸ pariter exlex⁹ et indisciplinata esset, nulli erant hominum ad quorum confugere possem adiutorium, cum a moribus omnium pariter dissiderem. Foris¹⁰ me tyrannus ille et satellites sui assidue opprimebant, intus mihi fratres incessanter insidiabantur, ut illud Apostoli in me specialiter dictum res ipsa indicaret: *Foris pugne. Intus timores*.

ut illud Apostoli ... res ipsa indicaret = *ut res ipsa indicaret illud (verbum) Apostoli (esse) dictum specialiter in me*.

Foris pugne. Intus timores.: II Cor 7:5, “For when we were come into Macedonia, our flesh had no rest, but we were troubled on every side; without were fightings, within were fears.”

65.2 (99.1283) Considerabam et plangebam, quam inutilem et miseram vitam ducerem, et quam infructuose tam mihi quam aliis viverem, et quantum antea clericis profecissem, et quod nunc, eis propter monachos dimissis, nec in ipsis nec in monachis aliquem fructum haberem, et quam inefficax in omnibus inceptis atque conatibus meis redderem,¹¹ ut iam mihi de omnibus illud impropere¹² rectissime deberet: *Hic homo cepit edificare, et non potuit consummare*.

tam mihi quam aliis: “both for me and for others.”

quantum antea clericis profecissem: he was thinking about his earlier success as a teacher, though according to Niermeyer *clericus* means “cleric” or “monk” and not “student.”

eis propter monachos dimissis = *eis (clericis) dimissis, propter monachos*.

de omnibus: CL would be *ab omnibus*.

Hic homo cepit edificare, et non potuit consummare: Luke 14:29-30, “Lest haply, after he hath laid the foundation, and is not able to finish it, all that behold it begin to mock him, (30) Saying, This man began to build, and was not able to finish.”

¹ *inordinātiō, ōnis, f.*: “disorder.”

² *nanciscor, nanciscī, nactus* or *nactus*: “obtain, get.”

³ *exactiō, ōnis, f.*: “calling in (of taxes); tax.”

⁴ *maruppium* or *marsipium, (i)ī, n.*: “pouch, purse.”

⁵ *concubīna, ae, f.*: “concubine.”

⁶ *fūr* (1): “steal.”

⁷ *asportō* (1): “take away, remove.”

⁸ *barbariēs, ēī, f.* (or *barbaria, ae, f.*): “barbarian people.”

⁹ *exlex, exlēgis*: “lawless.”

¹⁰ *foris*: “outside” (adverb).

¹¹ *reddō, reddere, reddidī, redditum*: “give back, restore.”

¹² *improperō* (1): “blame” (+ dative); CL but Petronius.

66.1 (99.1291) Desperabam penitus, cum recordarer que fugerem, et considerarem que incurrerem, et priores molestias quasi iam nullas reputans, crebro¹ apud me ingemiscens, dicebam: “Merito hec patior, qui Paraclitum, id est consolatorem, deserens, in desolationem certam me intrusi, et minas evitare cupiens, ad certa confugi pericula.” Illud autem plurimum me cruciabat, quod, oratorio nostro dimisso, de divini celebratione officii ita, ut oppoteret, providere non poteram, quoniam loci nimia paupertas vix unius hominis neccessitudini sufficeret. Sed ipse quoque verus Paraclitus michi maxime super hoc desolato veram attulit consolationem, et proprio, prout debebat, providit oratorio.

michi maxime super hoc desolato = *mihi maxime desolato super hoc.*

proprio ... providit oratorio = *providit proprio oratorio, prout debebat.* **providit** “provided for” here with a dative (OLD 4b).

AD 1129

67. (100.1304) Accidit namque ut abbas noster, sancti scilicet Dyonisii, predictam illam Argenteoli abbatiam, in qua religionis habitum nostra illa iam in Christo soror potius quam uxor Heloysa susceperat, tanquam ad ius monasterii sui antiquitus pertinentem quocunque modo acquireret, et conventum inde sanctimonialium, ubi illa comes nostra prioratum habebat, violenter expelleret. Que cum diversis locis exules dispergerentur, oblatam mihi a Domino intellexi occasionem, qua nostro consulerem oratorio. Illuc itaque reversus, eam cum quibusdam aliis de eadem congregatione ipsi adherentibus ad predictum oratorium invitavi, eoque, illis adductis, ipsum oratorium, cum omnibus ei pertinentibus, concessi et donavi; ipsamque postmodum donationem nostram, assensu atque interventu episcopi terre, papa Innocentius secundus ipsis et earum sequacibus per privilegium in perpetuum coroboravit.

abbas noster, sancti scilicet Dyonisii: i.e. Abbot Suger of St. Denis. See Clanchy 249.

illam Argenteoli abbatiam: the convent of Argenteuil.

quocunque modo: “somehow or other”; Suger apparently used forged charters (Andrée).

conventum ... sanctimonialium: i.e. the nuns of the convent.

Que ... exules = *qu(a)e ... exules.*

oblatam mihi a Domino intellexi occasionem, qua nostro consulerem oratorio: i.e. he had an excuse for leaving St. Gildas, in that he was needed at the Paraclete (Clanchy 249).

eam = *Helloysam.*

episcopi terre: Hatto of Troyes, mentioned in ch. 54.

papa Innocentius secundus: Innocent II (pope 1130-1143). The charter is extant; it is dated to 28 November 1131. The convent survived to the French Revolution.

ipsis et earum sequacibus: to the nuns at the time, and those who would come afterwards.

¹ *crēbrō*: “often.”

68.1 (100.1321) Quas, ibi quidem primo inopem sustinentes vitam et ad tempus plurimum desolatas, divine misericordie respectus,¹ cui devote serviebant, in brevi consolatus est, et se eis quoque verum exhibuit Paraclitum et circumadiacentes populos misericordes eis atque propitios effecit. Et plus (sciat Deus), ut arbitror, uno anno in terrenis commodis sunt multiplicatae quam ego per centum, si ibi permansissem. Quippe quo feminarum sexus est infirmior, tanto earum inopia miserabilior facile humanos commovet affectus,² et earum virtus tam Deo quam hominibus est gravior.

Quas, ibi: the antecedent of *quas* is *ipsis*, i.e. the nuns; object of *respectus* ... *consolatus est*.

divine misericordie respectus, cui devote serviebant: in CL this should mean “the consideration (shown by the nuns) for divine mercy, which (mercy) they were serving devotedly”; *respectus* in CL usually takes an objective genitive. It could also mean “the consideration shown by divine mercy, which (consideration?) they were serving devotedly.” Levitan has: “the God whom they served with devotion.”

in brevi: “in a short time” (Andrée).

sunt multiplicatae: the subject is the nuns; *multiplico* in CL can mean “increase, multiply” (intransitive + ablative), though I can’t find examples of it used this way of people.

68.2 (101.1331) Tantam autem gratiam in oculis omnium illi sorori nostre, que ceteris preerat, Dominus annuit,³ ut eam episcopi quasi filiam, abbates quasi sororem, laici quasi matrem diligerent, et omnes pariter eius religionem, prudentiam, et in omnibus incomparabilem patientie mansuetudinem, ammirabantur. Que quanto rarius se videri permittebat (ut scilicet clauso cubiculo sacris meditationibus atque orationibus purius⁴ vacaret),⁵ tanto ardentius eius presentiam atque spiritualis colloquii monita hii, qui foris sunt, efflagitabant.

Que quanto rarius se videri permittebat = (et) quanto rarius Heloysa permittebat se videri. (ut scilicet ... purius vacaret): purpose clause.

De infamatione turpitudinis

69.1 (101.1341) Cum autem omnes earum vicini vehementer me culparent, quod earum inopie, minus quam possem et deberem, consularem, et facile id nostra saltem predicatione valerem, cepi sepius ad eas reverti, ut eis quoquomodo subvenirem. In quo nec invidie mihi murmur defuit, et quod me facere sincera karitas compellebat, solita derogantium pravitas impudentissime accusabat, dicens me adhuc quadam carnalis concupiscentiae oblectatione teneri, qua pristina⁶ dilecte⁷ sustinere absentiam vix aut numquam paterer.

inopie ... consularem: *inopi(a)e* is dative with *consulerem*, “I was taking thought for” (OLD *consulō* 6).

id ... valerem: “I would be able to do this”; *valeō*, in the sense of “have the ability to,” can take an internal accusative (OLD 6b).

qua pristina dilecte ... numquam paterer = *qua* (= *oblectatione*) *vix aut numquam paterer sustinere absentiam (eius) pristina dilect(a)e*.

¹ *respectus*, ūs, m.: “consideration, regard (for).”

² *affectus*, ūs, m.: “emotion.”

³ *adnuō* (*annuō*), *adnuere*, *adnuī*, *adnūtum*: “grant, concede” (OLD 4).

⁴ *pūrē*: “uprightly.”

⁵ *vacō* (1): “have time for” (+ dative; OLD 7). The double cc is presumably ML but not in Niermeyer.

⁶ *pristinē*: “formerly.”

⁷ *dīlectus*, a, um: “beloved, dear.”

69.2 (101.1350) Qui frequenter illam beati Iheronimi querimoniam mecum volvens, qua ad Asellam de fictis amicis scribens, ait: “Nichil mihi obicitur,¹ nisi sexus meus, et hoc nunquam obiceretur, nisi cum Iherosolimam Paula profisciscitur.” Et iterum: “Antequam,” inquit, “domum sancte Paule nossem, totius in me urbis studia consonabant: omnium pene iudicio dignus summo sacerdotio decernebar. Sed scio per bonam et malam famam pervenire ad regna celorum.”

qua ad Asellam de fictis amicis scribens: Jerome, *Epistulae* 45.2, 3, and 6.

nisi cum Iherosolimam Paula profisciscitur: Paula (St. Paula) was an aristocratic and wealthy Roman whose friendship with Jerome provoked hostile gospel; she followed him to Palestine and founded a convent in Bethlehem.

omnium pene iudicio = *iudicio p(a)ene omnium*.

Sed scio ... pervenire ad regna celorum = (?) *sed scio (me) pervenire ad regna c(a)elorum per bonam et malam famam*. Or else *pervenire* is impersonal.

70.1 (101.1358) Cum hanc, inquam, in tantum virum detractiois iniuriam ad mentem reducerem, non modicam hinc consolationem carpebam, inquiens: “O si tantam suspitionis causam emuli mei in me reperirent, quanta me detractioe opprimerent! Nunc vero, mihi divina misericordia ab hac suspitione liberato, quomodo, huius perpetrande turpitudinis facultate ablata, suspitio remanet? Que est tam impudens hec criminatio novissima?” Adeo namque res ista omnem huius turpitudinis suspitionem apud omnes removet, ut, quicumque mulieres observare² diligentius student, eis eunuchos adhibeant,³ sicut de Hester et ceteris regis Assueri puellis sacra narrat hystoria. Legimus et potentem illum regine Candacis eunuchum universis eius gazis⁴ preesse; ad quem convertendum et baptizandum Philippus apostolus ab angelo directus est.

Cum hanc, inquam, ... ad mentem reducerem = *cum reducerem ad mentem hanc, inquam, iniuriam detractiois in tantum virum*. **in tantum virum** = *in Iheronimum*.

si tantam suspitionis causam: i.e. if sex were still a reason for being suspicious of Abelard.

mihi ... liberato: dative; indirect object of *suspitio remanet*.

huius perpetrande turpitudinis facultate ablata = *facultate huius turpitudinis perpetrand(a)e ablatā*; ablative absolute.

Que est tam impudens hec criminatio novissima? = *qu(a)e est h(a)ec tam impudens novissima criminatio*.

res ista: i.e. castration.

sicut de Hester ... hystoria: Esther 2.3, “And the let the king [Ahasuerus] appoint officers in all the provinces of his kingdom, that they may gather together all the fair young virgins unto Shushan the palace, to the house of the women, unto the custody of Hege the king’s chamberlain, keeper of the women; and let their things for purification be given.”

Legimus, etc.: Acts 26-40.

70.2 (102.1374) Tales quippe semper apud verecundas et honestas feminas tanto amplius dignitatis et familiaritatis adepti sunt, quanto longius ab hac absistebant suspitione. Ad quam quidem penitus removendam, maximum illum Christianorum philosophum Origenem, cum mulierum quoque sancte doctrine intenderet, sibi ipsi manus intulisse ecclesiastice historie liber sextus continet.

Tales: i.e. eunuchs.

dignitatis et familiaritatis: partitive genitives, with *tanto*.

Ad quam quidem penitus removendam = *ad suspitionem penitus removendam*.

maximum illum ... continet = *liber sextus ecclesiastic(a)e histori(a)e continet illum maximum philosophum Christianorum Origenem intulisse manūs sibi ipsi*. **continet** introduces an indirect statement. Eusebius, *Ecclesiastical History* 6.8 reports that Origen castrated himself because of his interpretation of Matthew 19:12, “For there are some eunuchs, which were so born from their mother’s womb: and there are be eunuchs, which have made themselves eunuchs for the kingdom of heaven’s sake. He that is able to receive it, let him receive it.” The truth of Eusebius’ report has been doubted.

¹ *obicīō, obicere, obiēcī, obiectum*: “cite as grounds for disapproval, throw in one’s teeth” (+ dative).

² *observō* (1): “watch over, guard” (OLD 2c).

³ *adhibeō, adhibēre, adhibuī, adhibitum*: “bring in, call in, have present” (OLD 3).

⁴ *gaza, ae, f.*: “treasure.”

71.1 (102.1381) Putabam tamen, in hoc, mihi magis quam illi divinam misericordiam propitiam¹ fuisse, ut, quod ille minus provide creditur egisse atque inde non modicum crimen incurrisset, id aliena culpa in me ageret, ut ad simile opus me liberum prepararet, ac tanto minore pena quanto brevior ac subita, ut, oppressus sompno,² cum mihi manus inicerent, nichil pene fere sentirem. Sed quod tunc forte minus pertuli ex vulnere, nunc ex detractioe diutius³ plector, et plus ex detrimento fame quam ex corporis crucior diminutione. Sicut enim scriptum est: *Melius est nomen bonum quam divitiae multe.*

Putabam tamen ... propitiam fuisse = *putabam tamen, in hoc, divinam misericordiam fuisse propitiam mihi magis quam illi [= Origini] quod ille minus provide ... crimen incurrisset* = (*illud*) *quod ille [= Origen] creditur egisse minus providē et inde (ille creditur) incurrisset non modicum crimen.*

id aliena culpa in me ageret *id = crimen. aliena culpa* is nominative. [? or (*aliena misericordia*) *ageret id (= crimen) alienā culpā*] **ut ad simile opus me liberum prepararet** = [?] *ut (aliena culpa? divina misericordia?) pr(a)epararet me liberum ad simile opus. liberum* apparently means “free from guilt” (Levitan).

ac tanto minore pena quanto brevior ac subita = *ac p(o)enā tanto minore, quanto brevior ac subitā. pena ... minore ... brevior ac subita* is ablative absolute or ablative of attendant circumstances.

cum mihi manus inicerent: the subject is “the men who castrated me.”

Melius est nomen etc.: Proverbs 22:1, “A good name is rather to be chosen than great riches, and loving favour rather than silver and gold.”

71.2 (102.1391) Et ut beatus meminit Augustinus in sermone quodam de Vita et moribus clericorum: “Qui, fidens conscientie sue, negligit famam suam, crudelis est.” Idem supra: “*Providemus, inquit, bona*, ut ait Apostolus, *non solum coram Deo sed etiam coram hominibus*. Propter nos, conscientia nostra sufficit nobis; propter vos, fama nostra non pollui,⁴ sed pollere⁵ debet in vobis. Due res sunt conscientia et fama. Conscientia tibi, fama proximo tuo.” Quid autem horum invidia ipsi Christo vel eius membris,⁶ tam prophetis scilicet, quam apostolis, seu aliis patribus sanctis, obiceret,⁷ si in eorum temporibus existeret, cum eos, videlicet corpore integros, tam familiari conversatione feminis precipue⁸ viderent sociatos?

in sermone quodam de Vita et moribus clericorum: Augustine, *Sermones* 355.1 (1569A).

Providemus, inquit, bona, etc.: II Cor. 8.21, “Providing for honest things, not only in the sight of the Lord, but also in the sight of men.”

Quid autem ... temporibus existeret = *Quid autem invidia horum obiceret ipsi Christo vel eius membris, tam prophetis scilicet, quam apostolis, seu aliis patribus sanctis, si (? Christus) existeret in temporibus eorum.* i.e. “What would they (my detractors) say if Christ and others were alive in their day?” The singular *existeret* seems odd, but presumably the example of Christ drives out thoughts of his followers, the prophets, etc. [Except that he changes to the plural with *eos ... sociatos*. Andrée and Levitan take the condition a *past* contrary fact condition, despite the imperfect subjunctives; “the imperfect subjunctive can be used in a past contrary to fact condition instead of the pluperfect subject, especially when the action is *repeated*, or when if the condition were true it would still exist: (AG § 517a). But I don’t see what they think the subject of *existeret* can be. If it’s *invidia eorum* then the thought is “what would that envy of theirs say now, if it had existed at the time of Christ and his followers.]

cum eos ... viderent sociatos = *praecipue cum viderent eos (= Christum vel eius membris, etc.) sociatos feminis tam familiari conversatione, videlicet integros corpore.*

¹*propitius, a, um*: “favorably disposed.”

²*somnus, ī, m.*: “sleep.”

³*diū* (comp. *diūtius*): “for a long time, long.”

⁴*polluō, polluere, pollui, pollūtum*: “make foul; pollute.”

⁵*polleō, pollēre*: “be important” or “be predominant.”

⁶*membrum, ī, n.*: “member (of a body of people)” (OLD 4).

⁷*obicō, obicere, obiēcī, obiectum*: “cite as grounds for disapproval, throw in one’s teeth” (+ dative).

⁸*praecipue*: “especially.”

72.1 (103.1404) Vnde et beatus Augustinus in libro de opere monachorum ipsas etiam mulieres domino Ihesu Christo atque apostolis ita inseparabiles comites adhesisse demonstrat, ut et cum eis etiam ad predicationem procederent. “Ad hoc enim,” inquit, “et fideles mulieres habentes terrenam substantiam ibant cum eis, et ministrabant eis de sua substantia, ut nullius indigerent horum, que ad substantiam vite huius pertinent. Quod quisquis non putat ab apostolis fieri, ut cum eis sancte conversationis mulieres circuissent, quocunque euvangelium predicabant, euvangelium audiant, et cognoscant, quemadmodum hoc ipsius Domini exemplo faciebant. In euvangelio enim scriptum est: *Deinceps et ipse iter faciebat per civitates et castella euvangelizans regnum Dei, et duodecim cum illo et mulieres alique, que erant curate a spiritibus immundis et infirmitatibus: Maria, que vocatur Magdalene, et Iohanna, uxor Cuze procuratoris Herodis, et Susanna, et alie multe que ministrabant ei de facultatibus suis.*”

Augustinus in libro de opere monachorum: Augustine, *De opere monachorum* 4-5 (pp. 538-540).

cum eis: i.e. with Jesus and the Apostles. [or do we call them “The Disciples”?]

“Ad hoc: “for this reason.”

Deinceps et ipse etc. Luke 8:1-3, “And it came to pass afterward, that he went throughout every city and village, preaching and shewing the glad tidings of the kingdom of God: and the twelve were with him. (2) And certain women, which had been healed of evil spirits and infirmities, Mary called Magdalene, out of whom went seven devils, (3) And Iohanna the wife of Chuza Herod’s steward, and Susanna, and many others, which ministered unto him of their substance.”

72.2 (103.1423) Et Leo nonus, contra epistolam Parmeniani de Studii monasterio, “Omnino,” inquit, “profitemur non licere episcopo, presbytero, diacono, subdiacono propriam uxorem causa religionis abicere cura sua, ut non ei victum¹ et vestitum largiatur,² sed non ut cum illa carnaliter iaceat. Sic et sanctos apostolos legimus egisse, beato Paulo dicente: *Numquid non habemus potestatem sororem mulierem circumducendi, sicut fratres Domini et Cephas?* Vide, insipiens,³ quia non dixit, ‘Numquid non habemus potestatem sororem mulierem amplectendi,’ sed, ‘circumducendi,’ scilicet ut mercede predicationis sustentarentur ab eis, nec tamen deinceps foret inter eos carnale coniugium.”

Leo nonus: Pope Leo the Ninth (d. 1054.)

contra epistolam Parmeniani de Studii monasterio: the reference in fact is to a letter of Cardinal Humbertus, a legate of Leo the Ninth, in response to a monk named Niceta of the Studius monastery in Constantinople. The letter is quoted in the *Decretum Gratiani*, the famous 12th century codification of Canon Law, where it is attributed to Leo. Levitan, suggests that Abelard mistakenly supplied name Parmenianus because he was thinking of Augustine’s tract *Contra Epistolam Parmeniani*, one of his attacks on the Donatist schismatics. Andrée suggests Abelard found the Humbertus’ letter in the *Panormia* of Ivo of Chartres, II, 1115 (PL 161: 1155A), which contributed to his mistake about the addressee. **abdicere cura sua:** “to reject from his protection.”

Numquid non habemus etc.: I Cor. 9:5, “Have we not power to lead about a sister, a wife, as well as other apostles, and as the brethren of the Lord, and Cephas?”

insipiens: vocative, “you fool.”

ut mercede predicationis sustentarentur = *ut (mulieres) sustentarentur mercede pr(a)edicationis (apostolorum)*. **mercede predicationis:** “by the income from preaching.”

¹*victus, ūs, m.:* “sustenance, food.”

²*largior, largīrī, largītus:* “grant, bestow.”

³*insipiens, insipientis:* “foolish.”

73.1 (104.1435) Ipse certe Phariseus, qui intra se de Domino ait, *Hic, si esset propheta, sciret utique que et qualis esset mulier, que tangit eum, quia peccatrix est*, multo commodiorem, quantum ad humanum iudicium spectat, turpitudinis coniecturam de Domino concipere poterat quam de nobis isti; aut, qui matrem eius iuveni commendatam vel prophetas cum viduis¹ maxime hospitari atque conversari videbant, multo probabiliorum inde suspicionem contrahere.

Hic, si esset propheta, etc.: “Luke 7:39, “Now when the Pharisee which had bidden him saw it, he spake within himself, saying, This man, if he were a prophet, would have known who and what manner of woman this is that toucheth him: for she is a sinner.”
quantum ad humanum iudicium spectat: i.e. to the extent that a human could ever imagine that Jesus had any connection with *turpido*.
quam de nobis isti = *quam isti (poterant concipere coniecturam turpitudinis) de nobis*. **isti** refers to Abelard’s critics.
aut qui matrem eius ... suspicionem contrahere = *aut (illi) qui videbant matrem eius [= Domini] commendatam iuveni, vel (videbant) prophetas maxime hospitari atque conversari cum viduis, (poterant) contrahere inde suspicionem multo probabiliorum*. John 19:27, “Then he saith he to to the disciple, Behold thy mother! And from that hour that disciple took her unto his own home.” III Kings (= I Kings) 17:10 (on Elijah), “So he arose and went to Zarephath. And when he came to the gate of the city, behold, the widow woman was there gathering of sticks: and he called to her, and said, Fetch me, I pray thee, a little water in a vessel, that I may drink.”

73.2 (104.1445) Quid etiam dixissent isti detractatores nostri, si Malchum illum captivum monachum, de quo beatus scribit Iheronimus, eodem contubernio² cum uxore victitantem³ conspicerent? Quanto id crimini conscriberent, quod egregius ille doctor, cum vidisset, maxime commendans ait: “Erat illic senex quidam nomine Malchus eiusdem loci indigena,⁴ anus⁵ quoque in eius contubernio. Studiosi ambo religionis, et sic ecclesie limen terentes,⁶ ut Zachariam et Elysabeth de euvangelio crederes, nisi quod Iohannes in medio non erat.”

Malchum illum captivum monachum: Jerome, *Vita Malchi* 2.1. Malchus’ Saracen captor forced him to marry a fellow slave, but the two lived together as brother and sister.

egregius ille doctor: i.e. Jerome

cum vidisset: as a young man in Syria Jerome had actually met Malchus and his wife.

Zachariam et Elysabeth: the story of the aged and pious parents of John the Baptist is told in Luke 1:5-64.

73.3 (104.1454) Cur denique a detractatione sanctorum patrum se continent, quos frequenter legimus vel etiam vidimus monasteria quoque feminarum constituere atque eis ministrare, exemplo quidem septem diaconorum, quos pro se apostoli mensis et procurationi mulierum prefecerunt? Adeo namque sexus infirmior fortioris indiget auxilio, ut semper virum mulieri quasi capud preesse Apostolus statuatur. In cuius etiam rei signo ipsam semper velatum habere capud precipit.

sanctorum patrum: Fathers of the Church, some of whom founded convents. [which ones? Jerome again?]

se continent: the subject is Abelard’s critics.

exemplo quidem septem diaconorum: Acts 6:1-3, “And in those days, when the number of the disciples was multiplied, there arose a murmuring of the Grecians against the Hebrews, because their widows were neglected in the daily ministration. (2) Then the twelve called the multitude of the disciples unto them, and said, It is not reason that we should leave the word of God, and serve tables. (3) Wherefore, brethren, look ye out among you seven men of honest report, full of the Holy Ghost and wisdom, whom we may appoint over this business.”

quos pro se ... mulierum prefecerunt = quos apostoli pr(a)fecerunt mensis et procurationi mulierum pro se.

Apostolus statuatur: I Cor. 11:3, “But I would have you know, that the head of every man is Christ; and the head of the woman is man; and the head of Christ is God.”

ipsam semper velatum habere capud precipit = (*Apostolus*) pr(a)cepit ipsam [= mulierem] semper habere capud velatum. I Cor. 11:5, “But every woman that prayeth or prophesieth with her head uncovered dishonoureth her head: for that is even all one as if she were shaven.”

¹*vidua*, ae, f.: “widow.”

²*contubernium*, (i)t, n.: “cohabitation.”

³*victitō* (1): “stay alive, subsist.”

⁴*indigena*, ae, f.: “a native.”

⁵*anus*, ūs, f.: “old woman.”

⁶*terō*, *terere*, *trivī*, *trītum*: “wear down.”

74. (105.1464) Vnde non mediocriter miror consuetudines has in monasteriis dudum¹ inolevisse,² quod quemadmodum viris abbates, ita et feminis abbatisse preponantur, et eiusdem regule professione tam femine quam viri se astringant.³ In qua tamen pleraque continentur, que a feminis tam prelatis quam subiectis nullatenus⁴ possunt adimpleri. In plerisque etiam locis, ordine perturbato naturali, ipsas abbatissas atque moniales⁵ clericis quoque ipsis, quibus subest populus, dominari conspiciamus, et tanto facilius eos ad prava desideria inducere posse, quanto eis amplius habent preesse, et iugum⁶ illud in eos gravissimum exercere, quod satiricus ille considerans ait: “Intolerabilius nichil est quam femina dives.”

quod quemadmodum viris ... abbatisse preponantur = *quod quemadmodum abbates (preponantur viris), ita et abbatiss(a)e pr(a)eponantur feminis*. **quod** (here “the fact that”) takes a subjunctive when the explanation is not that of the writer but of someone whose views are reported; see AG § 539.

eiusdem regule professione = *professione eiusdem regul(a)e*, “professing the same (monastic) rule.”

In qua = *in qua regulā*.

tam prelatis quam subiectis: i.e. by abbesses and by nuns alike.

clericis quoque ipsis: i.e. *male* clerics; indirect object of *dominari* (in CL *dominor* does not normally take a dative).

et tanto facilius ... habent preesse = *et (abatissas atque moniales) posse inducere eos [= clericos] ad prava desideria, quanto amplius habent pr(a)esse eis*. **quanto amplius habent preesse eis** means “the more power they have over them” (Andrée), though **habent** seems awkward. Abelard’s point is that abbesses and nuns are more likely to corrupt male clerics when they have power over them. [as role models? because they can abuse their power?]

“Intolerabilius nichil etc. Juvenal 6.460, from his famous diatribe on women. Abelard was “tapping into the anti-feminist rhetoric taught in the schools” (Clanchy 253).

75. (105.1477) Hoc ego sepe apud me pertractando, quantum mihi liceret, sororibus illis providere et earum curam agere disposueram, et, quo me amplius revererentur, corporali quoque presentia eis invigilare, et sic etiam earum magis necessitudinibus subvenire. Et cum me nunc frequentior ac maior persecutio filiorum quam olim fratrum affligeret, ad eas, de estu⁷ huius tempestatis, quasi ad quendam tranquillitatis portum, recurrerem, atque ibi aliquantulum respirarem, et, qui in monachis nullum, aliquem saltem in illis assequeretur fructum; ac tanto id mihi fieret magis saluberrimum, quanto id earum infirmitati magis esset necessarium.

quo me amplius revererentur: purpose clause, with *quō* and a comparative; AG § 531.2a.

frequentior ac maior persecutio filiorum quam olim fratrum: Abelard’s *fili* are the monks subject to him at St. Gildas; his former *fili* were his fellow monks at St. Denis.

ad eas: i.e. to the nuns of the Paraclete. Clanchy 250 notes that the trip from St. Gildas to the Paraclete would have taken about 3-4 weeks, so that Abelard may not have spent much time at St. Gildas.

recurrerem ... respirarem ... assequeretur ... fieret ... esset: the subjunctives are in “virtual indirect discourse” (UK “oblique”), because these were Abelard’s thoughts at the time; AG § 592. [Andrée says *recurrerem ... respirarem* are oblique, but says nothing about *fieret* and *esset*.]

¹ *dūdum*: “for a long time” (and up to the present, OLD 2).

² *inolescō, inolescere, inolēvī*: “develop, grow.”

³ *astringō, astringere, astrinxī, astrinctum*: “tie, bind.”

⁴ *nullātenus*: “by no means” (LL).

⁵ *monialis*, f.: “nun” (LL; Niermeyer doesn’t give quantities).

⁶ *iugum, ī, n.*: “yoke.”

⁷ *aestus, ūs, m.* “heat”; “anxiety” (OLD 9b).

c. AD 1133

76.1 (105.1489) Nunc autem ita me Sathanas¹ impedivit, ut ubi quiescere possim aut etiam vivere non inveniam, sed vagus et profugus, ad instar² maledicti Caym ubique circumferar; quem, ut supra memini, *foris pugne, intus timores* incessanter cruciant, immo tam foris quam intus pugne pariter et timores. Et multo periculosior et crebrior persecutio filiorum adversum me sevit quam hostium. Istos quippe semper presentes habeo, et eorum insidias³ iugiter⁴ sustineo. Hostium violentiam in corporis mei periculum video, si a claustro procedam.

ubi quiescere ... non inveniam = *non inveniam ubi possim quiescere aut etiam vivere.*

instar maledicti Caym: “like accursed Cain”; Genesis 4:14. *Caym* is genitive; Hebrew names in the Bible are typically undeclinable. [The Vulgate spells the brother of Able “Cain”; I don’t know why Abelard changed it.]

foris pugne, intus timores: II Cor. 7:5, “For when we were come to Macedonia, our flesh had no rest, but we were troubled on every side; without were fightings, within were fears.”

76.2 (106.1498) In claustro autem filiorum, id est monachorum, mihi tanquam abbati, hoc est patri, commissorum, tam violenta⁵ quam dolosa⁶ incessanter sustineo machinamenta. O quotiens veneno⁷ me perdere temptaverunt, sicut et in beato factum est Benedicto, ac si hec ipsa causa, qua ille perversos deseruit filios, ad hoc ipsum me patenter tanti patris adhortaretur exemplo, ne, me certo videlicet opponens periculo, temerarius Dei temptator potius quam amator, immo mei ipsius peremptor invenirem.

filiorum, id est monachorum ... commissorum = *filiorum, id est monachorum, commissorum mihi tanquam abbati, hoc est (tanquam) patri.*

O quotiens veneno me perdere temptaverunt: Some scholars believe that Abelard was literally delusional in imagining attempts on his life; others believe that they were entirely real (Clanchy 248-9).

sicut et in beato factum est Benedicto: the monks of Vicovaro tried to poison Benedict, when he left his hermitage at Subiaco to become their abbot. Gregory the Great, *Dialogi* 2.3 (p. 81).

ac si hec ipsa causa ... adhoretur exemplo = *ac si h(a)ec ipsa causa, qua ille [= Benedictus] deseruit perversos filios, adhortaretur me ad hoc ipsum [= ad perversos filios deserendos] exemplo tanti patris.* [The apodosis seems to be missing; we have to understand something like “I would do what Benedict’s example suggested, and leave.]

ne me certo ... peremptor invenirem: “lest by exposing myself to certain danger I would seem a rash tempter rather than a true lover of God, or even the author of my own destruction” (Andrée).

¹*Sathanas, aē, m.*: “Satan” (LL).

²*instar, n.* (only in nom. or acc.): “counterpart, equal.”

³*insidiae, ārum, f.pl.*: “ambush, trap”; “treacherous attack.”

⁴*iūgiter*: “constantly.”

⁵*violens, violentis*: “violent.”

⁶*dolōsus, a, um*: “deceitful.”

⁷*venēnum, ī, n.*: “poison.”

77.1 (106.1507) A talibus autem cotidianis eorum insidiis, cum mihi in administratione cibi vel potus, quantum possem, providerem, in ipso altaris sacrificio toxicare¹ me moliti sunt, veneno scilicet calici² immisso. Qui etiam quadam die, cum Namneti ad comitem in egritudine sua visitandum venissem, hospitatum me ibi, in domo cuiusdam fratris mei carnalis, per ipsum qui in comitatu³ nostro erat famulum⁴ veneno interficere machinati sunt, ubi videlicet me minus a tali machinatione providere crediderunt. Divina autem dispositione tunc actum est, ut, dum cibum mihi apparatus non curarem, frater quidam ex monachis, quem mecum adduxeram, hoc cibo per ignorantiam usus, ibidem mortuus occumberet,⁵ et famulus ille, qui hoc presumpserat, tam conscientie sue quam testimonio ipsius rei perterritus, aufugeret.

Namneti ad comitem: “at Nantes.” [Does ML use the locative for motion towards?] The count was Conan III, see ch. 63 above.
in domo cuiusdam fratris mei carnalis: this brother was possibly Porcarius, who as a canon in the cathedral at Nantes.

qui hoc presumpserat: “who had dared this deed.”

77.2 (106.1523) Ex tunc itaque manifesta omnibus eorum nequitia, patenter iam cepi eorum, prout poteram, insidias declinare, et iam a conventu abbatis me subtrahere et in cellulis cum paucis habitare. Qui, si me transiturum aliquo presensissent, corruptos per pecuniam latrones in viis aut semitis,⁶ ut me interficerent, opponebant. Dum autem in istis laborarem periculis, forte me die quadam de nostra lapsum equitatura⁷ manus Domini vehementer collisit, colli⁸ videlicet mei canalem⁹ confringens. Et multo me amplius hec fractura afflixit et debilitavit quam prior plaga.

et in cellulis cum paucis habitare: these may have been beehive huts from the original Celtic foundation; see Clanchy 250.

Qui, si me transiturum aliquo presensissent: the antecedent of *qui* is “the monks of the *conventus abbati(a)e*, not the few monks Abelard was living with.

manus Domini = Dominus.

quam prior plaga: [i.e. getting castrated?]

78.1 (107.1534) Quandoque¹⁰ horum indomitam rebellionem per excommunicationem coercens, quosdam eorum, quos magis formidabam, ad hoc compuli, ut fide sua seu sacramento publice mihi promitterent se ulterius ab abbatis penitus recessuros, nec me amplius in aliquo inquietaturos. Qui, publice et impudentissime tam fidem datam quam sacramenta facta violantes, tandem per auctoritatem Romani pontificis Innocentii, legato proprio ad hoc destinato, in presentia comitis et episcoporum, hoc ipsum iurare compulsi sunt, et pleraque alia. Nec sic adhuc quieverunt. Nuper autem cum, illis quos predixi eiectis, ad conventum abbatis redisse, et reliquis fratribus, quos minus suspicabar, me committerem, multo hos peiores quam illos reperi. Quos iam quidem non de veneno, sed de gladio in iugulum meum tractantes, cuiusdam proceris¹¹ terre conductu,¹² vix evasi.

legato: Geoffrey of Lèves, bishop of Chartres. See ch. 41.

cum, illis ... me committerem = cum, illis quos predixi eiectis, committerem me ad conventum abbatis redisse, et (committerem) reliquis fratribus, quos minus suspicabar.

¹*toxicō* (1): “smear with poison” (LL and rare); “poison” (ML).

²*calix, calicis*, m.: “drinking-cup”; “chalice.”

³*comitatus, ūs*, m.: “retinue.”

⁴*famulus, ī*, m.: “servant.”

⁵*occumbō, occumbere, occubui*: “be laid low, meet with death.”

⁶*sēmita, ae*, f.: “alley, side-track.”

⁷*equitātūra, ae*, f.: “mount” (ML).

⁸*collum, ī*, n.: “neck.”

⁹*canālis, is, m./f.*: “channel”; “wind-pipe” (OLD 6a).

¹⁰*quandoque*: “at some time or other.”

¹¹*procer, eris*, m.: “leader, leading man” (singular in CL only once).

¹²*conductus, ūs*, m.: “escort (of armed men)” (ML).

78.2 (107.1549) In quo adhuc etiam laboro periculo, et cotidie quasi cervici mee gladium imminens suspitio,¹ ut inter epulas² vix respirem, sicut de illo legitur, qui, cum Dyonisii tyranni potentiam atque opes conquisitas³ maxime imputaret beatitudini, filo⁴ latenter apensum⁵ super se gladium suspiciens, que terrenam potentiam felicitas consequatur edoctus est. Quod nunc quoque ipse, de paupere monacho in abbatem promotus, incessanter experior, tanto scilicet miserior quanto ditior effectus, ut, nostro etiam exemplo, eorum qui id sponte appetunt ambitio refrenetur.

In quo adhuc etiam laboro periculo = *in quo periculo adhuc etiam laboro*. The present tense indicates that Abelard is writing while still at St. Gildas.

qui, cum Dyonisii tyranni potentiam etc. i.e. Damocles. The story is told in Cicero, *Tusculan Disputations* 5.62 (and elsewhere). Dionysius (d. 343 BCE) was tyrant of Syracuse.

que terrenam potentiam felicitas consequatur edoctus est = *(qui) edoctus est qu(a)e felicitas consequatur terrenam potentiam*. **consequatur** is subjunctive in an indirect question.

eorum qui id sponte appetunt ambitio refrenetur = *ambitio eorum qui sponte id appetunt refrenetur*. “Abelard is clearly making a contrast between himself and those who, unlike him, actually desire such things as abbacies” (Marenbon 21n50).

79.1 (107.1560) Hec, dilectissime frater in Christo, et ex diutina⁶ conversatione familiarissime comes, de calamitatum mearum hystoria, in quibus quasi a cunabulis⁷ iugiter laboro, tue me desolationi atque iniurie illate⁸ scripsisse sufficiat, ut, sicut in exordio prefatus sum epistole, oppressionem tuam in comparatione mearum aut nullam aut modicam esse iudices, et tanto eam patientius feras quanto minorem consideras, illud semper in consolationem assumens, quod membris⁹ suis de membris diaboli Dominus predixit: *Si me persecuti sunt, et vos persequentur. Si mundus vos odit, scitote quoniam me priorem vobis odio habuit. Si de mundo fuissetis, mundus, quod suum erat, diligeret. Omnes inquit Apostolus qui volunt pie vivere in Christo, persecutionem patientur*. Et alibi: *Aut quero hominibus placere? Si adhuc hominibus placerem, Christi servus non essem*. Et Psalmista: *Confusi sunt inquit qui hominibus placent, quoniam Deus sprevit eos*.

et ex diutina conversatione familiarissime comes: “and my closest companion in a long-standing relationship.”

tue me desolationi ... scripsisse sufficiat = *(haec historia) sufficiat tu(a)e desolationi atque iniuri(a)e illat(a)e me scripsisse*.

oppressionem tuam ... esse iudices = *(ut) iudices oppressionem tuam aut nullam aut modicam esse in comparatione mearum (oppressionum)*.

Si me persecuti sunt etc.: John 15:20, “Remember the word that I said unto you, The servant is not greater than his lord. If they have persecuted me, they will also persecute you; if they have kept my saying, they will keep yours also.” John 15:18-19, “If the world hate you, ye know that it hated me before it hated you. (19) If ye were of the world, the world would love his own: but because ye are not of the world, but I have chosen you out of the world, therefore the world hated you.” Abelard “had no hesitation in comparing himself with Christ.”

Omnes inquit Apostolus, qui etc.: II Timothy 3:12, “Yea, and all that will live godly in Christ Jesus shall suffer persecution.”

Et alibi: Aut quero etc.: Galatians 1:10, “For do I now persuade men, or God? or do I seek to please men? for if I yet pleased men, I should not be the servant of Christ.”

Et Psalmista: Confusi sunt etc.: Psalm 52:6 (53:5) “There were they in great fear, where no fear was: for God hath scattered the bones of him that encampeth against thee: thou hast put them to shame, because God hath despised them.” *Deum non invocaverunt; illic trepidaverunt timore, ubi non erat timor. Quoniam Deus dissipavit ossa eorum qui hominibus placent: confusi sunt, quoniam Deus sprevit eos*.

¹ *suspiciō, suspicere, suspexī, suspectum*: “look upwards at”; “suspect” (rare in CL).

² *epulae, ārum, f.pl.*: “feast, banquet.”

³ *conquisitus, a, um*: “select, choice.”

⁴ *filum, ī, n.*: “thread.”

⁵ *appendō, appendere, appendī, appensum*: “hang, cause to be suspended.”

⁶ *diūtinus, a, um*: “long-lasting.”

⁷ *cunabula, ae, f.*: “cradle.”

⁸ *inferō, inferre, intulī, illātum*: “impose” (OLD 9a).

⁹ *membrum, ī, n.*: “member (of a body of people)” (OLD 4).

79.2 (108.1577) Que diligenter beatus attendens Iheronimus, cuius me precipue in contumeliis¹ detractio² heredem conspicio, ad Nepotianum scribens ait: “*Si adhuc*,” inquit Apostolus, “*hominibus placerem, Christi servus non essem*. Desinit placere hominibus, et servus factus est Christi.” Idem ad Asellam de fictis amicis: “Gratias ago Deo meo, quod dignus sim quem mundus oderit.” Et ad Heliodorum monachum: “Erras, frater, erras si putas umquam Christianum persecutionem non pati. *Adversarius noster tanquam leo rugiens devorare querens circuit*, et tu pacem putas? *Sedet in insidiis, cum divitibus*, et cetera.”

cuius me precipue ... heredem conspicio = *cuius heredem conspicio me pr(a)cipue (esse) in contumeliis detractio*.

ad Nepotianum scribens: Jerome, *Epistolae* 52.13.

“Si adhuc,” inquit Apostolus etc.: Galatians 1:10, as in the previous paragraph.

Desinit: the subject is *Apostolus*.

Idem ad Asellam de fictis amicis: Jerome, *Epistolae* 45.6.

Et ad Heliodorum monachum: Jerome, *Epistolae* 14.4.

Adversarius noster etc.: I Peter 5:8, “Be sober, be vigilant; because your adversary the devil, as a roaring lion, walketh about, seeking whom he may devour.” *sobrii estote vigilate quia adversarius vester diabolus tanquam leo rugiens circuit quaerens quem devoret*.

Sedet in insidiis, cum divitibus: Psalm 9:29, *sedet in insidiis cum divitibus in occultis ut interficiat innocentem*. [KJV 10.8 has “He sitteth in the lurking places of the villages: in the secret places doth he murder the innocent: his eyes are privily set against the poor.”]

80.1 (108.1589) His itaque documentis atque exemplis animati, tanto securius ista toleremus, quanto iniuriosius accidunt. Que si non ad meritum nobis, saltem ad purgationem³ aliquam proficere non dubitemus, et quoniam omnia divina dispositione geruntur, in hoc se saltem quisque fidelium in omni pressura consoletur, quod nichil inordinate fieri umquam summa Dei bonitas permittit, et quod, quaecumque perverse fiunt, optimo fine ipse terminat. Vnde et ei de omnibus recte dicitur: *Fiat voluntas tua*. Quanta denique diligentium Deum illa est ex auctoritate apostolica consolatio, qua dicit: *Scimus, quoniam diligentibus Deum omnia cooperantur in bonum*, et cetera.

toleremus: optative subjunctive: “we should bear.” The imperfect subjunctive represents an action unaccomplished in present time (AG § 441).

Fiat voluntas tua: Matthew 6:10, “Thy kingdom come, thy will be done in earth, as it is in heaven.” 26:42, “He went away again the second time, and prayed, saying, O my Father, if this cup may not pass away from me, except I drink it, thy will be done.”

Scimus, quoniam etc.: Romans 8:28, “And we know that all things work together for good to them that love God, to them who are called according to his purpose.”

¹*contumēlia*, ae, f.: “insult.”

²*dētracatiō*, ōnis, f.: “withdrawal” (CL); “slander” (ML).

³*purgātiō*, ōnis, f.: “cleansing, purification.”

80.2 (109.1601) Quod diligenter ille sapientium sapientissimus attendebat, cum in Proverbiis diceret: *Non contristabit iustum, quicquid ei acciderit*. Ex quo manifeste a iusticia eos recedere demonstrat, quicumque pro aliquo sui gravamine his irascuntur, que erga se divina dispensatione geri non dubitant, et se proprie voluntati magis quam divine subiciunt, et ei, quod in verbis sonat, *fiat voluntas tua*, desideriis occultis repugnant, divine voluntati propriam antepponentes. Vale.

ille sapientium sapientissimus: i.e. Solomon.

Non contristabit iustum, quicquid ei acciderit: Proverbs 12:21, “There shall no evil happen to the just: but the wicked shall be filled with mischief.

Ex quo manifeste ... divine subiciunt = *Ex quo (ille sapientium sapientissimus) demonstrat eos manifeste recedere a iusticia, quicumque pro aliquo sui gravamine irascuntur his, qu(a)e non dubitant geri divinā dispensatione erga se, et (quicumque) subiciunt se propri(a)e voluntati magis quam divin(a)e voluntati.*

et ei ... propriam antepponentes = *et ei repugnant quod in verbis sonat, fiat voluntas tua, desideriis occultis, antepponentes propriam (voluntatem) divin(a)e voluntati.* I have place a semicolon before *et ei*, because this clause seems not to be part of the discussion of what Solomon said; Abelard reverts to his own voice to comment on people who complain about the divine will. **quod in verbis sonat**: direct object of *repugnant*; perhaps “that which resound in the words [of Jesus?].” *fiat voluntas tua* is in apposition to *quod in verbis sonat*.